## CM13.2. Albury Airport Car Park System Upgrade Contract No. 22/02073

| | | | |
|---|---|---|---|
| **DATE** | 28 March 2023 | **FIL REFERENCE** | FIL22/02073 |
| **CONFIDENTIAL** | No | | |
| **FURTHER ENQUIRIES** | Ambrose Glass<br>Service Leader Business & Lifestyle | **PHONE** | 02 6023 8111 |
| **AUTHOR** | Nick Politis | | |

**Purpose of Report**

To recommend a preferred contractor for Contract No.22/02073 Albury Airport Car Park System Upgrade at the Albury Airport.

**Background**

Albury Airport Car Park is owned and operated by AlburyCity and is located on the southern side of the terminal building. Passengers and airport patrons utilising the airport's services traditionally self-drive, rideshare or are dropped off within the car park. Other means of transport to and from the airport are by taxi or chartered and public bus services. Prior to the pandemic, car park vehicle movements exceeded 250,000 per annum. This number is expected to increase as additional destinations and larger aircraft commence flights at Albury Airport.

The existing car park system at Albury Airport is over ten years old and is increasingly becoming less reliable. The regular hardware and software faults have impacted negatively upon customer experience and operational effectiveness. To address these issues and accommodate the growth at the airport, the upgrade of the airport car park system is required.

**Scope of Services**

The aim of the upgrade is to substitute the current system with a modern system that enhances customer satisfaction and eliminates the necessity for tickets. Importantly the new parking system is to assist the community in wayfinding for available parking spaces, allows Council to capture parking behaviour metrics and improve the integration and efficiency of modern technologies with Council's technology interface.

The scope of works for the project includes:

- Provision of traffic management during the works;
- Removal of the current car park system;
- Installation of the new car park equipment;
- Integration of technology with Council's interface;
- Training; and
- After-sales support.

Tenders were invited for Contract No.22/02073 Albury Airport Car Park System Upgrade and advertised in the Border Mail, Sydney Morning Herald and on Tenderlink. Tenders closed at 12 noon on Wednesday 18 January 2023.

The contract duration is estimated at 12 weeks and will be completed in the 2023/24 financial year.

Council's budget allocation for this project is $500,000 excluding GST.

**Tender Assessment**

At the close of tenders, submissions were received from the following companies:

- CDS Worldwide (South Melbourne, Victoria)
- Designa Australia Pty Ltd (Prospect, South Australia)
- Parcsafe (Pinkenba, Queensland)
- Sensor Dynamics (Mitcham, Victoria)
- TMA Australia (Granville, NSW)

All tenders were evaluated in accordance with Council's Procurement Policy and Guidelines. The Assessment Panel for the tender comprised of IT Infrastructure Engineer – Paul Seabright, Finance Business Partner – Ben Cleary, Team Leader Airport Operations – Nick Politis, and Sourcing Coordinator – Paul Dwyer.

**Conformity Check**

A conformity assessment was undertaken to ensure all submissions received were in accordance with the contract documentation and specification.

| Company | Pricing Details (Inc. GST) | Supporting Information | WHS Documentation | Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| **CDS Worldwide** | $342,656 | Yes | Yes | Conforming |
| **Designa Australia Pty Ltd** | $406,658 | Yes | Yes | Conforming |
| **Parcsafe** | $353,756 | Yes | Yes | Conforming |
| **Sensor Dynamics** | $360,516 | Yes | Yes | Conforming |
| **TMA Australia** | $488,052 | Yes | Yes | Conforming |

As indicated above, all submissions were assessed as conforming tenders and all companies are capable of meeting Council's WHS compliance requirements.

**Qualitative Assessment**

A qualitative assessment considered a range of matters including:

- past performance – including a referee check, relevant experience and expertise in performing same or similar projects;
- methodology and program – project methodology and proposed program;
- capacity – current and future commitments and workload;

- capability – including availability of resources, equipment and contract management capabilities; and
- benefit to local region – social and community benefit to the Albury/Wodonga region.

| Company | Past Performance (25%) | Methodology & Program (25%) | Capacity (15%) | Capability (25%) | Local Benefit (10%) | Total (100%) |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Sensor Dynamics | 20 | 20 | 11 | 18 | 1 | 70 |
| TMA Australia | 17 | 15 | 9 | 18 | 2 | 61 |
| Designa Australia Pty Ltd | 18 | 13 | 8 | 17 | 2 | 58 |
| CDS Worldwide | 17 | 15 | 9 | 12 | 2 | 55 |
| Parcsafe | 10 | 12 | 6 | 10 | 2 | 40 |

**Sensor Dynamics** is an Australian technology company that specialises in providing innovative car parking solutions to local governments, commercial property owners and parking operators. The company is located in Mitcham, Victoria. Sensor Dynamics has completed several car park projects across Australia, including the City of Melbourne, City of Port Phillip, City of Greater Dandenong, City of Parramatta and Hornsby City Council. Their projects have included the installation of smart parking sensors, real-time parking guidance systems and parking management software. Sensor Dynamics is committed to delivering high-quality parking solutions that reduce traffic congestion, improve the customer experience and create more liveable and sustainable cities.

Their current work commitments have enabled sufficient capacity to undertake the work with all four example projects at the time of tender having been completed and transitioned to ongoing service agreements. Most relevant example includes the AMP Capital – Royal Randwick Shopping Centre ticketless parking solution which also included the installation of both payment machines and exit stations.

According to the referee information, Sensor Dynamics demonstrated a strong understanding of project management requirements, cooperation and management of safety and quality throughout the project. They were able to effectively manage resources and ensure that the upgrade was completed to a high standard. Additionally, the company was noted for its exceptional client support and collaboration throughout the project. Sensor Dynamics was distinguished by its superior resource management and commitment to delivering a successful outcome for its clients.

Sensor Dynamics was able to highlight a strong work methodology and program to deliver the Albury Airport car park upgrade. Notably, the company's ability to manufacture its equipment here in Australia reduces supply chain issues. The estimated timeframe for the project is set at a 12-week program, which was more favourable than the other tenderers. This reduced timeframe can be largely attributed to the fact that most of the equipment required for the project is manufactured locally in Australia by Sensor Dynamics. Overall, the company's commitment to manufacturing locally and its efficient work methodology are distinguishing points from other tenderers.

Despite their headquarters being located in Mitcham, they have decided to employ a local company to carry out ongoing servicing and preventative maintenance at the Albury Airport car park. This decision

reflects Sensor Dynamics' commitment to providing excellent customer service and support to their clients, no matter where they are located. By engaging a local company, they can ensure that their systems remain in optimal condition, while also supporting the local economy and community.

**TMA Australia** provides equipment and support to over 250 sites nationally and is located in Granville, NSW. The company installs ticketless, ticket reduced and ticketed systems to a range of local government owned sites. Recent car parking projects include Caboolture hospital and Perth airport.

Based on their submission TMA have only one other project scheduled over the same period as the Albury Airport Car Park System Upgrade. Their most relevant example of a similar project is the supply, installation, training and servicing of car park access control equipment with Launceston City Council.

TMA's measure of performance, based on referee checks, was found to be on average good against all criteria. The review highlighted the company's ability to deliver quality services and outcomes, with good project management governance. Referee checks indicated at times the connectivity between newly installed systems was not operating as intended but was resolved in a timely manner by their technicians.

TMA provided an average program and methodology. The company’s approach to project management was deemed suitable, with timelines and milestones for each stage of the project identified. The project timeframe is planned for a period of 24 weeks.

TMA demonstrated a commitment to supporting the local community by utilising local electricians for the installation and servicing of their equipment, providing similar local benefits as the other tenderers.

**Designa Australia** is a company based in Prospect, South Australia. Designa’s systems are intended to improve parking efficiency, reduce traffic congestion and provide a seamless parking experience for customers. Designa has completed a number of car parking projects, including the design and installation of an automated car parking system for the Barangaroo development in Sydney's central business district.

Based on their submission, Designa has identified one project to coincide at the same time as the Albury Airport Car Park System Upgrade. Their most relevant example of a similar project is the supply and installation of a gated ticketless parking solution with digital displays in Claremont Quarter, Western Australia.

Designa's measure of performance, based on a referee check, was found to be average against all criteria. The referee check highlighted the company's ability to deliver services and outcomes, with a focus on project management. It was reported that when problems arose, Designa was generally timely to respond and resolve. Overall, the referee check found that Designa's measure of performance was average and distinguished by their cooperation levels when problems occurred.

Designa provided a below average program and methodology. The company’s approach to project management was deemed effective, with clear timelines for each stage of the project. The project

timeframe for the upgrade is planned for a period over 23 weeks with 12 of those weeks associated with transportation of equipment from overseas.

Designa demonstrated limited commitment to supporting the local community. Most community interaction would occur during the installation with a local electrical services contractor to be engaged as required to support the installation of the system.

**CDS Worldwide** is a provider of parking management systems and solutions. In Australia, the company is headquartered in South Melbourne, Victoria. CDS Worldwide has completed several car park projects across the country, including the Brisbane Airport, Sydney International Airport and Melbourne Airport. They have also implemented parking systems in large shopping centres, hospitals, universities, and government institutions in cities such as Perth, Adelaide and Canberra. CDS Worldwide's projects range from automated parking systems and revenue control solutions to parking guidance systems and software platforms for parking management. CDS Worldwide is also the incumbent car park system provider at Albury Airport.

Based on their submission CDS will have no work during the Albury Airport Car Park system upgrade. Their most relevant project example is the Ballina Airport car park installation which included the supply of a ticketed Licence Plate Recognition system complete with entry lane digital information displays.

CDS Worldwide's measure of performance based on a referee check showed on average a marginal score across all criteria. Further investigation revealed that the company's equipment was highly susceptible to inclement weather and hot weather environments, leading to increased downtime and lost recovery. Repair timeframes were also exacerbated by significant wait times for replacement parts. Despite these challenges, there were some highlights in the management of worksite safety, which was consistent with other submissions.

CDS Worldwide installed the Albury Airport car park system in 2008 and then provided additional equipment in 2010 as part of the car park’s extension. Overall, CDS Worldwide has provided a satisfactory service to Albury Airport.

CDS Worldwide's program and methodology was assessed as satisfactory. The company's approach to project management was deemed effective, with timelines identified for each stage of the project. The project timeframe is planned for a period over 14 weeks.

CDS Worldwide demonstrated a commitment to supporting the local community by utilising local electricians for the installation and servicing of their equipment.

**Parcsafe** is a provider of parking management solutions, delivering innovative services to clients globally. Parcsafe is located in Pinkenba, QLD and was founded in early 2000. Recent car park projects that Parcsafe have completed include the installation of advanced parking control systems, the implementation of parking guidance solutions and the delivery of comprehensive parking management services.

Their current work commitment indicates only one concurrent project scheduled over the anticipated period for the Albury Airport car park upgrade. Their most relevant example of a similar project is the supply and installation of a hybrid, both ticketless and ticketed, car park management system at the George Centre Hospital, New South Wales.

Parcsafe's measure of performance, based on a referee check, was considered below average against a majority of the criteria. The referee check highlighted the company's ability to deliver parking management solutions, with a focus on meeting project resourcing requirements. Overall, the review found that Parcsafe's measure of performance satisfied most of the client's expectations.

Parcsafe provided a below-average program and methodology. The company's approach to project management was deemed feasible, with clear timelines for each stage of the project. The project timeframe is planned for a period over 26 weeks. Overall, Parcsafe had a satisfactory grasp of the program and was assessed as being able to deliver the project.

Parcsafe demonstrated similar commitment to local businesses as other tenderers. Parcsafe does distinguish itself from the other tenderers through its sponsorship and donations to the Rapid Relief Team who are volunteers based in the Albury Wodonga region.

From the information provided and after a qualitative performance assessment, Sensor Dynamic's submission was far superior to the other tenders in a majority of the assessment criteria. The company's strong program and methodology and commitment to project management excellence shone through in its comprehensive and well thought out proposal. Additionally, Sensor Dynamic's ability to manufacture most of the equipment locally in Australia proved to be a significant advantage, as it reduced supply chain issues and ensured timely delivery of their products.

Sensor Dynamic's intention to utilise local labour to install and maintain the car park reinforces its intention for customer service excellence. Overall, Sensor Dynamics has demonstrated the capability and capacity to deliver AlburyCity with a quality product and after-sales support.

**Quantitative Assessment (100%)**

The lump sum tender prices and ratings relative to the lowest price are tabulated below.

| Company | Estimated Contract Value (including GST) | Rating (100) |
|---|---|---|
| **CDS Worldwide** | $342,656 | 100 |
| **Parcsafe** | $353,756 | 97 |
| **Sensor Dynamics** | $360,516 | 95 |
| **Designa Australia Pty Ltd** | $406,658 | 84 |
| **TMA Australia** | $488,052 | 70 |

The current budget allocation for the project is $500,000 excluding GST, with all submissions being under the allocated budget. The December Quarter Budget Review, endorsed by Council on 27 February 2023, included an adjustment to the adopted budget for this project.

As detailed above, the submission from CDS Worldwide was the most favourable from a cost perspective, being $11.1K (3%) more favourable than Parcsafe, $17.9K (5%) more favourable than Sensor Dynamics, $64K (19%) more favourable than Designa Australia Pty Ltd and $145.4K (42%) more favourable than TMA Australia.

**Risk**

- **Business Risk** – There is a risk associated with the continuing unreliability of the legacy car park system, which has resulted in lost income due to downtime. This risk is further compounded by the increasing costs of repairs and parts for the legacy system, which impact the car park's performance. To mitigate this risk, the replacement of the legacy system with a more reliable and sustainable solution is proposed as part of this tender.

- **Corporate Risk** – The corporate risk of not upgrading the car park system, which is not operating efficiently, is significant. The current system's unreliability and inefficiency could damage the airport's reputation and have negative impacts if customers have a poor experience with the parking system, leading to a decline in customer satisfaction and loyalty.

- **WHS and Public Risk** – The current system's outages and inefficiencies may also create safety risks, as customers may become frustrated and engage in dangerous behaviours such as ignoring parking guidelines or attempting to park in prohibited areas. Overall, the risks associated with not upgrading the car park system are significant and could have a detrimental impact on the airport's safety and security.

- **Environmental Risk** – Transitioning to a ticketless car parking system has the potential to significantly reduce wastage associated with ticket printing and minimise the need for ongoing procurement of consumables moved by road. By transitioning to a ticketless system, the airport can reduce the environmental impact associated with ticketing and minimise its ongoing procurement needs, resulting in a more sustainable and cost-effective approach to parking. This will also lead to a more efficient car park system, reducing congestion, and improving the overall customer experience.

- **Delivery Program Risk** – The car parking project is expected to take place over the busiest period for Albury Airport, which is a significant risk to the project's success. However, this risk has been mitigated by a deliberately staged transition to ensure the car park remains operational throughout the project. By implementing a phased approach, the airport can minimise disruptions to customers and ensure the car park remains accessible during the project's duration.

**Community Engagement**

The Albury Airport Car Park System Upgrade is identified in the 2018 Albury Airport Master Plan recommendations for implementation in the short term. Additionally, the project was included in the Adopted New Initiatives 2022-26 Four-Year Delivery Program after a period of public exhibition for 28 days.

This project also aligns with the various themes adopted within the AlburyCity strategic document, more specifically the Towards Albury 2050, *A Growing Sustainable Economy, 1.3 Albury will offer diverse and innovative tourism experiences to attract new repeat visitation.*

To ensure that airport patrons and the wider community are adequately informed and prepared during the upgrade, regular updates will be provided through social media and the FlyAlbury website. These updates may include information on the project's progress, any changes to access or parking arrangements and details of any disruptions or delays that may impact airport operations. This information will be communicated clearly and concisely, using a variety of mediums, including text, images and video, to ensure that it is accessible and easy to understand. By keeping the community and airport patrons up to date, the airport can ensure patrons are adequately informed and prepared when using the car park during the upgrade, reducing the risk of confusion, delays and inconvenience.

**Summary**

The scoring for the qualitative and quantitative assessment is summarised in the following table:

| Company | Qualitative | Quantitative |
|---|---|---|
| **Sensor Dynamics** | 70 | 95 |
| **TMA Australia** | 61 | 70 |
| **Designa Australia** | 58 | 84 |
| **CDS Worldwide** | 55 | 100 |
| **Parcsafe** | 40 | 97 |

From the qualitative assessment, Sensor Dynamics provided a far superior product and has the required management systems, experience, resources and availability to successfully undertake this project. Additionally, being a local manufacturer Sensor Dynamics' supply chain and maintenance turnaround offers a short turnaround thereby reducing equipment downtime. Sensor Dynamics' after-sales support provisions also allow for a local company, from the region, to be subcontracted to conduct maintenance and servicing on the new system.

From a quantitative perspective, the submission from CDS Worldwide was assessed as being the least expensive. The submission was between $11.1K (3%) and $145.4K (42%) more favourable than the other submissions. Despite being the more favourable from a quantitative score, referee checks highlighted their equipment being susceptible to inclement and hot weather, which was exacerbated by significant wait times for replacement parts. These factors contributed to a loss of financial recovery for the customer.

Considering the above and based on the qualitative and quantitative assessments, it is deemed that the submission from Sensor Dynamics provides the best value for Council to deliver this project at a cost of $360,516 including GST. The quality of product and relevant experience detailed within their submission provides confidence that Sensor Dynamics have the specialist skills and equipment required for this project.

**Conclusion**

Council invited tenders for Contract No.22/02073 Albury Airport Car Park System Upgrade and received five submissions.

The car park system upgrade sees the transition from a legacy ticketed system to a ticketless system with modern equipment that enhances the customer experience when travelling through Albury Airport. The new system also allows Council to understand parking behaviour metrics and improves the integration with Council's technology interface.

A quantitative and qualitative assessment was summarised and accordingly, determined that the submission from Sensor Dynamics presented the best value for AlburyCity to deliver the scope of works of this tender. Their tendered price of $360,516 including GST is within budget.

**Recommendation**

That Council accept the tender from Sensor Dynamics for a tendered lump sum price of $360,516 including GST, for Contract No.22/02073 Albury Airport Car Park System Upgrade.