CM13.5. Noreuil Park Amenities Upgrade Contract No. 21/01457

DATE	20 July 2021	**FIL REFERENCE**	FIL21/01457-02
CONFIDENTIAL	No		
FURTHER ENQUIRIES	Andrew Lawson City Projects	**PHONE**	6023 8111
AUTHOR	Anthony Bisignano		

Purpose of Report

To recommend to Council a preferred contractor for the construction of Noreuil Park Amenities Upgrade, through a qualitative and quantitative assessment.

Background

The Noreuil Park foreshore is one of the most popular locations in Albury for locals and tourists to visit. Accessed by around 600,000 visitors each year, the foreshore is used as a base for swimming, walking, cycling, picnicking, canoeing and other recreational activities. With the recently completed Noreuil Park improvements, and the Riverside Precinct development works which will commence shortly, the Noreuil Park foreshore is ever increasing as a premier destination in Albury.

The Noreuil Park foreshore includes the building commonly known as the Riverdeck Café. It houses the Riverdeck Café and the Mitta Mitta Canoe Club. The building has public toilet amenities which are used by the Riverdeck Café. This building was originally constructed in 2003 with a major extension performed in 2015 on the Riverdeck Café portion of the building. The toilet amenities have remained unchanged since their original construction in 2003.

Considering their age, the current toilet amenities have a series of minor non-conformances to both the National Construction Code and AS1428.1:2009 'Design for Access and Mobility'. In addition, they are not in line with the requirements of the Council endorsed Public Toilet Strategy. With the recent redevelopments along Noreuil Park foreshore, the toilet amenities are due for improvement to match the user experience expectations for the area.

The scope of the works included in this contract is summarised below:

- access and mobility improvements to the existing ramp and stairs;
- full refurbishment of the amenities portion of the existing building to incorporate new disabled toilet, unisex ambulant toilet, male and female toilets, including ambulant facilities and change rooms, and a separate baby change facility; and
- the provision of hot water to the toilet amenities.

The intent is that whilst the upgrade works are being undertaken and the amenities are closed, the contractor will provide accessible temporary amenities for the patrons of the Riverdeck Café and Riverside Precinct.

Tenders were invited for Contract No.21/01457 – Noreuil Park Amenities Upgrade, and advertised in the Border Mail, Sydney Morning Herald and on Tenderlink. Tenders closed at 12 noon on Tuesday 22 June 2021.

The contract duration is estimated at 17 weeks and will be completed in the 2021/22 financial year.

Council's budget allocation for the project is $250K including GST. This budget allocation was determined in 2019 and was based on refurbishment of the existing floor plan only, prior to Council's endorsement of the Public Toilet Strategy in 2020. Quantity Surveyors, Donald Cant Watts Corke provided a revised cost plan for the works in May 2021 which was $416K including GST. This revised cost plan was based on the detailed tender documentation, which incorporates the requirements of the Public Toilet Strategy endorsed by Council in 2020. This forecast cost increase is associated with substantial scope variations primarily related to changes to the existing floor plan to accommodate a separate disabled toilet, unisex toilet, and baby change room. It was always envisaged an additional budget allocation would be required to complete this project.

The proposed floor plan is attached for information (refer to attachment 1).

Tender Assessment

At the close of tenders, submissions were received from the following companies:

- Adaptive Trust Pty Ltd t/a Dezign (Albury, NSW);
- G&P Connelly Pty Ltd t/a Connelly Construction Services (Wodonga, VIC); and
- S.R. Murphy Holdings Pty Ltd t/a Murphy's Salvage & Demolition (Baranduda, VIC).

All tenders were evaluated in accordance with Council's Procurement Policy and Guidelines. The assessment panel for the tender comprised of Team Leader Project Delivery, Anthony Bisignano; Team Leader Design Services, Ian Redman, and Project Engineer, Kyal Sharpe, in consultation with Team Leader Procurement Services, Elisha Lieschke.

Conformity Check

A conformity assessment was undertaken to ensure all submissions received were in accordance with the contract documentation and specification.

Company	Pricing Details	Supporting Information	WHS Documentation	Comment
Adaptive Trust Pty Ltd t/a Dezign	**Yes**	**Yes**	**Yes**	**Conforming**
G&P Connelly Pty Ltd t/a Connelly Construction Services	**Yes**	**Yes**	**Yes**	**Conforming**
S.R. Murphy Holdings Pty Ltd t/a Murphy's Salvage & Demolition	**No**	**Yes**	**Yes**	**Non-Conforming**

As indicated above, the submissions from Dezign and Connelly Construction Services were assessed as conforming tenders, and all companies are WHS registered with Council.

The submission from Murphy's Salvage & Demolition only provided pricing for the demolition portion of the works. Considering this, the submission from Murphy's Salvage & Demolition was not further considered for this contract.

Qualitative Assessment

A qualitative assessment considered a range of issues including:

- past performance – including referee checks, relevant experience and expertise in performing same or similar projects;
- methodology and program – project work methods and proposed program timelines;
- capacity – current and future commitments and workload;
- capability – including availability of resources, expertise, equipment and contract management capabilities; and
- benefit to local region – social and community benefit to the Albury/Wodonga region.

Company	Past Performance (35%)	Methodology & Program (25%)	Capacity (20%)	Capability (10%)	Local Benefit (10%)	Total (100%)
G&P Connelly Pty Ltd t/a Connelly Construction Services	28	18	16	9	7	78
Adaptive Trust Pty Ltd t/a Dezign	23	23	15	9	7	77

Connelly Construction Services is a locally based company. Their recent projects are quite varied, from commercial developments, to assembly buildings of a public nature. A notable project outlined in their submission is the JC King Park Sports Pavilion. This project entailed the demolition of an existing sports pavilion and the construction of a new amenities block incorporating disabled access and change rooms, and an associated sports pavilion.

Connelly Construction Services' submission indicated their current work commitments include the Lavington Sports Ground Redevelopment Stage 3 Building Works for Council (anticipated completion in September 2021), the VLC Miles Building for a private developer (anticipated completion in October 2021) and the Uniting Church Wangaratta (anticipated completion July 2021).

Referee information was favourable and indicated that Connelly Construction Services deliver a quality product, are cooperative and well organised regarding their time management.

Council has extensive experience dealing with Connelly Construction Services on the JC King Park Sports Pavilion, Albury Waste Management Centre Education Centre, Albury Entertainment Centre Roof Replacement and the current Lavington Sports Ground Redevelopment Stage 3 Building Works. These projects have been undertaken with a high level of service, with a quality product being delivered, whilst maintaining minimal disruption to the relevant stakeholders.

Connelly Construction Services' submission indicated their construction program is 67 working days in duration. This is reasonable, achievable and has a logical sequence of activities.

Connelly Construction Services' submission indicated that should they be awarded this contract, a majority of the materials, plant, equipment and labour will be sourced from the local region. Their proposed key subcontractors and suppliers are all well respected in their respective fields. Their submission indicated community benefit within the local region through the sponsorship of many local sporting groups and charities local to the region.

Dezign is a locally based company. Their recent projects are primarily associated with the construction of either school facilities or childcare centres for local government. A notable project outlined in their submission is the Lake Talbot Amenities & Camp Kitchen for Narrandera Shire Council. This project entails the demolition of an existing aged amenities block and camp kitchen to clear the way for a new amenities block incorporating disabled access and family change rooms, a laundry and new camp kitchen.

Dezign's submission indicated its current work commitments include the Thurgoona Oval Sporting Pavilion for Council (anticipated completion in June 2022), Forbes Pool for Forbes Shire Council (anticipated completion in October 2021), Wollondilly Shire Hall for Wollondilly Shire Council (anticipated completion August 2021), Central West Children's Services Centre for Parkes Shire Council (anticipated completion in July 2021), Jerilderie Childcare Centre for Murrumbidgee Shire Council (anticipated completion in December 2021) and Lake Talbot Amenities & Camp Kitchen for Narrandera Shire Council (anticipated completion December 2021).

Referee information was generally favourable and indicated that Dezign deliver a quality product, are cooperative and well organised on site. One referee praised their ability to work to a fixed budget, and their ability to identify issues in design documentation before they become an issue onsite during construction.

Council has experience dealing with Dezign on the current Thurgoona Oval Sporting Pavilion. Although this project is still in the design development stages, the experience with Dezign so far has been generally positive.

Dezign's submission indicated their construction program is 62 working days in duration. This is reasonable, achievable and has a logical sequence of activities.

Dezign's submission indicated that should they be awarded this contract a majority of the materials, plant, equipment and labour will be sourced from the local region. Their proposed key subcontractors and suppliers are all well respected in their respective fields. Their submission indicated community benefit within the local region through the sponsorship of many local sporting groups and charities local to the region.

From the information provided, all companies demonstrate the required management systems, experience, construction plant, resources and availability to provide AlburyCity with a quality product.

Quantitative Assessment (100%)

The lump sum tender prices and ratings relative to the lowest price are tabulated below.

Company	Estimated Contract Value (Including GST) for Three Year Term	Rating (100)
G&P Connelly Pty Ltd t/a Connelly Construction Services	$319,160.00	100
Adaptive Trust Pty Ltd t/a Dezign	$342,430.00	93

The budget allocation for the project is $250K including GST, with no submissions being within the allocated budget. As previously noted, Council received a revised cost estimate (May 2021) of approximately $416K including GST from Donald Cant Watts Corke for the project. The submissions received are favourable in comparison to this cost plan.

As detailed above, the submission from Connelly Construction Services was the most favourable from a cost perspective, being $23K (7%), more favourable than the submission from Dezign.

Risk

- **Business Risk** – Financial risks are possible, most likely associated with scope creep or latent conditions associated with differing inground conditions than those anticipated. However, these risks have been minimised through a clearly defined scope of works and site investigations. The Coronavirus (COVID-19) pandemic, and its impact on the construction and building industry is ever evolving with shortages being observed in structural timber and increases in structural steel prices. This is in addition to the ever-changing domestic travel restrictions associated with the pandemic.

- **Corporate Risk** – Corporate risks are possible with the user experience at Noreuil Park foreshore potentially diminished during the duration of the works. These risks have been minimised by the provision of accessible temporary toilet facilities for the duration of the works.
- **WHS and Public Risk** – WHS risks due to the construction works will be controlled in accordance with AlburyCity procedures. The contractor will be WHS registered by AlburyCity and will be required to implement relevant Safe Work Method Statements and safety inspections.
- **Environmental Risk** – The contractor will be required to submit Environmental Plans, addressing environmental controls to be implemented; in particular, erosion and sediment controls, air quality, noise, etc.
- **Delivery Program Risk** – Standard delivery program risks are possible, such as delays due to inclement weather, delays due to latent conditions and contractor-caused delays.

Community Engagement

The Noreuil Park Amenities Upgrade is identified in the Council endorsed Murray River Experience Master Plan, the Noreuil Park Foreshore Master Plan, and Public Toilet Strategy all of which included extensive stakeholder engagement and a public exhibition process.

To keep the community informed of the construction process, the project will be included in the Major Projects section of the website and updates through News from AlburyCity and via social media.

The project is relevant to a number of strategic plans such as Albury 2030 and the Two Cities One Community Strategic Plan as outlined below:

1. *Albury 2030:*
   This project identifies with Albury 2030's theme of 'a caring community' and specifically, with outcome 3.4 'Albury offers a diverse and accessible range of facilities and activities for all ages'. Specifically, the delivery of this project improves access for all to the public amenities.

2. *Two Cities One Community Strategic Plan:*
   This project identifies with the Two Cities One Community Strategic Plan community aspiration of 'our community' and specifically, with outcome 3.4 'we are a caring, equitable and inclusive community'. The delivery of this project improves user experience at the Noreuil Park foreshore. As one of Albury's most popular locations, users of the Noreuil Park foreshore travel from both sides of the border including the Local Government Areas of Albury City Council, City of Wodonga, Federation Council, Indigo Shire Council, Greater Hume Council and Towong Shire.

Summary

The scoring for the qualitative and quantitative assessment is summarised in the following table:

Company	Quantitative	Qualitative
G&P Connelly Pty Ltd t/a Connelly Construction Services	100	78
Adaptive Trust Pty Ltd t/a Dezign	93	77

From the qualitative assessment, all companies have the required management systems, experience, resources, and availability to successfully undertake this project.

From a quantitative perspective the submission from Connelly Construction Services was assessed as being the most advantageous. Their submission was $23K (7%), more favourable than the submission from Dezign.

Therefore, based on the qualitative and quantitative assessments, it is deemed that the submission from Connelly Construction Services provides the best value for Council to deliver this project.

It is proposed that the budget shortfall for the project be addressed through the reallocation of $100,000 including GST from the 2021/22 Public Toilet Strategy Priorities project allocation. The reallocation of this funding will not adversely affect the delivery of the priorities identified in the Public Toilet Strategy, with $2.25M allocated over the four-year Delivery Program to implement these initiatives.

Reallocation of this funding to the Noreuil Park Amenities Upgrade will provide a holistic budget allocation of $350,000 including GST. This budget allocation is inclusive of all delivery costs, construction phase services and project management.

Conclusion

Council invited tenders for Noreuil Park Amenities Upgrade and received three submissions. The submission from Murphy's Salvage & Demolition was deemed non-conforming by the tender assessment panel.

The toilet amenities at Noreuil Park have remained unchanged since their original construction in 2003. Considering this, the current facilities are not in line with the Council endorsed Public Toilet Strategy. With the recent redevelopments along Noreuil Park foreshore, the toilet amenities are due for improvement to match the user experience expectations for the area.

The scope of the works included in this contract is summarised below:

- access and mobility improvements to the existing ramp and stairs;

- full refurbishment of the amenities portion of the existing building to incorporate new disabled toilet, unisex ambulant toilet, male and female toilets, including ambulant facilities and change rooms, and a separate baby change facility; and
- the provision of hot water to the toilet amenities.

A quantitative and qualitative assessment indicated that Connelly Construction Services was the most favourable submission. Their tendered price of $319,160.00 including GST is outside of the budget allocation of $250K including GST. It was always envisaged an additional budget allocation would be required to complete this project following a revised cost plan developed in May 2021 based on the finalised tender documentation.

It is proposed that the budget shortfall be addressed through the reallocation of $100,000 including GST to the project from the Public Toilet Strategy Priorities project allocation, which is included in Council's 2021/22 Operational Plan.

Recommendation

That Council:

a. Accepts the tender from G&P Connelly Pty Ltd t/a Connelly Construction Services for Contract No. 21/01457, the Noreuil Park Amenities Upgrade for the lump sum amount of $319,160.00 including GST; and

b. Reallocates $100,000, including GST, from the Public Toilet Strategy Priorities project to this project as part of the September quarterly budget review.

Attachments

1. Noreuil Park Amenities Upgrade Floor Plan (DOC21/161613).