

CM13.2. Thurgoona Drive and Elizabeth Mitchell Drive Intersection Contract No. 19/03634

DATE	28 January 2020	FIL REFERENCE	FIL19/03634-02
CONFIDENTIAL	No		
FURTHER ENQUIRIES	Andrew Lawson City Projects	PHONE	6023 8111
AUTHOR	Alan Rodgers		

Purpose of Report

To recommend a preferred contractor for the reconstruction of the Elizabeth Mitchell Drive and Thurgoona Drive Intersection, including the installation of traffic signals, through a qualitative and quantitative assessment.

Background

The existing intersection of Elizabeth Mitchell Drive and Thurgoona Drive was constructed by the Development Corporation in the 1980s to serve the growth area of Thurgoona. Its current configuration as a single lane roundabout, no longer provides the capacity to manage the required traffic volumes, particularly during the morning and afternoon peaks.

Construction of the adjacent freeway through Albury has exacerbated the traffic flows along Thurgoona Drive as it has become the principal access point to and from the growth area, schools and shopping precinct within Thurgoona.

The intersection will continue to serve the future growth areas to the north and east of Thurgoona for many years to come. Appropriate town planning ensured road reserves of a suitable width to accommodate future duplication of the roadways and enable construction of a suitably sized intersection.

A traffic study undertaken for the Elizabeth Mitchell Drive/Thurgoona Drive intersection indicated that it has reached the end of its functional life and installation of duplicated roadways with Traffic Signals will be the most favourable long-term solution, will more efficiently manage traffic flow at peak times and provide a safer environment for pedestrian and cycling traffic.

The scope of the works included in this contract is summarised below:

- Removal of existing single lane roundabout;
- Installation of duplicated intersection and approach roads to cater for future growth;
- 15,000 square metres of new asphalt;
- 12,900 square metres of new pavement;
- 525 metres of new kerbing;
- Upgrade of drainage infrastructure;
- Installation of 960 square metres of concrete splitter islands;

- Installation of traffic signals;
- Installation of new line marking and street lighting;
- Installation of 700 lineal metres of concrete footpaths; and
- Shaping and topsoiling of swale drains and verges.

Tenders were invited for Contract No.19/03634, and advertised in the Border Mail, Sydney Morning Herald and on Tenderlink. Tenders closed at 12 noon on Tuesday 10 December 2019.

The contract duration is estimated at 22 weeks and the majority of works will be completed in the 2019/20 financial year.

Council's budget allocation for the project is \$3,784K including GST (\$3,014K in the 2019/2020 year and \$770K in the 2020/2021 year), which includes provision for project management and administration, Transport for New South Wales surveillance and community awareness program.

Location plans are attached for information.

Tender Assessment

At the close of tenders, submissions were received from the following two companies:

- AP Delaney & Co Pty Ltd (Albury NSW); and
- Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd (Wodonga VIC).

All tenders were evaluated in accordance with Council's Procurement Policy and Guidelines. The assessment panel for the tender comprised:

- Acting Coordinator Procurement and Contract Management – Pat Maling;
- Senior Engineering Designer – Alan Rodgers; and
- Interim Team Leader Projects – Anthony Bisignano.

Conformity Check

A conformity assessment was undertaken to ensure all submissions received were in accordance with the contract documentation and specification.

Company	Pricing Details	Supporting Information	WHS Documentation	Comment
AP Delaney & Co Pty Ltd	Yes	Yes	Yes	Conforming
Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd	Yes	Yes	Yes	Conforming

As indicated above, both submissions were assessed as conforming tenders, with both companies being WHS registered with Council.

Qualitative Assessment

A qualitative assessment considered a range of issues including:

- Past performance – including referee checks, relevant experience and expertise in performing same or similar projects;
- Methodology and program – project methodology and proposed program;
- Capacity – current and future commitments and workload;
- Capability – including availability of resources, equipment and contract management capabilities; and
- Benefit to local region – social and community benefit to the Albury/Wodonga region.

Company	Past Performance (35%)	Methodology & Program (25%)	Capacity (20%)	Capability (10%)	Local Benefit (10%)	Total (100%)
Excell Gray Bruni	30	22	16	9	7	84
AP Delaney	28	18	15	9	8	78

Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd is a locally based company and has undertaken a number of similar projects throughout New South Wales and Victoria. Recently the company has completed High, South and Bond Street reconstruction in Wodonga, and Drome Street, Alexandra Street and Borella Road roundabout for Bunnings Group in Albury. Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd also successfully completed all previous stages of Kerr Road (Stages 1-5).

Their current work commitments listed include Moama Intersections for RMS (expected completion February 2021) and Wither Lane Reconstruction for Mansfield Shire Council (expected to be completed January 2020). They have recently been awarded contracts with AlburyCity for the construction of Wagga Road Stages 2A and 2B, and Kerr Road Stage 6.

Referee information indicated that the company typically completed projects to a high standard on or before the date of practical completion. The company has good coordination procedures and is professional in managing the construction site, their suppliers and subcontractors.

Overall, Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd's standard of works and procedures has been to a high standard on similar projects for AlburyCity including Kerr Road Reconstruction Stages 1-5 and the Wagga Road Beautification Project – Stage 1. The company has extensive experience on similar projects.

The company has submitted a detailed works methodology, outlining their intended works methods and staging of the project. The attached works program provided a clear timeline of works and indicated a contract period of 16 weeks. The company has submitted an extensive range of their management systems including Safe Work Method Statements, Environmental Management System, Workplace Health and Safety Management System, and Quality Management System.

Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd have indicated that should they be awarded this tender, 100% of the materials, plant and labour will be sourced from the local region. The company has also listed local community groups, sporting groups and fundraising events which they sponsor.

A P Delaney & Co Pty Ltd is a locally based company and has undertaken a number of similar projects in Victoria and New South Wales. Recently the company has completed Brooklyn Fields residential estate stages 1A & 1B, Travelstop Way Roundabout and Nexus Industrial Estate Stage 1 for AlburyCity, and a Carpark and hardstand for Wilson Transformers.

Their current listed commitments include a number of large-scale projects, Ettamogah Rail Hub – Siding Extension (expected to be completed in February 2020), Brooklyn Fields – Stage 2 (expected to be completed in June 2020) Monument Hill Redevelopment (expected to be completed in March 2020) and Central Place Townhouses in Wodonga (expected to be completed in April 2020).

Referee information indicated the company completed projects to a very high standard and typically completed projects within the allocated time frames. The company is quick to respond to scope changes and is very professional in operation.

A P Delaney & Co Pty Ltd's work and procedures have met high standards on similar past projects for AlburyCity (Nexus Industrial Subdivision Stage 1 and Travelstop Way roundabout).

The company has indicated a contract period of 16 weeks within their submission, provided a brief construction methodology but a detailed program of works. The company listed an extensive amount of equipment available and robust management systems.

A P Delaney & Co Pty Ltd have indicated within their submission that should they be awarded this contract, 100% of the suppliers, subcontractors and materials for this project would be sourced locally. A P Delaney & Co Pty Ltd also noted a significant number of community groups, sports teams and events for which they provide sponsorship within the local region, as well as a history of providing opportunities for Engineering students to gain valuable work experience within the construction industry. They have also indicated they would put on two additional full-time positions for this contract.

It should be noted that both contractors have submitted a construction program of 16 weeks, however on assessment, Council staff consider a program of 22 weeks is more realistic. This assessment takes into consideration supply and installation long lead time items such as street lighting and traffic signal infrastructure, traffic control requirements at the site and the Easter break which will fall within the program.

From the information provided, both companies demonstrate the required management systems, experience, construction plant, resources and availability to provide AlburyCity with a quality product.

Quantitative Assessment (100%)

The lump sum tender prices and ratings relative to the lowest price are tabulated below.

Company	Contract Value inc GST	Rating (100)
Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd	\$3,406,101.05	100
AP Delaney & Co Pty Ltd	\$4,667,815.90	73

The budget allocation for the project is \$3,784K including GST, with one submission being within the allocated budget.

As detailed above, the submission from Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd was the most favourable from a cost perspective, being \$1.26M (37%) more favourable than AP Delaney & Co Pty Ltd.

Risk

- Business Risk – financial risks are possible if latent/unknown construction issues are encountered; a geotechnical investigation, services potholing as well as environmental investigations have been undertaken to mitigate this risk.
- Corporate Risk – the project is located within one of the primary growth corridors of the Albury Wodonga region and as such, will be highly visible to the community. The completion of this project will support both the continued development occurring in this area and Council's ongoing commitment to efficiently managing community assets. Effective traffic management during construction will be required by the contractor to meet public expectations as the roadway and intersection will need to be utilised on a daily basis for the duration of works.
- WHS and Public Risk - WHS risks due to the construction works will be controlled in accordance with AlburyCity procedures, i.e. the contractor will be WHS registered by AlburyCity and will be required to implement relevant Safe Work Method Statements and safety inspections.
- Environmental Risk – A Review of Environmental Factors (REF) was carried out as part of the assessment of proposed works; standard risks associated with construction such as vegetation removal, dust, soil and water contamination, cultural and historic heritage were identified. Measures to mitigate these items have been identified and included as part of the requirements of contract. Vegetation removal and its impact on biodiversity was assessed in a Test of Significance and found the proposed works are not likely to have a significant impact, local offset planting of any vegetation removal will mitigate these impacts.
- Delivery Program Risk - standard risks associated with construction are possible, i.e. delays due to inclement weather and changes due to latent/unknown construction issues. However, the majority of the construction is scheduled to occur during autumn, existing drainage and pavement can be utilised and site investigations have been undertaken during the design and

planning phase. Furthermore, co-ordination of works with Transport for New South Wales (TfNSW) will be critical to the seamless delivery of this project. TfNSW are responsible for the installation and operation of the traffic signal component of the project, providing signalling design criteria and supervision of installation through an approved subcontractor. Delays in provision of third-party services could pose a risk to the completion of works in a timely manner. This will be managed by ensuring the appropriate TfNSW representative is kept abreast of the progress of the project and provided with the information within the required timeframes.

Community Engagement

This project is within a major growth corridor of the city and is included as an initiative within the Thurgoona Wirlinga Structure Plan, Council's Infrastructure Contributions Plan and is consistent with various themes within The Community Strategic Plan - Albury 2030, all of which have undergone extensive community consultation prior to adoption. The project was subsequently included in the 2019/20 Delivery Program, which was endorsed by Council following the extensive community consultation.

Summary

The scoring for the qualitative and quantitative assessment is summarised in the following table:

Company	Quantitative	Qualitative
Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd	100	84
AP Delaney & Co Pty Ltd	73	78

From the qualitative assessment, both companies have the required management systems, experience, resources and availability to successfully undertake this project.

From a quantitative perspective the submission from Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd was assessed as being the most advantageous. Their submission was \$1.26M (37%) more favourable than the other submission, and generally in accordance with Council's estimate.

Therefore, based on the qualitative and quantitative assessments, it is deemed that the submission from Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd provides the best value for Council to deliver this project.

Conclusion

Council invited tenders for Elizabeth Mitchell Drive Thurgoona Drive Intersection Reconstruction and received two submissions. Tender submissions were received from Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd and AP Delaney Pty Ltd.

The intersection of Elizabeth Mitchell Drive and Thurgoona Drive has reached its traffic carrying capacity at peak times and requires upgrading to a duplicated intersection to cater for current and future growth of the area. Installation of Traffic Signals will provide for a more efficient traffic flow at peak times, and provide a safer environment for pedestrian and cycling traffic.

The scope of contract works includes removal of existing roundabout and approach roads, construction of new duplicated intersection and approach roads, upgrading of drainage, installation of traffic signals, line marking and street lighting.

A quantitative and qualitative assessment indicated that Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd was the most favourable submission. Their tendered price of \$3,406,101.05 including GST is within the budget allocation of \$3,784K including GST.

Exell Gray Bruni has recently been awarded two other major road projects for AlburyCity to be undertaken at the same time as these works. While the close proximity of these projects will deliver operational efficiencies, current commitments for Excell Gray Bruni were considered. Following assessment of the required resourcing to deliver all three projects (should they be awarded this contract), it is considered that Excell Gray Bruni are of a sufficient size and scale to provide adequate resources to deliver all projects.

Recommendation

That Council accept the tender from Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd for Contract No. 19/03634 - Elizabeth Mitchell Drive and Thurgoona Drive Intersection Reconstruction, in the lump sum amount of \$3,406,101.05 including GST.

Attachments

1. Site Plan – Elizabeth Mitchell Drive Thurgoona Drive intersection. (DOC20/4850)
2. Concept Plan – Elizabeth Mitchell Drive Thurgoona Drive intersection. (DOC20/13477)