

CM13.3. Keene Street Reconstruction Stage 2 (Alexandra Street to Borella Road) Contract No. 22/00942

DATE	27 April 2022	FIL REFERENCE	FIL22/00942-02
CONFIDENTIAL	No		
FURTHER ENQUIRIES	Andrew Lawson City Projects	PHONE	02 6023 8111
AUTHOR	Henry Clark		

Purpose of Report

To recommend a preferred contractor for the reconstruction of Keene Street, from Alexandra Street to Borella Road, through a qualitative and quantitative assessment.

Background

AlburyCity is committed to maintaining its infrastructure and providing the community with improved roads and parking across AlburyCity.

Keene Street is in East Albury, between North Street and Borella Road, providing a major link from the Hume Freeway to the industrial zones of North Albury. Keene Street also provides access to the major recreation and sporting facilities of Lauren Jackson Sports Centre, Les O'Brien Sports Precinct, Ian Barker Sporting Fields, and the Albury off-leash dog park.

The road pavement, centre medians, and adjacent footpath of Keene Street are currently in poor condition and at the end of their service life; they require replacement and upgrading to current standards to provide safe access for the community.

Existing parking and pedestrian facilities are separated and do not link pedestrians to existing facilities. Upgrading the existing footpath and construction of a new footpath with pedestrian crossing points will provide a crucial link between major recreational facilities, parking, and public transport locations.

Stage 1 of these upgrade works was completed in 2021 between North Street and Alexandra Street. This included the removal and replacement of all road pavement, centre median, existing footpath and driveways, as well as installation of a new footpath on the western side with road crossings, vegetated median, large trees and landscaping.

Stage 2 of these upgrade works will extend from the previous stage, at Alexandra Street and continue to the Borella Road service road. The scope of works for this stage is summarised below:

- 355m of road reconstruction including new kerb, pavement and asphalt surface;
- reconstructed centre medians with landscaping works and installation of shade trees;
- turn lanes at intersections for improved safety;

- installation of a 2-metre-wide footpath adjacent to the Albury off-leash dog park and Ian Barker Sporting Fields on the western side of the road;
- replacement of existing footpath and driveways on the east side of the road;
- formalised pedestrian crossing points across Keene Street for improved safety;
- installation of new street lighting for stage 1 and 2 on the western side of the road;
- additional drainage infrastructure and associated works; and
- associated line marking and signage, which will include designated bike lanes in both directions.

Tenders were invited for Contract No. 22/00942 – Keene Street Reconstruction Stage 2 and advertised in The Border Mail and on Tenderlink. Tenders closed at 12 noon on Tuesday 22 March 2022.

The contract duration is estimated at 20 weeks and will be completed in the 2022/23 financial year.

Council's budget allocation for the project is \$1.54M (including GST).

A location plan is included with this report as attachment 1.

Tender Assessment

At the close of tenders, submissions were received from the following companies:

- A P Delaney & Co Pty Ltd;
- Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd;
- Hutchinson Civil Pty Ltd; and
- Kingsline Pty Ltd.

All tenders were evaluated in accordance with Council's Procurement Policy and Guidelines and in consultation with the Procurement Services Team Leader – Elisha Lieschke. The Assessment Panel for the tender comprised Senior Project Engineer – Kyal Sharpe, Senior Designer – Alan Rodgers, Sourcing Coordinator – Brooke Starkey and Trainee Civil Engineer – Henry Clark.

Conformity Check

A Conformity Assessment was undertaken to ensure all submissions received were in accordance with the contract documentation and specification.

Company	Pricing Details	Supporting Information	WHS Documentation	Conforming
A P Delaney & Co Pty Ltd	✓	✓	✓	WHS Registered
Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd	✓	✓	✓	WHS Registered
Hutchinson Civil Pty Ltd	✓	✓	✓	WHS Registered

Kingsline Pty Ltd	✓	✓	✓	Provided WHS Documentation
-------------------	---	---	---	----------------------------

As indicated above, all submissions were assessed as conforming tenders, and all companies are WHS registered with Council, or have provided sufficient documentation to display their ability to become WHS registered with Council.

Qualitative Assessment

A qualitative assessment considered a range of issues including:

- past performance – including referee checks, relevant experience, and expertise in performing same or similar projects;
- methodology and program – project methodology and proposed program;
- capacity – current and future commitments and workload;
- capability – including availability of resources, equipment, and contract management capabilities; and
- benefit to local region – social and community benefit to the Albury/Wodonga region.

Company	Past Performance (30%)	Methodology & Program (30%)	Capacity (15%)	Capability (15%)	Local Benefit (10%)	Total (100%)
Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd	30	24	13	15	8	90
A P Delaney & Co Pty Ltd	30	18	12	15	8	83
Hutchinson Civil Pty Ltd	24	26	12	14	7	83
Kingsline Pty Ltd	18	20	10	8	4	60

Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd is a locally based company and has undertaken several similar road projects throughout Albury, Wodonga, and the local region. As a company, they specialise in road reconstruction and streetscape works.

Referee information indicated that Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd typically display proficient time management in highly sensitive worksites and provide appropriate resource levels to undertake the project at hand. They demonstrate a high level of co-operation and responsiveness to achieve set outcomes and respond in a timely manner to public concerns. Safety and environmental factors were noted to be well managed.

Their current work commitments include Albury Riverside Precinct for AlburyCity (expected to be completed in December 2022), Yackandandah Rail Trail (expected to be completed in April 2022), the High-Country Rail Trail (expected to be completed in April 2022) and Ernest Grant Park Redevelopment for AlburyCity (expected to be completed in July 2022).

Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd previously completed the first stage of the Keene Street Reconstruction, several stages of the Kerr Road Reconstruction including the most recent Stage 6, Thurgoona Drive and Elizabeth Mitchell Drive Intersection Reconstruction, and Wagga Road Reconstruction Stage 1 and 2. These projects were completed to a high standard.

Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd propose a 20 week works program, with a detailed methodology explaining all required construction activities, property access and traffic management. Their methodology closes sections of Keene Street as required whilst maintaining the public bus route and property access for residents. The company has also provided Quality, WHS, and Environmental policies as part of their submission.

All staff and subcontractors employed are locally based, with 100% of materials being sourced locally. The company has also listed several local community groups, sporting groups and fundraising events which they sponsor.

A P Delaney Pty Ltd is based locally and they have undertaken several similar projects throughout Albury, Wodonga, and the local region over many years.

Referee reports indicate A P Delaney Pty Ltd typically meet all milestones and complete projects ahead of schedule. Staff are well trained, approachable, and co-operative and sub-contractors are managed adequately. Worksite safety was well managed at all times, and a high quality of finish was achieved.

Their current work commitments listed include Brooklyn Fields Stage 4 (expected to be completed in December 2022), Baranduda Fields Civil Work (expected to be completed in June 2022) and Corowa Saleyards Upgrade (expected to be completed in November 2022).

A P Delaney Pty Ltd has previously undertaken work for AlburyCity, completing the Albury Monument redevelopment and Glenmorus Gardens Roadway in 2020. These projects were completed to a high standard and on schedule.

A P Delaney Pty Ltd propose a 17 week works program with a basic level of detail, the supplied methodology addresses key construction activities, however, is limited in detail; they have indicated they intend to work in four sections to minimise impact to traffic and local residents. Their intended traffic control method is for closure of the road in sections for the duration of the works, whilst providing access for public buses and residential properties. A company Environmental Management Plan was provided as part of their submission.

All staff and sub-contractors employed are locally based, with 100% of materials for this project to be sourced locally. The company provides sponsorship to an extensive number of sporting and community groups and fundraising events.

Hutchinson Civil Pty Ltd is based locally and has completed a range of similar projects in the region.

Referee reports indicate Hutchinson Civil Pty Ltd typically meet all milestones and complete projects ahead of schedule to a very high standard. Staff are well trained, approachable, and co-operative and sub-contractors managed adequately; worksite safety was well managed at all times.

Their current work commitments listed include Lutheran Aged Care West Albury (expected to be completed in December 2022), Culcairn – Holbrook Road Reconstruction (expected to be completed in April 2022) and Wagga Road Subdivision (expected to be completed in April 2022).

Hutchinson Civil Pty Ltd is currently completing concrete works at Wonga Wetlands for AlburyCity and works at the Albury Waste Management Centre (AWMC) under the Earthworks and Plant Hire Panel Contract. Previously, they have completed Ross Circuit and Balston Street Drainage for AlburyCity. These projects were completed to a high standard and on schedule.

Hutchinson Civil Pty Ltd provided a 16 week works program, with the inclusion of key tasks and milestones. They have indicated they intend to work in sections to minimise impact to traffic and local residents. The submitted methodology contained sufficient detail, aligning with standard road reconstruction methodology. Hutchinson Civil Pty Ltd propose to close sections of Keene Street as required whilst maintaining the public bus route and property access.

All staff and sub-contractors employed are locally based, with 100% of materials being sourced locally. The company has also listed several local community groups, sporting groups and fundraising events which they sponsor.

Kingsline Pty Ltd is a Sydney company based in Greenfield Park, NSW. They have listed experience in road construction, reconstruction and streetscape works within the Sydney area. It is noted that the company was registered in 2021, this proposes a level of risk to Council as the company has not demonstrated stability over a significant period of time.

Referee reports indicate that Kingsline Pty Ltd typically meet all milestones and complete projects on schedule. Staff are well trained, approachable, and sub-contractors are managed adequately. However, referees indicated that at times worksite safety and communication needed additional focus.

Their current work commitments include the construction of Kent Street Shared Path, Tamworth (expected to be completed in March 2022).

Kingsline Pty Ltd has not previously completed work for AlburyCity.

Kingsline Pty Ltd provided an 18 week works program, with the inclusion of key tasks and milestones. They have indicated they intend to work in three sections to minimise impact to local traffic and residents. Their submission follows standard road reconstruction methodology, however, includes an undesirable longitudinal pavement join. Their methodology closes sections of Keene Street as required, whilst maintaining the public bus route and property access.

Kingsline Pty Ltd do not have an office in Albury Wodonga. They indicated that 50-60% of sub-contractors and 70% of materials will be sourced locally, with management from outside the region. Kingsline Pty Ltd indicate they do provide sponsorships, however, did not provide a list of any in the local region.

From the information provided, all companies demonstrate the required management systems, experience, construction plant, resources, and availability to provide AlburyCity with a quality product.

Quantitative Assessment (100%)

The lump sum tender prices and ratings relative to the lowest price are tabulated below.

Company	Contract Value (including GST)	Rating (100)
Hutchinson Civil Pty Ltd	\$1,560,733.90	100
A P Delaney & Co Pty Ltd	\$1,757,250.00	89
Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd	\$1,769,355.50	88
Kingsline Pty Ltd	\$2,759,367.01	57

The budget allocation for the project is \$1.54M (including GST), with all submissions being greater than the allocated budget. The shortfall in funding will be accommodated by adjusting the 2022/23 capital budget program.

As detailed above, the submission from Hutchinson Civil Pty Ltd is the most favourable from a cost perspective, being \$196.5K (11%) more favourable than A P Delaney & Co Pty Ltd, \$208.6K (12%) more favourable than Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd, and \$1.2M (43%) more favourable than Kingsline Pty Ltd.

Risk

- **Business Risk** – Financial risks are possible if latent/unknown construction issues are encountered. Location of existing services, as well as environmental investigations have been undertaken to reduce this risk.
- **Corporate Risk** – This project is located on a high use road within East Albury and as such, will be visible to the community. The completion of this project will provide safe travel for vehicles accessing the industrial area, and pedestrians using the sporting facilities. Residents of Keene Street and surrounds will be provided with a safer road and improved amenity, and this is part of Council's ongoing commitment to efficiently and effectively managing community assets. This risk area is considered low.
- **WHS and Public Risk** – WHS risks due to the construction works will be controlled in accordance with AlburyCity procedures. The contractor will be WHS registered with AlburyCity and will be required to implement relevant Safe Work Method Statements and undergo safety inspections. The contractor will implement Traffic Control management plans to provide a safe environment for the worksite and the community.

- **Environmental Risk** – A Review of Environmental Factors (REF) has been undertaken for these works to identify any risks and suitable measures to mitigate them; the risks identified were considered low. Sediment and Erosion control practices will be implemented to reduce these risks.
- **Delivery Program Risk** – Standard risks associated with construction are possible, including delays due to inclement weather and changes due to latent/unknown construction issues. However, the work site is a constructed environment with existing drainage and pavement providing good access, hardstands, and drainage of the site, minimising down time. Site investigations have been undertaken during the design and planning phase, with results indicating the risk to delivery is low.

Community Engagement

This project is in East Albury, between North Street and Borella Road, providing a major link from the Hume Freeway to the industrial zones of North Albury. Keene Street also provides access to the major recreation and sporting facilities of Lauren Jackson Sports Centre, Les O'Brien Sports Precinct, Ian Barker Sporting Fields, and the Albury off-leash dog park. The project is consistent with various themes within the Community Strategic Plan - Albury 2030, all of which have undergone extensive community consultation prior to adoption. The project was subsequently included in the 2021/22 Delivery Program, which was endorsed by Council following extensive community consultation.

The project is listed on Council's website (Major Projects & Works Section) with advanced notification letters already provided to residents and landlords. Further formal notification to residents of Keene Street and user groups of Alexandra Park will be provided once the tender has been awarded. Council's Project Delivery staff will continue to work with the contractor to minimise disruption and advise residents and user groups as the project progresses.

Summary

The scoring for the qualitative and quantitative assessment is summarised in the following table:

Company	Quantitative	Qualitative
Hutchinson Civil Pty Ltd	100	83
A P Delaney & Co Pty Ltd	89	83
Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd	88	90
Kingsline Pty Ltd	57	60

From the qualitative assessment, all companies have the required management systems, experience, resources, and availability to successfully undertake this project. It is noted that Kingsline Pty Ltd presents a possible risk to AlburyCity due to their short period of company registration and experience.

From a quantitative perspective, the submission from Hutchinson Civil Pty Ltd was assessed as being the most advantageous, being \$196K (11%) more favourable than the submission from A P Delaney & Co Pty Ltd.

Therefore, based on the qualitative and quantitative assessments, it is deemed that the submission from Hutchinson Civil Pty Ltd provides the best value for Council to deliver this project.

Conclusion

Council invited tenders for Keene Street Reconstruction Stage 2 and received four submissions.

Keene Street, between North Street and Borella Road, is in poor condition and requires renewal and upgrade. Stage 1, the section from North Street to Alexandra Street was reconstructed in 2021. This project encompasses reconstruction of the remaining section of Keene Street, between Alexandra Street and the Borella Road service road.

The scope of works includes 355 lineal metres of existing roadway reconstruction, including all pavement, kerb, footpath, and driveways. A new shared path is to be installed along the western side of the road, along with landscaped centre medians. Installation of turn lanes and pedestrian crossing points will improve safety.

A quantitative and qualitative assessment indicated that Hutchinson Civil Pty Ltd was the most favourable submission. Their tendered price of \$1,560,733.90 (including GST) represents the best value for Council to deliver this project and is consistent with Council's project estimate.

Recommendation

That Council accepts the tender from Hutchinson Civil Pty Ltd for Contract No. 22/00942 – Keene Street Reconstruction Stage 2 for the lump sum amount of \$1,560,733.90 (including GST).

Attachments

1. Location Plan – Keene Street Reconstruction (DOC22/84877).
2. Review of Environmental Factors (DOC22/31333).