CM13.2. Centaur Road Reconstruction Overend Street to Mudge Street Contract No. 20/02903

DATE	2 August 2023	**FIL REFERENCE**	FIL20/02903-02
CONFIDENTIAL	No		
FURTHER ENQUIRIES	Andrew Lawson City Projects	**PHONE**	02 6023 8111
AUTHOR	Vaisakh Harikumar		

Purpose of Report

To recommend a preferred contractor for Centaur Road Reconstruction - Overend Street to Mudge Street, through a qualitative and quantitative assessment.

Background

AlburyCity is committed to maintaining its infrastructure and providing the community with improved roads and pedestrian facilities across the Local Government Area.

Centaur Road is located in Hamilton Valley and provides access to residential properties, the Albury Waste Management Centre (AWMC), the Recycling Centre, the Albury Animal Care Centre, and the Lavington Sports Ground (LSG).

Due to the recent increases in traffic volumes from upgrades to both the AWMC and LSG, as well as a high percentage of heavy vehicles (15%), the road has severely deteriorated. Traffic volumes are expected to further increase with the ongoing expansion of the AWMC, and further residential development.

The section of Centaur Road between Overend Street and Mudge Street is in particularly poor condition and requires a full road reconstruction. There is a pressing need to upgrade the existing roadway to meet modern standards, improve road safety, and enhance the usability of the facilities and amenity of the area.

The proposed reconstruction work at Centaur Road is from Overend Street to Mudge Street. The scope of the work is summarised below:

- removal of vegetation as per the Review of Environmental Factors (see attachment 1);
- 716 lineal metres of road reconstruction, including new kerb, pavements, and asphalt surface;
- removal of the existing watermain and construction of a new 100mm diameter watermain;
- extension of existing box culverts under Centaur Road and Mudge Street;
- installation of new concrete driveways, gravel shared path and concrete footpaths, stormwater drainage and associated works;

- removal and replacement of existing splitter islands on the eastern side of Centaur Road;
- installation of a bicycle safety fence and road safety barrier;
- associated landscaping; and
- associated line marking and signpost installation.

Tenders were invited for Contract No. 20/02903 and advertised in the Border Mail, Sydney Morning Herald and on Tenderlink. Tenders closed at 12 noon on Tuesday 13 June 2023.

The contract duration is estimated at 21 weeks and will be completed in the 2023/24 financial year.

The Council budget allocation for the project is $2.42M (including GST). This budget consists of $1.694M (including GST) of grant funding, which Council received under Round 2 of the *Fixing Local Roads Program*, and Council's contribution of $726K (including GST).

Tender Assessment

At the close of tenders, submissions were received from the following companies:

- Cartwright Civil Contracting Pty Ltd (Wodonga, VIC);
- Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd (Wodonga, VIC); and
- Hutchinson Civil Pty Ltd (Lavington, NSW).

All tenders were evaluated in accordance with Council's Procurement Policy and Guidelines. The assessment panel for the tender comprised of Sourcing Coordinator - Paul Dwyer, Senior Designer - Alan Rodgers, Senior Project Engineer - Kyal Sharpe, Project Engineer - Vaisakh Harikumar and Project Delivery Team Leader - Isaac Greene.

Conformity Check

A conformity assessment was undertaken to ensure all submissions received were in accordance with the contract documentation and specification.

Company	Pricing Details	Supporting Information	WHS Documentation	Comment
Cartwright Civil Contracting Pty Ltd	Yes	Yes	Yes	Conforming
Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd	Yes	Yes	Yes	Conforming
Hutchinson Civil Pty Ltd	Yes	Yes	Yes	Conforming

As indicated above, all submissions were assessed as conforming tenders, and all companies are already WHS registered with Council.

Qualitative Assessment

A qualitative assessment considered a range of issues including:

- past performance – referee checks, relevant experience, and expertise in performing same or similar projects;
- methodology and program – project methodology and proposed program;
- capacity – current and future commitments and workload;
- capability – availability of resources, equipment, and contract management capabilities; and
- benefit to local region – social and community benefit to the Albury-Wodonga region.

Company	Past Performance (30%)	Methodology & Program (30%)	Capacity (20%)	Capability (10%)	Local Benefit (10%)	Total (100%)
Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd	28	28	17	10	8	91
Hutchinson Civil Pty Ltd	30	18	15	9	8	80
Cartwright Civil Contracting Pty Ltd	18	16	15	7	7	63

Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd is a locally based company that has undertaken a number of similar road reconstruction projects throughout the local region, including works for AlburyCity. They specialise in road construction, earthworks and culvert works projects.

Their current work commitments include Moama Intersections Landscaping (expected completion, August 2023), Mayday Hills Stage 12 and 13 (expected completion July 2023), Meridien Estate Stage 1 (expected completion September 2023) and Stock Route, Corryong (expected completion September 2023).

Referees indicated that Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd typically meets all project milestones and demonstrate excellent time management. The contractor has the ability to utilise and allocate resources within all projects that they deliver, resulting in good outcomes with minimal disruption to relevant stakeholders. They also manage environmental and safety matters well on site.

Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd has previously completed the Keene Street Road Reconstruction – Stage 1, the Ernest Grant Park Car Park, Play Space & Skate Park, several stages of the Kerr Road Reconstruction, and the Elizabeth Mitchell & Thurgoona Drive Intersection Realignment for Council. These projects were completed to a high standard.

Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd submitted a 23 week works program, with a detailed methodology explaining all required construction activities, property access and traffic management. Their methodology identifies staging to limit road closure and to maintain traffic flow to the AWMC and residential property access. The company has also provided Quality, WHS and Environmental policies as part of their submission.

All staff employed and subcontractors used are locally based, with 100% of materials, plant and equipment sourced from the local region. The company has also listed several local community groups, sporting groups and fundraising events which they sponsor.

Hutchinson Civil Pty Ltd is a locally based company that has undertaken various similar road reconstruction projects throughout the local region, including works for AlburyCity. They specialise in road construction, earthworks, and culvert works projects.

Their current work commitments include the Walla Solar Farm Construction (expected completion July 2023), the Howlong UPA facilities (expected completion August 2023) and the AWMC Materials Recovery Facility (subcontracted works, expected completion December 2023).

Referee reports indicated that Hutchinson Civil Pty Ltd met all project milestones and complete works ahead of schedule. The contractor is well-resourced and is capable of delivering high-quality products. They are highly regarded for their cooperation and effective management of subcontractors. Worksite safety and environmental factors were consistently prioritised and effectively managed.

Hutchinson Civil Pty Ltd has previously completed works for AlburyCity, which includes the Keene Street Road Reconstruction - Stage 2 and the Centaur Road Footpath Project. These projects have all been undertaken to a high standard.

Hutchinson Civil Pty Ltd has proposed a 15 week works program, which appears optimistic in comparison to Council's estimated time frame. Hutchinson Civil Pty Ltd submitted a basic methodology outlining the key components of the project.

All staff employed and subcontractors used are locally based, with 100% of materials, plant and equipment sourced from the local region. The company also provides sponsorship to several local sporting groups and community events.

Cartwright Civil Contracting Pty Ltd is a locally based company that has undertaken numerous projects throughout the Albury Wodonga region including AlburyCity, although they have not completed any recent work for Council.

Their current work commitments include the Lakeside Development Stage 2 (expected completion June 2023), Victoria Cross Parade, Wodonga (expected completion July 2023), Eastern View Estate, East Albury (expected completion June 2023), and Watson Road, Griffith (expected completion July 2023).

Referee information indicated that Cartwright Civil Pty Ltd met the required project milestones and were satisfactory with regard to project management and staff cooperation. The information provided highlighted that improvements could be achieved with regard to attention to detail in the delivery of projects. Worksite safety, environmental factors, and quality of deliveries were noted to be adequately managed.

Cartwright Civil Pty Ltd has provided a 22 week works program with a basic level of detail. Their methodology included limited information relating to traffic staging and maintenance of property access, which was requested in the RFT documentation. The company has provided an Environmental Management Plan and Project Management Plan as part of their submission.

Cartwright Civil Pty Ltd indicated that majority of the materials, plant equipment and labour will be sourced locally. The company also contributes to the local community through sporting club sponsorship within the local area.

From the information provided, all companies demonstrate the required management systems, experience, construction plant, resources, and availability to provide AlburyCity with a quality product.

Quantitative Assessment (100%)

The lump sum tender prices and ratings relative to the lowest price are tabulated below.

Company	Estimated Contract Value (including GST)	Rating (100)
Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd	$1,920,191.90	100
Hutchinson Civil Pty Ltd	$2,153,654.80	89
Cartwright Civil Contracting Pty Ltd	$2,878,700.88	67

The budget allocation for the project is $2.42M (including GST), with two submissions within the allocated budget.

As detailed above, the submission from Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd was the most favourable from a cost perspective, being $233K (12%) more favourable than Hutchinson Civil Pty Ltd and $958K (50%) more favourable than Cartwright Civil Contracting Pty Ltd.

Risk

- **Business Risk** – financial risks are possible if latent/unknown construction issues are encountered. Geotechnical investigations, location of existing services, as well as environmental investigations have been undertaken to reduce this risk.

- **Corporate Risk** – this project is located on Centaur Road with a high user group (both members of the public and Council operators) accessing the AWMC and the Albury Animal Care Centre and as such, will be visible to the community. The completion of this project will provide safe travel for vehicles along this section of road, as well as improved pedestrian access. The risk area is considered low.

- **WHS and Public Risk** – WHS risks due to the construction works will be controlled in accordance with AlburyCity procedures. The contractor will be WHS registered with AlburyCity and will be required to implement relevant Safe Work Method Statements and undergo safety inspections. The contractor will implement traffic management plans to provide a safe environment for the worksite and the community.

- **Environmental Risk** – a Review of Environmental Factors (REF) and associated studies has been undertaken for these works to identify any risks and suitable measures to mitigate them. The proposed footprint of the works has been minimised to assist in mitigating the environmental impact with a total of 22 trees proposed for removal and a further 19 having their protection zone impacted by 20% or less. The REF ultimately determined that the risks identified were considered low. Sediment and Erosion control practices will be implemented to reduce these risks.

- **Delivery Program Risk** – standard risks associated with construction are possible, including delays due to inclement weather and changes due to latent/unknown construction issues. However, the work site is a constructed environment with existing drainage and pavement providing good access, hardstands, and drainage of the site, minimising down time. Site investigations have been undertaken during the design and planning phase, with results indicating the risk to delivery is low.

Community Engagement

The project is consistent with various themes within the Towards Albury 2050 Community Strategic Plan, which has undergone extensive community consultation prior to adoption.

The project aligns with several outcomes contained within Towards Albury 2050 including:

1.1 Albury is a liveable city supporting sustainable population growth through the provision of high-quality infrastructure, industry leading services and high levels of amenity.

1.1.1 Responsibly provide residential and commercial development options for our growing city, whilst prioritising sustainability.

1.2 Albury *has an accessible, integrated transport network that connects our city through safe and efficient travel options.*

1.2.1 Effectively plan, upgrade, and maintain our network of roads, bridges, cycleways, footpaths, walkways, and street lighting.

The project was subsequently included in the 2023/24 Delivery Program, which was endorsed by Council following extensive community consultation.

Summary

The scoring for the qualitative and quantitative assessment is summarised in the following table:

Company	Quantitative	Qualitative
Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd	100	91
Hutchinson Civil Pty Ltd	89	80
Cartwright Civil Contracting Pty Ltd	67	63

From the qualitative assessment, all companies have the required management systems, experience, resources, and availability to successfully undertake this project. The submission from Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd was considered the most favourable in terms of methodology and program.

From a quantitative perspective, the submission from Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd was assessed as being the most advantageous. The submission was between $233K (12%) and $958K (50%) more favourable than the other submissions and was under Council's allocated budget for this project.

Therefore, based on the qualitative and quantitative assessment, it is deemed that the submission from Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd provides the best value for Council to deliver this project.

Conclusion

Council invited tenders for Contract No. 20/02903 Centaur Road Reconstruction – Overend Street to Mudge Street and received three submissions.

Centaur Road, between Overend Street and Mudge Street, is in poor condition and requires a full road reconstruction. It forms critical infrastructure that services the Albury Waste Management Centre, the Recycling Centre, the Albury Animal Care Centre, the Lavington Sports Ground and residential properties.

The scope of works includes 716 lineal metres of existing road reconstruction including pavement reconstruction, kerb, culvert extension, stormwater drains, gravel shared path and concrete footpaths, driveways, splitter islands and watermain deviations. Installation of a road safety barrier and bicycle safety fence will also improve the safety of road users as well as pedestrians.

A qualitative and quantitative assessment indicated that Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd was the most favourable submission. Their tendered price of $1,920,191.90 (including GST) is within the budget allocation of $2,420,000 (including GST) and is considered the most advantageous for Council.

Recommendation

That Council accepts the tender from Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd for Contract No. 20/02903 for Centaur Road Reconstruction – Overend Street to Mudge Street, for the lump sum value of $1,920,191.90 (including GST).

Attachments

1. Review of Environmental Factors Report (DOC23/202875).
2. Location Plan – Centaur Road Reconstruction – Overend Street to Mudge Street (DOC23/334946).