

CM13.3. Keene Street Reconstruction Contract No. 21/00934

DATE	22 March 2021	FIL REFERENCE	FIL21/00934-02
CONFIDENTIAL	No		
FURTHER ENQUIRIES	Andrew Lawson City Projects	PHONE	02 6023 8111
AUTHOR	Alan Rodgers		

Purpose of Report

To recommend a preferred contractor for the reconstruction of Keene Street, from North Street to Alexandra Street, through a qualitative and quantitative assessment.

Background

AlburyCity is committed to maintaining its infrastructure and providing the community with improved roads and parking across the AlburyCity area.

Keene Street is located in North Albury, between East Street and Borella Road, providing a major road link from the Hume Freeway via Borella Road to the Light Industrial zone of North Street, as well as providing access to residential properties, and the recreation and sporting facilities of Lauren Jackson Sports Centre and Alexandra Park.

The road pavement, centre medians, and adjacent footpath of Keene Street are currently in poor condition and at the end of their service life; they require replacement and upgrading to current standards to provide safe access for the community.

Existing parking facilities are fragmented and not linked. Upgrading of existing paths and provision of a new path network with additional Keene Street crossing points will assist in providing additional parking opportunities for sporting facilities.

Stage 1 of these upgrade works will commence from North Street to Alexandra Street, with further upgrade works planned to continue south to Borella Road.

The scope of the works included in this contract are summarised below:

- 400m of road reconstruction including new kerb, pavement and asphalt surface;
- reconstructed centre medians with landscaping works and installation of shade trees;
- turn lanes at intersections for improved safety;
- installation of a 2-metre-wide footpath fronting Alexandra Park on the west side of the road;
- replacement of existing footpath and driveways on the east side of the road;
- formalised pedestrian crossing points of Keene Street for improved safety;
- additional drainage infrastructure and associated works; and

- associated line marking and signage, which will include designated bike lanes in both directions.

Tenders were invited for Contract No. 21/00934 – Keene Street Reconstruction, and advertised in The Border Mail, Sydney Morning Herald and on Tenderlink. Tenders closed at 12 noon on Tuesday, 23 February 2021.

The contract duration is estimated at 16 weeks and will be completed in the 2021/22 financial year.

Council's budget allocation for the project is \$1.8M (including GST).

A location plan is included with this report as attachment 1.

Tender Assessment

At the close of tenders, submissions were received from the following companies:

- Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd, (Wodonga VIC);
- Downer EDI Works Pty Ltd, (Rosehill NSW);
- Stateline Asphalt Pty Ltd, (Rockdale NSW);
- AP Delaney Pty Ltd, (Albury NSW);
- Longford Civil Pty Ltd, (Howlong NSW); and
- Hurst Earthmoving Pty Ltd, (Albury NSW).

All tenders were evaluated in accordance with Council's Procurement Policy and Guidelines and in consultation with the Procurement Services Team Leader – Elisha Lieschke. The Assessment Panel for the tender comprised Project Delivery Team Leader - Anthony Bisignano, Senior Designer – Alan Rodgers and Project Delivery Officer – Kyal Sharpe.

Conformity Check

A Conformity Assessment was undertaken to ensure all submissions received were in accordance with the contract documentation and specification.

Company	Pricing Details	Supporting Information	WHS Documentation	Comment
Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd	✓	✓	✓	conforming
Downer EDI Works Pty Ltd	✓	✓	✓	conforming
Stateline Asphalt Pty Ltd	✓	✓	✓	conforming
AP Delaney Pty Ltd	✓	✓	✓	conforming
Longford Civil Pty Ltd	✓	✓	✓	conforming
Hurst Earthmoving Pty Ltd	✓	✓	✓	conforming

As indicated above, all submissions were assessed as conforming tenders, and all companies are WHS registered with Council, or have provided sufficient documentation to display their ability to become WHS registered with Council.

Qualitative Assessment

A qualitative assessment considered a range of issues including:

- past performance – including referee checks, relevant experience, and expertise in performing same or similar projects;
- methodology and program – project methodology and proposed program;
- capacity – current and future commitments and workload;
- capability – including availability of resources, equipment, and contract management capabilities; and
- benefit to local region – social and community benefit to the Albury/Wodonga region.

Company	Past Performance (35%)	Methodology & Program (25%)	Capacity (20%)	Capability (10%)	Local Benefit (10%)	Total (100%)
Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd	28	25	16	10	9	88
Downer EDI Works Pty Ltd	33	22	19	8	6	88
Stateline Asphalt Pty Ltd	35	18	16	8	4	81
AP Delaney Pty Ltd	33	11	12	9	9	74
Longford Civil Pty Ltd	26	13	16	8	8	71
Hurst Earthmoving Pty Ltd	21	15	13	6	8	63

Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd is a locally based company and they have undertaken a number of similar road projects throughout Albury, Wodonga, and the local region. As a company, they specialise in road reconstruction and streetscape works.

Their current work commitments include Kerr Road Stage 6 for AlburyCity (expected to be completed in May 2021), Elizabeth Mitchell Drive Thurgoona Drive Intersection for AlburyCity (expected to be completed in April 2021), Alpine Views Estate Wodonga (expected to be completed in May 2021), and Park Lane Estate Benalla (expected to be completed in May 2021).

Referee information indicated that Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd typically managed their time to a high standard in a highly sensitive worksite and provided appropriate resource levels to undertake the project at hand. They provide a high level of co-operation and responsiveness to achieve set outcomes and respond in a timely manner to public concerns. They also manage environmental and safety matters very well on site. Projects are typically completed on time and budget.

Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd is currently undertaking work for AlburyCity, including Kerr Road Stage 6 and the Thurgoona Drive Elizabeth Mitchell Drive intersection. Previous work they have completed includes Wagga Road reconstruction stages 1 and 2, which was completed to a high standard and with good customer service.

The proposed work methodology and program indicate a 12-week construction program, with a well thought out and concise description covering all required areas including work zones, property access and traffic management. Their methodology caters for closing sections of Keene Street as required and maintaining the bus route through the worksite with access maintained to residential properties. The level of traffic control allowed to complete the project is considered appropriate and reflective of methodology and program provided. The company has also provided Quality, WHS and Environmental policies as part of their submission.

All staff and subcontractors employed are locally based, with 100% of materials being sourced locally. The company has also listed a number of local community groups, sporting groups and fundraising events which they sponsor.

Downer EDI Works Pty Ltd is a Sydney company based in Rosehill, New South Wales, and they have undertaken a number of similar road construction projects throughout New South Wales.

Their current work commitments listed include Ferrers Road, Eastern Creek (expected to be completed in March 2021) and stabilisation works for Hilltops Shire Council (expected to be completed in May 2021).

Referee reports indicate Downer EDI Works Pty Ltd are typically co-operative and flexible to work with, suitably resourcing their projects, and their work site safety, documentation, management of subcontractors and environmental management is to a good standard.

Downer EDI Works Pty Ltd has previously undertaken work for AlburyCity, successfully completing the Albury Airport Runway overlay project in 2014.

The proposed works program indicates a 21-week construction period which could be considered long when compared to the estimated completion duration. The supplied methodology was extensive, addressing zoning of work sites, traffic management in stages, maintaining the bus route and access to properties. The company provided Quality Management Plan, WHS Plan and proposed Environmental Management Plan as part of the submission.

Downer EDI Works Pty Ltd does not have an office in Albury Wodonga. However, its Asphalt Plant is located in Wodonga. All subcontractors and materials will be sourced locally with management from outside the region. Downer EDI Works Pty Ltd has a policy for the employment of the Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander community. The company did not provide a list of any sponsorship to local organisations.

Stateline Asphalt Pty Ltd is a Sydney company based in Rockdale, New South Wales. They have listed extensive experience in road construction and reconstruction within the Sydney area.

Their current work commitments listed include Miller Street, North Sydney (expected to be completed in March 2021), Rawson Street roundabout, Bankstown (expected to be completed in March 2021), and Cowels Road Roundabout, Mosman (expected to be completed in March 2021).

Referee information indicated that Stateline Asphalt Pty Ltd typically managed their time well in a challenging worksite, were suitably resourced with experienced staff, and they ensured that the required quality of finish was achieved. Referees also noted the contractor was always courteous and accommodating in delivery of the project.

Stateline Asphalt Pty Ltd has not previously undertaken work for AlburyCity.

The proposed works program indicates a 23-week construction period which could be considered long when compared to the estimated completion duration. The supplied methodology document was extensive, demonstrating they have a sound understanding of the key elements of the project. They have indicated proposed road closures and detours for traffic management for the duration of works and the submitted price in the schedule reflects this. A company Safety Management Plan was provided as part of the submission.

Stateline Asphalt Pty Ltd does not have an office in Albury Wodonga. They indicated that 50% of subcontractors and 80% of materials will be sourced locally, with management from outside the region. Stateline Asphalt Pty Ltd indicated that they sponsor community organisations but did not list any.

AP Delaney Pty Ltd is a locally based company from Albury, and they have undertaken a number of similar projects throughout Albury, Wodonga, and the local region over many years.

Their current work commitments listed include Woolshed Estate stages 4 and 5 (expected to be completed in July 2021), Brooklyn Fields stage 3 (expected to be completed in June 2021), Nexus recycling facility (expected to be completed in June 2021) and Lot 1 Anzac Parade, Wodonga (expected to be completed in May 2021).

Referee reports indicate AP Delaney Pty Ltd typically met all milestones and completed projects ahead of schedule. Staff are well trained, approachable, and co-operative and subcontractors managed adequately. Worksite safety was well managed at all times, and a high quality of finish was achieved.

AP Delaney Pty Ltd has previously undertaken work for AlburyCity, recently completing the Albury Monument redevelopment and Glenmorus Gardens Roadway in 2020. These works were completed to a good standard and on time.

The proposed works program indicates a 10-week construction period which would seem relatively optimistic. The supplied methodology is basic in its descriptions whilst covering the major items; they have indicated they intend to work in sections to minimise exposure. Their intended traffic control method is for closure of the majority of the road for the duration of the works whilst providing access for the bus route and residential properties. A company Environmental Management Plan was provided as part of the submission.

All staff and subcontractors employed are locally based, with 100% of materials for this project to be sourced locally from their own quarry. The company provides sponsorship to an extensive number of sporting and community groups and fundraising events.

Longford Civil Pty Ltd is a locally based company from Howlong, and they have undertaken a number of projects throughout Albury, Wodonga and the local region.

Their current work commitments include 4 Mile Road Subdivision Benalla – 26 lots (expected to be completed in April 2021), Howlong - Kywong Road reconstruction for Greater Hume Shire (expected to be completed in March 2021), and the Noreuil Park Pump Station for AlburyCity (expected to be completed in March 2021).

Referee information indicated that Longford Civil Pty Ltd typically managed their time, subcontractors and resources well and are co-operative to work with. They also advised that projects were completed on time and to an adequate standard.

Longford Civil Pty Ltd has previously undertaken work for AlburyCity completing the Nexus Sewer Augmentation in 2020, Kerr Road Watermain in 2019 and Table Top Road Watermain in 2018; works were completed on time and to an adequate standard. Longford Civil Pty Ltd have not previously undertaken a road construction project for AlburyCity.

The proposed works program indicates a 15-week construction period which is reasonable for a road reconstruction project of this scale. The supplied methodology, whilst basic; addresses sediment control, order of works and stockpiling of materials. They have indicated they intend to close the road for the majority of works and divert traffic, whilst accommodating local traffic access and the bus route. The amount submitted in the schedule for Traffic Control could be considered insufficient for works of this scale and duration. The company provided a WHS plan as part of the submission.

All staff and subcontractors employed are locally based, with 100% of materials to be sourced locally. The company provides sponsorship to a local sporting group and fundraising event.

Hurst Earthmoving Pty Ltd is a locally based company from Albury and has undertaken a number of projects throughout Albury, Wodonga, and the local region.

Their only current work commitment listed is Nexus Sewer Works for AlburyCity (expected to be completed by March 2021).

Referee reports indicate Hurst Earthmoving Pty Ltd typically managed resourcing and subcontractors to a good standard. They demonstrated good worksite safety, and referees noted the final product was excellent.

Hurst Earthmoving Pty Ltd has previously undertaken work for AlburyCity, recently completing the Centaur Road Car Park (Lavington Sports Ground) and the Table Top Road Watermain Augmentation.

The proposed works program indicates a 14-week construction period which is typical for a road reconstruction of this scale. The supplied methodology, whilst basic, addresses required items such as staging, stockpiling and work zones. Hurst Earthmoving Pty Ltd has considered management of traffic with staged closures and detours and has allowed for sufficient resourcing of this. The

company provided a copy of their Environmental Management Procedures and Management System documentation as part of the submission.

All staff and subcontractors employed are locally based, with 100% of materials also being sourced locally. The company also provides sponsorship to a number of local sporting groups.

From the information provided, all companies demonstrate the required management systems, experience, construction plant, resources, and availability to provide AlburyCity with a quality product.

Quantitative Assessment (100%)

The lump sum tender prices and ratings relative to the lowest price are tabulated below.

Company	Estimated Contract Value (including GST) for 3 Year Term	Rating (100)
Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd	\$1,325,846.39	100
Longford Civil Pty Ltd	\$1,341,902.21	99
Hurst Earthmoving Pty Ltd	\$1,524,650.68	87
AP Delaney Pty Ltd	\$1,651,650.00	80
Downer EDI Works Pty Ltd	\$2,104,242.54	63
Stateline Asphalt Pty Ltd	\$2,191,443.49	61

The budget allocation for the project is \$1.8M (including GST), with four submissions being within the allocated budget.

As detailed above, the submission from Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd was the most favourable from a cost perspective, being \$16K (1%) more favourable than Longford Civil Pty Ltd, \$199K (15%) more favourable than Hurst Earthmoving Pty Ltd, and between \$325K (25%) and \$865K (65%) more favourable than the other submissions.

Risk

- **Business Risk** – Financial risks are possible if latent/unknown construction issues are encountered. Location of existing services, as well as environmental investigations have been undertaken to reduce this risk.
- **Corporate Risk** – This project is located on a high use road within East Albury and as such, will be visible to the community. The completion of this project will provide safe travel for vehicles accessing the industrial area, and pedestrians using the sporting facilities. Residents of Keene Street and surrounds will be provided with a safer road and improved amenity, and this is part of Council's ongoing commitment to efficiently and effectively managing community assets. The risk area is considered low.
- **WHS and Public Risk** – WHS risks due to the construction works will be controlled in accordance with AlburyCity procedures. The contractor will be WHS registered with AlburyCity and will be required to implement relevant Safe Work Method Statements and undergo safety

inspections. The contractor will implement Traffic Control management plans to provide a safe environment for the worksite and the community.

- **Environmental Risk** – A REF (Review of Environmental Factors) has been undertaken for these works to identify any risks and suitable measures to mitigate them; the risks identified were considered low. Sediment and Erosion control practices will be implemented to reduce these risks.
- **Delivery Program Risk** – Standard risks associated with construction are possible, including delays due to inclement weather and changes due to latent/unknown construction issues. However, the work site is a constructed environment with existing drainage and pavement providing good access, hardstands, and drainage of the site, minimizing down time. Site investigations have been undertaken during the design and planning phase, with results indicating the risk to delivery is low.

Community Engagement

This project is within a major transport and recreation corridor of the city linking North Albury Industrial precinct with the Hume Freeway and providing access to Lauren Jackson Sports Centre and Alexandra Park Sporting Fields. The project is consistent with various themes within the Community Strategic Plan - Albury 2030, all of which have undergone extensive community consultation prior to adoption. The project was subsequently included in the 2020/21 Delivery Program, which was endorsed by Council following extensive community consultation.

The project is listed on Council's website (Major Projects & Works Section) and formal notification to residents of Keene Street and user groups of Alexandra Park will be provided once the tender has been awarded. Council's Projects staff will continue to work with the contractor to maintain access and advise residents and user groups as the project progresses.

Summary

The scoring for the qualitative and quantitative assessment is summarised in the following table:

Company	Quantitative	Qualitative
Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd	100	88
Longford Civil Pty Ltd	99	71
Hurst Earthmoving Pty Ltd	87	63
AP Delaney Pty Ltd	80	74
Downer EDI Works Pty Ltd	63	88
Stateline Asphalt Pty Ltd	61	79

From the qualitative assessment, all companies have the required management systems, experience, resources, and availability to successfully undertake this project.

From a quantitative perspective, the submission from Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd was assessed as being the most advantageous. The submission was between \$16K (1%) and \$865K (65%) more favourable than the other submissions.

Therefore, based on the qualitative and quantitative assessments, it is deemed that the submission from Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd provides the best value for Council to deliver this project.

Conclusion

Council invited tenders for Keene Street Reconstruction and received six submissions.

Keene Street, between North Street and Borella Road, is in poor condition and requires renewal and upgrade. Stage 1 is the section from North Street to Alexandra Street adjacent to Alexandra Park and the Lauren Jackson Sports Centre.

The scope of works in this contract is 400 lineal metres of existing roadway removal and replacement, including all pavement, kerb, footpath, and driveways. A new shared path is to be installed along the western side of the road, along with landscaped median islands in the centre of the pavement. Installation of turn lanes and pedestrian crossing points will improve safety.

A quantitative and qualitative assessment indicated that Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd was the most favourable submission. Their tendered price of \$1,325,846.39 (including GST), is within the budget allocation of \$1.8M (including GST).

Recommendation

That Council accepts the tender from Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd for Contract No. 21/00934 - Keene Street Reconstruction for the lump sum amount of \$1,325,846.39 (including GST).

Attachments

1. Location Plan – Keene Street reconstruction (DOC21/53923).