

CM13.3. Brooklyn Fields Trunk Sewer (Stage 3 to Woolshed Creek) and Lipsett Gravity Main Contract No. 20/02694

DATE	13 October 2021	FIL REFERENCE	FIL20/02694-02
CONFIDENTIAL	No		
FURTHER ENQUIRIES	Andrew Lawson City Projects	PHONE	6023 8111
AUTHOR	Kyal Sharpe		

Purpose of Report

To recommend a preferred contractor for construction of the Brooklyn Fields Trunk Sewer (Stage 3 to Woolshed Creek) and Lipsett Gravity Main project, through a qualitative and quantitative assessment.

Background

Brooklyn Fields Estate is a 210-hectare parcel of land bound by Table Top Road and Kerr Road, situated to the north of existing residential estates in Thurgoona. The estate consists of 118 hectares of residential zoned land, with construction of the first two stages complete, and the third stage ongoing. The trunk sewer main proposed to be constructed under this contract begins at the northern end of Kerr Road, crosses Woolshed Creek and travels south-west adjacent to the Woolshed Creek alignment, connecting to the existing network at the third stage of the Brooklyn Fields estate. This trunk sewer main is 450mm diameter and will be installed via microtunneling, a trenchless construction method similar to conventional under-boring.

Construction of the Lipsett gravity sewer main involves the construction of a 225mm gravity sewer main from the existing collection well at Sewer Pump Station 41 (SPS 41), to an existing section of the trunk sewer main adjacent to Brooklyn Fields Estate (Stage 2). The purpose of this component of the project is to allow SPS 41 to be decommissioned, eliminating the need for ongoing maintenance, and running costs. The proposed gravity main will capture existing wastewater flows from Thurgoona Park and northern developments along Kerr Road, as well as some future development along Kerr Road.

This project forms part of the Albury City Council Sewerage Supply Strategy, which identifies a requirement for increased wastewater infrastructure to service northeast Thurgoona catchments, as well as further development along northern sections of Kerr Road. This project will assist in continuing a high level of wastewater service delivery to existing development throughout north-east areas of Thurgoona, whilst providing capacity for future growth.

The scope of the works included in this contract is summarised below:

- Construction of approximately 1.0 kilometre of 450mm GRP sewer trunk main via microtunneling, from the northern end of Kerr Road to the existing sewer trunk main at Stage 3 of Brooklyn Fields estate.

- Construction of approximately 250 metres of 225mm PVC sewer main from SPS 41 to the existing sewer trunk main at Stage 2 of Brooklyn Fields estate (including approximately 118m of under-boring).
- Construction of 15 sewer manholes.
- Reconstruction of the existing sewer collection well at SPS 41.
- Supply and installation of all associated fittings and materials to complete the sewer main constructions.

Tenders were invited for Contract No. 20/02694– Brooklyn Fields Trunk Sewer (Stage 3 to Woolshed Creek) & Lipsett Gravity Main, and advertised in the Border Mail, and on Tenderlink. Tenders closed at 12 noon on Tuesday 28 September 2021.

The contract duration is estimated at 26 weeks and will be completed in the 2021/22 financial year.

Council's budget allocation for the project is \$2.75M including GST.

A location plan is attached for information.

Tender Assessment

At the close of tenders, submissions were received from the following companies:

- B R Durham & Sons Pty Ltd (Mulgrave NSW);
- Crowley Excavations Pty Ltd (Kilmore VIC);
- Longford Civil Pty Ltd (Howlong NSW); and
- Utilstra Pty Ltd (Fyshwick ACT).

All tenders were evaluated in accordance with Council's Procurement Policy and Guidelines. The assessment panel for the tender comprised Project Engineer, Kyal Sharpe; Project Engineer, Vaisakh Harikumar; Sourcing Coordinator, Brooke Starkey; Hydraulics Operator Class 3, Jordan Lee; and Team Leader Quality and Systems, Brad Willis; in consultation with Team Leader Procurement Services, Elisha Lieschke.

Conformity Check

A conformity assessment was undertaken to ensure all submissions received were in accordance with the contract documentation and specification.

Company	Pricing Details	Supporting Information	WHS Documentation	Comment
B R Durham & Sons Pty Ltd	X	X	X	Non-Conforming
Crowley Excavations Pty Ltd	✓	✓	✓	Conforming
Longford Civil Pty Ltd	✓	✓	✓	Conforming
Utilstra Pty Ltd	✓	✓	✓	Conforming

As indicated above, the submissions from Crowley Excavations Pty Ltd, Longford Civil Pty Ltd, and Utilstra Pty Ltd were assessed as conforming tenders. The submission from B R Durham & Sons Pty Ltd was assessed as non-conforming, as it consisted of an expression of interest for material supply only.

Longford Civil Pty Ltd and Utilstra Pty Ltd are WHS registered with Council. Crowley Excavations Pty Ltd provided the necessary documentation to meet Council's WHS registration requirements.

Due to the submission from B R Durham & Sons Pty Ltd being assessed as non-conforming, it is not considered further in this report.

Qualitative Assessment

A qualitative assessment considered a range of issues including:

- Past Performance – including referee checks, relevant experience and expertise in performing same or similar projects.
- Methodology and Program – project methodology and proposed program.
- Capacity – current and future commitments and workload.
- Capability – including availability of resources, equipment and contract management capabilities.
- Benefit to Local Region – social and community benefit to the Albury/Wodonga region.

Company	Past Performance (35%)	Methodology & Program (25%)	Capacity (20%)	Capability (10%)	Local Benefit (10%)	Total (100%)
Longford Civil Pty Ltd	31	21	14	9	8	83
Crowley Excavations Pty Ltd	28	16	14	8	5	71
Utilstra Pty Ltd	21	17	14	7	5	64

Longford Civil Pty Ltd is a locally owned company based in Howlong NSW and has completed various water and wastewater infrastructure projects throughout the local area. Their recent projects include

the Ettamogah trunk sewer for AlburyCity, Jindera trunk sewer and pump station for Greater Hume Shire, as well as various other water main and civil construction projects for public and private sector clients.

Longford Civil Pty Ltd has indicated their current work commitments include an industrial subdivision in Jindera for Greater Hume Council (anticipated completion November 2021), and Botts Road Drainage in Yarrawonga for Moira Shire Council (anticipated completion December 2021). In addition, the company is completing the design and construction of a sewer pump station and trunk main for North East Water. This project is currently in the design phase.

The overall performance of the contractor for this project is largely dependent upon the nominated microtunneling subcontractor, as it is a specialist field of construction and is a major component of this project. Longford Civil Pty Ltd has nominated Adept Civil Group to complete these works. Longford Civil Pty Ltd utilised Adept Civil Group to undertake the microtunneling work on the recently completed Ettamogah trunk sewer project, which was delivered successfully for AlburyCity. Adept Civil Group is a large Melbourne based company and they are highly experienced in this construction methodology.

Considering their available resources and nominated subcontractors, Longford Civil Pty Ltd was assessed as having the required capacity to undertake this project.

Longford Civil Pty Ltd has an experienced workforce. Several key roles are filled by individuals with significant experience in the construction industry. Referee information was generally favourable and indicated that Longford Civil Pty Ltd is cooperative, professional, and well organised.

Longford Civil Pty Ltd has completed several civil infrastructure projects for AlburyCity in recent years. These projects include the construction of the Ettamogah trunk sewer, which involved construction methodology similar to that required by this project. Additionally, Longford Civil Pty Ltd has completed the construction of the Gerogery Road water main, Kerr Road trunk water main and various water main renewals throughout the city, amongst other civil works. All projects completed for AlburyCity have been delivered to a high standard, with a high level of cooperation demonstrated by the contractor.

Longford Civil Pty Ltd has provided a comprehensive methodology that explained all key construction activities to a high level of detail. They also provide thorough environmental and traffic management plans. The program demonstrated logical sequencing and links between activities and detailed a construction duration of 22 weeks.

Longford Civil Pty Ltd has indicated that, should they be awarded this project, the majority of materials, plant, equipment and labour will be sourced from the local region. They contribute to the community through sporting club sponsorship in the local area.

Information provided to Council indicates that the business has the financial capacity to support the delivery of this project.

Crowley Excavations Pty Ltd is a civil construction company based in Kilmore VIC, specialising in pipeline construction. Their recent projects include large subcontract works for private construction companies across various subdivision developments, including an estate in Yarrawonga for Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd.

Crowley Excavations Pty Ltd has indicated current work commitments with three private companies, including the Ballarat Sewer Outfall (anticipated completion November 2021), ongoing residential estate works in Yarrawonga for Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd, and Holts Lane in Bacchus March (at completion).

The company listed Edge Underground Pty Ltd as their nominated subcontractor for microtunneling works. Edge Underground Pty Ltd is a highly experienced boring and tunnelling contractor who have completed similar works across Australia.

Based on Crowley Excavations Pty Ltd's listed resources and nominated subcontractors the company is assessed as having the required capacity to undertake this project.

Referee information indicated that the company is well resourced, highly experienced and cooperative, with a referee describing the contractor as highly competent.

Crowley Excavations Pty Ltd has not completed any works for Albury City Council.

Crowley Excavations Pty Ltd submitted a detailed construction program of approximately 24 weeks, with the program demonstrating a logical sequencing between activities. The company did not submit a construction methodology in their tender submission.

The company has indicated that, should they be awarded this project, the majority of materials will be sourced from the local region. Whilst the company is not based in the local area, they have indicated their intention to engage several local labourers should they be awarded this project.

Information provided to Council indicates that the business has the financial capacity to support the delivery of this project.

Utilstra Pty Ltd is an engineering and project management company based in Fyshwick ACT. The company has completed a variety of work in the local region, including a small water main renewal project for AlburyCity in 2019. Their recent projects include a water main augmentation for Hilltop Council, various water main renewals for Singleton Council and a water main replacement in Wangaratta for North East Water.

Utilstra Pty Ltd has indicated that their current work commitments include a large water main renewal program for Singleton Council (anticipated completion November 2021), water and sewer mains replacement for Upper Lachlan Shire Council (anticipated completion October 2021) and water main maintenance works for Cabonne Council (anticipated completion October 2021).

The company has nominated Edge Underground Pty Ltd as a subcontractor for their microtunneling works.

Based on their current commitments, available resources and nominated subcontractors, Utilstra Pty Ltd is deemed to have the capacity to undertake this project.

Utilstra Pty Ltd has an experienced workforce, including several engineers and project managers. Referee information indicates that the company is competent and highly cooperative. Minor issues with time management were noted; however, referee reports overall were positive.

The company completed a small water main renewal project for AlburyCity in 2019. Utilstra Pty Ltd acted as a project management consultant for this project, with the works being completed by local subcontractors. As such, Council's experience with the company is limited.

Utilstra Pty Ltd submitted a detailed methodology, explaining all key components of the works. The submitted construction program was of high quality, listing all activities with logical sequencing and links. The total construction duration is 26 weeks which is considered fair and reasonable.

The company indicated that should they be awarded this project, approximately 50% of material and labour would be sourced locally. Utilstra Pty Ltd is not a locally based company. However, they have nominated several local subcontractors for the project.

Information provided to Council indicates that the business has the financial capacity to support the delivery of this project.

From the information provided, all companies demonstrate the required management systems, experience, construction plant, resources, and availability to provide AlburyCity with a quality product.

Quantitative Assessment (100%)

The lump sum tender prices and ratings relative to the lowest price are tabulated below.

Company	Estimated Contract Value (Including GST)	Rating (100)
Longford Civil Pty Ltd	\$2,437,886.00	100
Crowley Excavations Pty Ltd	\$2,602,611.00	94
Utilstra Pty Ltd	\$4,812,965.12	51

The budget allocation for the project is \$2.75M including GST, with two submissions being within the allocated budget.

As detailed above, the submission from Longford Civil Pty Ltd was the most favourable from a cost perspective, being \$165K (7%) more favourable than Crowley Excavations Pty Ltd and \$2.38M (97%) more favourable than Utilstra Pty Ltd.

Risk

- **Business Risk** – Financial risks are possible and are most likely to be associated with scope creep, delays as a result of the COVID-19 pandemic, or with latent conditions. Location of existing services, as well as environmental investigations and geotechnical investigations have been undertaken to reduce this risk. Due to the nature of the project and the contractors entering submissions, this risk is considered low.
- **Corporate Risk** – It is acknowledged that there is the possibility of corporate risk to the AlburyCity image and brand. Primarily this may be as a result of delays to the construction timelines or significant costs discrepancies; however, the risk overall is considered low due to extensive investigations completed in the design phase.
- **WHS and Public Risk** – WHS risks due to the construction works will be controlled in accordance with AlburyCity procedures. The contractor will be WHS registered with AlburyCity and will be required to implement relevant Safe Work Method Statements and undergo safety inspections. Further, the contractor is required to submit COVID safety plans, complete AlburyCity's COVID-19 declaration and abide by Federal and State Government Public Health Orders.
- **Environmental Risk** – A Review of Environmental Factors (REF) has been undertaken for this project to identify any environmental risks and suitable measures to mitigate them. As part of the REF, an Archaeological Assessment and Aboriginal Cultural Heritage Assessment were undertaken. Collectively, it was determined that all predicted environmental and cultural heritage impacts can be avoided, mitigated and/or managed such that the proposal would not lead to significant impacts. Due to the comprehensive environmental and archaeological investigation completed and the non-intrusive method of construction employed for the majority of the project, the risk at this time is considered low.
- **Delivery Program Risk** – Standard delivery program risks are possible, such as delays due to inclement weather, contractor delays and latent conditions. The current operating environment must also take into consideration the changing landscape that is impacted by the global pandemic COVID-19. The risk at this time is considered medium.

Community Engagement

The project is consistent with the Albury City Council Sewerage Supply Strategy, which identifies a requirement for increased wastewater infrastructure to service north-east Thurgoona catchments, as well as further development along northern sections of Kerr Road. The Sewerage Supply Strategy was placed on public exhibition prior to adoption.

This project aligns with various themes within the Albury Community Strategic Plan – Albury 2030, all of which have undergone extensive community consultation prior to adoption.

The relevant themes identified within Albury 2030 are:

1. A Growing Sustainable Economy:
 - 1.3 Plan and cater for increased population growth.

1.3.2 Support and promote sustainable growth through planning and infrastructure to provide employment opportunities, housing choice and community facilities.

1.8 Albury's infrastructure and assets are well managed and maintained.

1.8.1 Determine infrastructure and service levels through balancing community needs, future growth, sustainability, and heritage values.

The project was subsequently included in the 2020/21 Delivery Program, which was endorsed by Council following public exhibition.

Summary

The scoring for the qualitative and quantitative assessment is summarised in the following table:

Company	Quantitative	Qualitative
Longford Civil Pty Ltd	100	83
Crowley Excavations Pty Ltd	94	71
Utilstra Pty Ltd	51	64

From the qualitative assessment, all companies have the required management systems, experience, resources, and availability to successfully undertake this project.

From a quantitative perspective, the submission from Longford Civil Pty Ltd was assessed as being the most advantageous. The submission was between \$165K (7%) and \$2.38M (97%) more favourable than the other submissions.

Therefore, based on the qualitative and quantitative assessments, it is deemed that the submission from Longford Civil Pty Ltd provides the best value for Council to deliver this project.

Conclusion

Council invited tenders for the Brooklyn Fields Trunk Sewer (Stage 3 to Woolshed Creek) and Lipsett Gravity Main project and received four submissions.

This project forms part of the AlburyCity Council Sewerage Supply Strategy, which identifies a requirement for increased wastewater infrastructure to service north-east Thurgoona catchments, as well as further development along northern sections of Kerr Road. This project will assist in continuing a high level of wastewater service delivery to existing development throughout north-east areas of Thurgoona, whilst providing capacity for future growth of the precinct.

The scope of this project includes the construction of approximately 1.0 kilometre of 450mm trunk sewer main, and 250 metres of 225mm gravity sewer main to allow SPS 41 to be decommissioned. Additionally, the scope of works includes the construction of 15 new sewer manholes, and all associated works required to complete the pipeline construction.

A quantitative and qualitative assessment indicated that Longford Civil Pty Ltd was the most favourable submission. Their tendered price of \$2,437,886.00 including GST is within the budget allocation of \$2.75M including GST.

Recommendation

That Council accepts the tender from Longford Civil Pty Ltd for Contract No. 20/02694– Brooklyn Fields Sewer (Stage 3 to Woolshed Creek) & Lipsett Gravity Main for the lump sum amount of \$2,437,886.00 (including GST).

Attachments

1. Brooklyn Fields Trunk Sewer & Lipsett Gravity Sewer – Locality Plan (DOC21/227341).
2. Brooklyn Fields Trunk Sewer & Lipsett Gravity Sewer – Review of Environmental Factors (DOC21/227299).