CM13.7. Ian Barker Sports Field Stabilisation & Reconstruction Works - Contract No. 22/01728

DATE	14 June 2023	**FIL REFERENCE**	FIL22/01728-02
CONFIDENTIAL	No		
FURTHER ENQUIRIES	Andrew Lawson City Projects	**PHONE**	6023 8111
AUTHOR	Isaac Greene		

Purpose of Report

To recommend a preferred contractor for Ian Barker Fields Stabilisation and Reconstruction Works, through a qualitative and quantitative assessment.

Background

Ian Barker Fields forms part of the Alexandra Park Sports Precinct in East Albury. Up until the mid-1970s the extents of Ian Barker Fields were used as a general waste disposal area, prior to being re-purposed as a sports field. In recent decades, depressions have appeared, due to continued subsidence in the playing surface, which has led to half of the field being unplayable and the other half to be in a heavily dilapidated state. To reconstruct the sports field, considerable work is required to consolidate, stabilise, and level the site to mitigate future subsidence.

Council engaged Consultant Endeavour Turf Professionals Pty Ltd to undertake the design works required for this project. Within this design it is proposed to reconstruct the existing area of Ian Barker Fields to create a four-hectare multi-purpose playing field, which can cater for one full-size senior AFL oval, four senior-size soccer fields and a cricket ground, all of which are overlaid in one sports field surface, with full lighting provision. It is intended to be used by local sporting groups and the general community for active and passive recreation, and can also accommodate regional carnivals and gala days. The facility will also provide flexibility in managing greater participation numbers as well as provide the option to host carnivals requiring several fields concurrently.

The upgrade of Ian Barker Fields aligns with the Albury City Council endorsed Alexandra Park Sports Precinct Master Plan (Attachment 1). The redevelopment of Ian Barker Fields is also identified as a high priority action within the recently endorsed Albury Wodonga Sport and Recreation Strategy, given this project will address current and future deficiency in sporting fields in the region, specifically soccer and cricket. This will also ensure Council is able to cater for future growth and meet both male and female sporting participation demands.

The scope of works included in this contract is summarised as follows:

- levelling, stabilisation and reconstruction of the playing surface;
- irrigation system;
- sub-surface drainage;
- establishment of a warm season turf surface;
- synthetic grass covered concrete cricket pitch;
- sports field lighting; and
- perimeter fencing.

Tenders were invited for Ian Barker Fields Stabilisation and Reconstruction Works, Contract No. 22/01728, and advertised in the Border Mail and on Tenderlink. Tenders closed at 12 noon on Thursday 6 April 2023.

The contract duration is estimated at 200 working days, including a three-month establishment period, and will be completed in the 2023/24 financial year.

Council's budget allocation for the project is $4.4M (including GST), including $968K in grant funding under the NSW Government Regional Sport Facility Fund. This estimate was based on the original cost estimate of $4.9M completed by the Consultant in November 2021. Due to the time elapsed since the original cost estimate, a revised estimate was requested and received in late April 2023 valuing the works at $6.5M (including GST). This increase being attributed to price escalations.

The Alexandra Park Sports Precinct Master Plan Map illustrates the location of Ian Barker Fields and is attached for information (Attachment 1), along with the Proposed Features and Layout Plan (Attachment 2).

Tender Assessment

At the close of tenders, submissions were received from the following companies:

- Colin Joss & Co Pty Ltd trading as Joss Construction (Albury, NSW);
- Colin Joss & Co Pty Ltd trading as Joss Construction (Albury, NSW) - Alternate Tender;
- Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd (Wodonga, VIC); and
- Noorac Trading Pty Ltd trading as Riverina Sporting Facilities (Culcairn, NSW).

The tenders were evaluated in accordance with Council's Procurement Policy and Guidelines. The assessment panel for the tender comprised Sourcing Coordinator – Paul Dwyer, Parks Supervisor – Mark Lee and Project Delivery Team Leader – Isaac Greene.

Conformity Check

A conformity assessment was undertaken to ensure all submissions received were in accordance with the contract documentation and specification.

Company	Pricing Details	Supporting Information	WHS Documentation	Comment
Colin Joss & Co Pty Ltd trading as Joss Construction	✓	✓	✓	Conforming
Colin Joss & Co Pty Ltd trading as Joss Construction – Alternate Tender	✓	✓	✓	Conforming
Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd	✓	✓	✓	Conforming
Noorac Trading Pty Ltd trading as Riverina Sporting Facilities	✓	✓	✓	Conforming

As indicated above, all submissions were assessed as conforming tenders, with the necessary documentation provided to meet Council's WHS registration requirements.

Joss Construction provided an alternate tender proposing the assignment of a per-day rate for delay caused by an act or disruption to the works by the Principal; thus altering the commercial conditions of contract from the current "NIL" assignment. If this alternate submission was to be selected, the contract information would be amended to reflect the agreed rates.

Qualitative Assessment

A qualitative assessment considered a range of issues including:

- past performance – including referee checks, relevant experience and expertise in performing same or similar projects;
- methodology and program – project methodology and proposed program;
- capacity – financial capacity to undertake a project of this scale and availability of management, staffing resources and equipment to carry out the project;
- capability – vendor's capability to deliver the project requirements and contract management capabilities; and
- benefit to local region – social and community benefit to the Albury/Wodonga region.

Company	Past Performance (35%)	Methodology & Program (25%)	Capacity (20%)	Capability (10%)	Local Benefit (10%)	Total (100%)
Colin Joss & Co Pty Ltd trading as Joss Construction	28	22	19	9	8	86
Colin Joss & Co Pty Ltd trading as Joss Construction – Alternate Tender	28	22	19	9	8	86
Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd	21	12	17	6	7	63
Noorac Trading Pty Ltd trading as Riverina Sporting Facilities	21	17	5	6	8	57

Colin Joss & Co Pty Ltd trading as Joss Construction is a locally based company (Albury, NSW) and has extensive experience in large scale construction projects for local government bodies, which include several sports precinct developments.

Notable projects that directly relate to the development of major sporting precinct infrastructure, completed or currently being delivered by Joss Construction, include the $16.4M Artie Smith Oval Redevelopment for Shoalhaven City Council, the $13.2M Wagga Wagga Multi Sports Cycling Complex for Wagga Wagga City Council, the $1.1M Puckapunyal Irrigation Works for the Department of Defence and the $12M Wodonga South Primary School for Victoria Department of Education & Training.

Joss Construction indicated that their current commitments include Artie Smith Oval Redevelopment for Shoalhaven City Council (anticipated completion, May 2023), Wodonga Middle Years College for Victoria Department of Education (anticipated completion, October 2023), Albury Wodonga Health Emergency & ICU Upgrade (anticipated completion, July 2024), Flying Fruit Fly Circus Extension (anticipated completion, October 2023), and Daramalan Performing Arts Centre for Daramalan College (anticipated completion, September 2023). The assessment panel considered these current commitments and the company's available resources and deemed that Joss Construction would have sufficient resources to undertake the project.

Joss Construction's construction program is 218 working days in duration. Their program was detailed, identified all critical construction activities, included realistic timelines, and accounted for all project tasks. They also identified administrative, shop detailing, testing and establishment requirements and adequately assigned time to comply with witness points and hold points. The program submitted by Joss Construction illustrates that they have a detailed appreciation of all construction activities and sequencing necessary to successfully deliver the works.

The methodology provided by Joss Construction demonstrated that they have a thorough understanding of the technical and performance details of all key construction activities required to complete the works, as outlined within the technical specification. This provides confidence that the specialist elements within the project, which include sub-grade stabilisation, irrigation, sub-surface drainage, root zone layer, grassing and turf establishment, will be completed to a high standard and to the level of workmanship outlined in the tender documentation.

Council's consultant, Endeavour Turf Professionals Pty Ltd summarised Joss Construction's submission as follows:

- they have provided an extensive list of previous experience with sports field construction works of similar nature;
- have submitted a tender that was thorough and complete;
- their timelines were realistic and accounted for all works to be performed including establishment period;
- their methodology was detailed and comprehensive; and
- have provided a detailed list of subcontractors that will undertake the works.

Joss Construction has proposed a delivery team that is well resourced at all levels, with individuals who have direct experience in completing major sports infrastructure developments, as well as other relevant construction industry experience. They also have additional project support resources to undertake technical, programming, health and safety, environment, and quality functions. Joss Construction has also nominated reputable subcontractors to undertake the specialist components of the works.

Referee information indicated that Joss Construction has previously delivered high-quality projects in accordance with the technical requirements and client's expectations. Referees also suggested that the contractor is highly experienced in project delivery and has a professional and well-resourced team. Furthermore, NSW Public Works were also approached who attested to their performance over a significant number of projects.

In consideration of financial capacity, Albury City Council engaged Equifax Australasia Credit Ratings (Equifax) to evaluate and provide Corporate Scorecards for all tenderers. The Corporate Scorecard received for Joss Construction confirmed that they have “very strong” financial capacity to undertake a contract of this size.

Joss Construction has indicated that, should they be awarded this contract, the majority of the materials, plant, equipment and labour will be sourced from the local region. A majority of their proposed key subcontractors and suppliers are local and well respected in their fields. Their submission also indicated substantial community benefit within the local region through extensive sponsorship of various local sporting groups, volunteer organisations and community groups.

Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd is a locally based company (Wodonga, VIC) and has undertaken several civil construction projects for both public and private clients within the region including successful works for Albury City Council.

Their current commitments include the $8.6M Riverside Precinct for Albury City Council (anticipated completion, July 2023), the $2.3M Corryong Stock Route for Towong Shire Council (anticipated completion, June 2023), the $1.6M of works undertaken at Baranduda Sports Fields for Wodonga City Council (anticipated completion, May 2023) and the $1.8M Logic Centre for Wodonga City Council (anticipated completion, April 2023).

Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd’s construction program is 132 working days in duration, which doesn’t align with Council’s estimated timeframe, is considered unachievable, and does not represent a full appreciation of the construction scope, activities and sequencing required to deliver the works. Furthermore, the program in several instances omits key construction and quality management activities. Notable omissions include the high energy impact compaction (HEIC) works and the 12-week establishment period, which are considered critical path activities.

The methodology was also limited and lacked specific details, including the omission of several critical items in response to those specifically requested within the returnable schedule for methodology. Notwithstanding, Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd has allowed for the required specialist compaction equipment and associated subcontractor, as well as nominated the engagement of a suitably qualified consultant to assist during the installation of the root zone layer and grassing.

Council's consultant, Endeavour Turf Professionals Pty Ltd, summarised Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd's submission as follows:

- limited methodology provided in the submission, neglecting details for establishment period;
- did not allow for establishment in the construction program; and
- provided a detailed list of subcontractors that will undertake the works.

Their proposed delivery team consists of key personnel with construction-based industry experience. They have indicated that the majority of components of this contract such as earthworks, drainage, irrigation, root zone layer and fencing will be undertaken by their own resources. For other elements they have nominated reputable subcontractors to undertake respective activities.

Referee information indicated that Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd completes projects to a high standard, is a pro-active contractor and works cooperatively with their clients. Specific referee information relating to major sports field developments was limited. A notable project outlined in their submission was the $1.6M Baranduda Sports Fields completed for Wodonga City Council, however, after discussion with their referee it was further understood that they had only completed the sub-surface drainage works and auxiliary concrete and fencing works within this project, of which they completed to a high standard.

In consideration of financial capacity, the Corporate Scorecard received for Excell Gray Bruni confirmed that they have a "strong" financial capacity to undertake a contract of this size.

Excell Gray Bruni Pty has indicated that for this procurement activity, all materials, labour, and plant would be sourced from the local region. The business has a permanent presence in the community and has listed a number of local organisations and sporting groups that they sponsor.

Noorac Trading Pty Ltd (Riverina Sporting Facilities) is a locally owned company, based in Culcairn NSW, with experience in completing sporting infrastructure construction projects, such as synthetic tennis and netball court resurfacing and sports field construction and top dressing between $200K to $2.5M.

Their current commitments include $450K netball courts for the Walbundrie Netball Club (anticipated completion April 2023), $400K netball courts for the Collingullie Netball Club (anticipated completion April 2023), and $200K tennis courts for the Splitters Creek Tennis Club (anticipated completion April 2023).

Noorac Trading Pty Ltd's construction program is 236 working days in duration. Their program was sufficiently detailed, included realistic timeframes and demonstrated comprehensive consideration of all the activities and sequencing required to deliver the works.

The methodology provided by Noorac Trading Pty Ltd was well written and addressed all items specifically requested within the returnable schedule for methodology. This demonstrates that they have a thorough appreciation of the technical and performance details of the key construction activities required to complete the works to the level of workmanship outlined in the tender documentation.

Council's consultant, Endeavour Turf Professionals Pty Ltd summarised Noorac Trading Pty Ltd's submission as follows:

- submitted tender is thorough and complete;
- methodology is detailed and comprehensive;
- provided comprehensive list of subcontractors that will undertake these works;
- timelines are realistic and accounted for all works to be performed; and
- have previous experience with turf construction works.

Noorac Trading Pty Ltd's proposed delivery team is comprised of key personnel with relevant qualifications and direct experience in the construction of sports fields, courts and civil construction. They have also nominated reputable subcontractors to undertake the specialist components of the works.

Referee information indicated that Noorac Trading Pty Ltd has delivered high quality and positive outcomes on all recent projects undertaken. They also indicated that they are a preferred contractor for tennis courts and netball courts construction, with the referee attesting that they are easy to deal with and flexible.

The contractor is a local company servicing local schools and sporting facilities for community use. It was acknowledged that should they be successful, suppliers, subcontractors, and labourers will be sourced from the local area. They have also indicated that this procurement activity will result in an increase in employment.

In consideration of the financial capacity of Noorac Trading Pty Ltd to undertake a project of this scale, the Corporate Scorecard received indicated that they have a "marginal" financial capacity to undertake this project, with an overall result of "fail". Concerns identified within the scorecard were as follows:

- the contract value represents 200% of average annual revenue; and
- previously completed contracts are not of a similar value (largest $2.5M).

Considering the above, Noorac Trading Pty Ltd was requested to provide a signed statement from their accountant to demonstrate their financial capacity to undertake a project of this scale. Noorac Trading Pty Ltd was unable to provide Council with such a letter.

In terms of capacity, the panel deemed Noorac Trading Pty Ltd as poorly positioned to deliver a project of this scale. Based on this assessment, engaging Noorac Trading Pty Ltd would present a risk, not only to Council, but also to Noorac Trading Pty Ltd. Furthermore, the risk of failure increases, not only because of the financial strain on Noorac Trading Pty Ltd to service a large contract, but also their ability to service the contract operationally. For this reason, Noorac Trading Pty Ltd were not considered further for this tender.

From the qualitative assessment, the submissions from Joss Construction and Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd demonstrated the required management systems, financial capacity, resources, and availability to deliver this contract and were therefore carried forward.

Quantitative Assessment (100%)

The lump sum tender prices and ratings relative to the lowest price are tabulated below.

Company	Estimated Contract Value (including GST)	Rating (100)
Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd	$6,987,518.13	100
Colin Joss & Co Pty Ltd trading as Joss Construction – Alternate Tender	$7,004,128.80	100
Colin Joss & Co Pty Ltd trading as Joss Construction	$7,122,378.80	98

The budget allocation for the project is $4.4M (including GST), with no submissions being within the allocated budget. Council received a revised cost estimate in late April 2023 of $6.5M (including GST), which demonstrates that the submissions align with current market rates, after material and plant price escalation is factored in.

As detailed above, the submissions from Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd and Joss Construction are all within 2% ($135K) of each other, and therefore they are considered equivalent from a quantitative perspective.

Joss Construction's alternate tender with delay cost is $118K (2%) less than their conforming tender, and was considered by the assessment panel as a more favourable submission from Joss Construction. This position was reached as instances of Principal-caused delay are unlikely due to the inclusion of rate items and provisional sum allowances to cover the project's high-risk construction activities. Furthermore, extensive geotechnical investigations have also been undertaken to mitigate risks due to adverse site conditions.

As detailed above, the tendered pricing received aligns with the current market expectations and is consistent with the most recent independent cost estimates. The current budget allocation (2023/24) is understated in the order of $2.6M (including GST), and additionally, an estimated further provision of $400K will be required to facilitate project completion, including construction phase servicing, contingencies, variations and project management overheads. It is proposed that the current allocation shortfall of $3M be accommodated through adjustments at future Quarterly Budget Reviews considering other project timing/scheduling, project savings and/or the allocation of additional funds as required. To not proceed with this project will impact on Council's ability to cater

for future sporting participation demand and not realise the potential for this important sporting precinct.

Risk

- **Business Risk** – financial risks during construction are possible due to adverse site conditions. To mitigate this risk, location of existing services, environmental investigations and further geotechnical investigations have been undertaken. Additional costs associated with the project's high-risk construction activities have been mitigated through the assignment of schedule of rate items, with conservative upper quantity estimates. Provisional sum allowances have also been allocated for latent conditions such as contaminated soil disposal, rectification of unsuitable and/or soft areas and additional compaction work (if required, and upper estimates exhausted, albeit unlikely). With the specified compaction and capping processes during construction, it is anticipated that no, or minimal, contaminated soil will be required to be removed from site. If over consolidation of the site eventuates (above that anticipated in design), alterations to the playing surface level can also be made.

- **Corporate Risk** – corporate risks are possible with the existing sports field being unavailable during the construction of the new playing surface. This means that any delays during construction will ultimately prevent the existing Ian Barker Fields' users and new users utilising the facility, which therefore may damage the AlburyCity brand.

- **WHS and Public Risk** – WHS risks due to the construction works will be controlled in accordance with AlburyCity procedures. The contractor will be WHS registered with AlburyCity and will be required to implement relevant Safe Work Method Statements and safety inspections. The contractor will be required to submit a Traffic Management Plan to minimise construction impact to the community and to allow safe movement of both construction site vehicles and public vehicles.

- **Environmental Risk** – a Review of Environmental Factors (REF) has been undertaken to identify any environmental risks and suitable measures to mitigate them (Attachment 3). It was determined that all predicted environmental and cultural heritage impacts can be avoided, mitigated and/or managed such that the project will not lead to significant impact to the environment. The environmental risk of potentially exposing contaminated materials has also been managed through design by limiting excavation depth.

- **Delivery Program Risk** – it is critical to this project that the sand and turf installation is completed by December 2023 to allow for establishment of the warm season turf surface. There is also the possibility of delivery delays due to inclement weather, latent conditions, and contractor-caused delays.

Community Engagement

The Ian Barker Fields Stabilisation and Reconstruction Works are identified in the Council endorsed Alexandra Park Sports Precinct Master Plan, which included extensive engagement with stakeholders and the general community. Key stakeholders and user groups such as St Pat's Soccer Club, North

Albury Auskick, Steamers Rugby Union Club, East Albury Cricket Club and Cricket Albury Wodonga have endorsed the project by providing a letter of support for the successful grant application.

To keep the community informed of the construction progress, the project has been included in the Major Projects section of the website, and frequent updates will be made through News from AlburyCity and via social media.

This project is relevant to several strategic plans such as Towards Albury 2050, the Albury Wodonga Sport and Recreation Strategy and Managing the Growth of Football (Soccer) Strategy in Albury, as outlined below.

Towards Albury 2050 Community Strategic Plan

This project identifies with Towards Albury 2050's theme of 'a caring community' and specifically, with outcome 3.5.2 'Our buildings and spaces are designed to be inclusive and accessible to all community members.'

Specifically, the delivery of this project promotes and encourages healthy lifestyles through development and efficient use of sporting, recreational, educational, and cultural facilities, and infrastructure.

Albury Wodonga Sport and Recreation Strategy

This project is identified as a high priority action to address the current and future demand in soccer and cricket fields within the region. It will also provide an important training venue for other sports including Australian Rules Football and Rugby.

Managing the Growth of Football (Soccer) Strategy in Albury

This project identifies with the Managing the Growth of Football (Soccer) Strategy in Albury, specifically with 'Strategy Two – The development of Alexandra Park as a secondary venue for football.'

This project is also included in the Four-Year Delivery Program which underwent extensive community consultation prior to adoption by Council.

Summary

The scoring for the qualitative and quantitative assessment is summarised in the following table:

Company	Qualitative	Quantitative
Colin Joss & Co Pty Ltd trading as Joss Construction – Alternate Tender	86	100
Colin Joss & Co Pty Ltd trading as Joss Construction	86	98
Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd	63	100

From the qualitative assessment, the submissions from Joss Construction and Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd demonstrated the required management systems, financial capacity, resources and availability to deliver this contract. The submission from Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd, however, did not demonstrate previous experience in delivering major sports infrastructure precinct projects. This was also evident in their methodology and program which did not represent a full appreciation of the construction scope.

From a quantitative perspective, the submissions from Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd and Joss Construction were considered equivalent in value.

Considering the above, and based on the qualitative and quantitative assessment, it is deemed that the alternate tender from Joss Construction provides the best value for Council to deliver this project. The significant relevant sports field infrastructure experience, and detailed program and methodology outlined in their submission provides confidence that they have the required workmanship to deliver a high-quality outcome. Furthermore, instances of Principal-caused delay were considered very unlikely due to the inclusion of rate items and provisional sums for high-risk construction activities, and therefore the alternate tender provides AlburyCity with value for money.

Although the tendered pricing received aligns with the current market expectations, the current budget allocation (2023/24) is understated in the order of $3.0M (including GST). It is proposed that the current allocation shortfall be accommodated through adjustments at future Quarterly Budget Reviews considering other project timing/scheduling, project savings and/or the allocation of additional funds as required.

Conclusion

Following significant subsidence and depressions appearing in the Ian Barker Fields playing surface, Council engaged consultant, Endeavour Turf Professionals Pty Ltd, to undertake the design required for this project. This project will see the transformation of the dilapidated sports field into a four-hectare multi-purpose playing field, which can cater for one full-size senior AFL oval, four senior-size soccer fields and a cricket ground overlaid in one sports field surface, including playing standard lighting.

The redevelopment of Ian Barker Fields is a high priority project that will cater for current and future forecast growth in several sports and will assist in meeting male and female participation demand.

Council invited tenders for the Ian Barker Fields Stabilisation and Reconstruction Works and received four submissions from three tenderers, with all submissions being deemed conforming. An alternate submission from Joss Construction was received proposing the assignment for delay caused by an act or disruption to the works by the Principal. The alternative offer was considered as a viable alternative, as instances of Principal-caused delay are unlikely, due to the inclusion of rate items and provisional sum allowances to cover the project’s high-risk construction activities.

A quantitative and qualitative assessment indicated that the alternate tender from Joss Construction was the most favourable submission. Their tendered price of $7,004,128.80 (including GST) is considered value for money and the most advantageous for Council.

Recommendation

That Council:

a. accepts the alternate tender from Colin Joss & Co Pty Ltd trading as Joss Construction, for Contract No. 22/01728 Ian Barker Fields Stabilisation and Reconstruction Works for the lump sum price of $7,004,128.8 (including GST); and
b. approves the allocation of $3.0M (including GST) in funding at future 2023/24 Quarterly Budget Reviews to complete this project.

Attachments

1. Alexandra Park Sports Precinct Master Plan Map (DOC11/35361).
2. Ian Barker Fields Proposed Features and Layout Plan (DOC22/126063).
3. Review of Environmental Factors Report (DOC23/298444).