CM13.3. Mowing Services for Council Parks, Reserves and Roadsides Contract No. 21/01091

DATE 26 May 2021 **FIL REFERENCE** FIL21/01091-02

CONFIDENTIAL No

FURTHER ENQUIRIES David Costello **PHONE** 6023 8111

City Landscapes

AUTHOR Mark Lee

Purpose of Report

To recommend the preferred contractors and award contracts for the provision of mowing services for Council parks, reserves and roadsides, through a qualitative and quantitative assessment.

Background

Council uses a combination of internal and external resources as part of its ongoing commitment to maintaining various parks, reserves and roadsides to a high standard. The maintenance procedures include mowing, weed control, trimming, edging and removal of debris and rubbish.

At its meeting on 12 June 2018, Council resolved to accept the tenders from three separate vendors for Separable Portions Contract No.17/01772 – Provision of Mowing Services for Council Parks, Reserves and Roadsides, for a three- year term commencing 1 July 2018 and ending 30 June 2021. With this contract approaching its end of term, Council Officers commenced procurement to secure external resources for an additional three-year period.

Tenders were invited for Contract No.21/01091 – Provision of Mowing Services for Council Parks, Reserves and Roadsides, for a three-year term commencing 1 July 2021 and ending 30 June 2024. The intention of this tender is to establish a panel of service providers that will be allocated separable portions of AlburyCity's mowing requirements and ad hoc works for this three-year period.

There are 151 individual sites identified within the new contract, which represents a minor increase to the 138 sites within the existing contract. The addition of 13 new sites has been necessary to accommodate the city's urban/parkland expansion. The sites are categorised by function, facilities and utilisation. Frequencies for maintenance to be performed and the operations to be carried out at each site are specified depending on site category, with an increased focus to be applied during periods of increased growth.

The table below lists the site categories, expected number of cuts per year and some example sites:

Category	Cuts per year	Example sites
Minor Landscape Area	9	Iluka Crescent ReserveHoffman ParkReis Park
Intermediate Landscape Area	16	 Reis Park Endeavour Park SES Building surrounds Plummer Street Park
Major Landscape Area	19	Patricia Gould ReserveCollings Park outer
Roadsides Major	12 (monthly)	Borella RoadPadman Drive mediansThurgoona Drive

It should be noted that the existing contract awarded individual sites to the three current vendors based on lowest value, which resulted in significant scattering of vendor sites across the LGA. This resulted in contract management challenges and difficulties for staff in monitoring contract performance. Based on this learning, the new contract has divided the LGA into discrete zones based on geographic context, as well as creating a separate 'roadsides' zone due to the specialty equipment required to service these roadside areas. Consequently, the new tender schedules categorised the 151 individual sites into one of the following zones based on geographic location:

- Albury;
- East Albury;
- Glenroy;
- Lake Hume Village;
- Lavington;
- North Albury;
- Roadsides General;
- South Albury;
- Springdale Heights;
- Table Top;
- Thurgoona; and
- West Albury.

The tender is considered an essential service for maintenance of the sites. Offering a three-year contract term (1 July 2021 – 30 June 2024) provides surety of service, economy of scale and minimises AlburyCity's exposure to unpredictable price rises.

The cost for the previous contracts is as follows:

- 2015 to 2018 \$696K; and
- 2018 to 2021 \$876K.

The tender is a separable portion contract with sites allocated to zones based on their geographic location. Tenders were invited in a schedule of pricing format. Vendors could apply for all zones,

multiple zones, or one zone (up to and including all nominated sites). The tender was constructed this way to avoid disadvantaging those suppliers who may not have the scale or resources to take on all, multiple or larger zones. To ensure continuity of service and for effective contact management, the new tender schedules advised that it was Council's preference that vendors apply and price for the entirety of each of the zones. The pricing quoted for this contract is fixed and in the form of a lump sum for the first 24-month period of the contract, and then subject to rise and fall in the final year.

Tenders were invited for Contract No. FIL21/01091 – Mowing Services for Council Parks Reserves and Roadsides, and advertised in The Border Mail, Sydney Morning Herald and on Tenderlink. Tenders closed at 12 noon on Thursday 6 May 2021.

The contract duration is estimated at 156 weeks and will be completed in the 2023/2024 financial year.

Council also intends to use the panel of providers established via this tender, for ad hoc mowing services using casual rates as required at other Council locations for the duration of this contract. Vendors were requested to supply a schedule of rates (per square metre) to form a panel contract for ad hoc mowing services to Council.

Tender Assessment

At the close of tenders, submissions were received from the following companies:

- Mappell Pty Ltd (Howlong NSW);
- Trevor J Jones Commercial Mowing (Albury NSW);
- UDL Group Pty Ltd (Melbourne, VIC);
- Double Gully Services Pty Ltd (Upper Gundowring, VIC); and
- Ovation Services Group Pty Ltd (Tuggerah NSW).

All tenders were evaluated in accordance with Council's Procurement Policy and in consultation with the Procurement Services Team Leader – Elisha Lieschke. The assessment panel for the tender comprised Service Leader City Landscapes – David Costello, Supervisor Parks – Mark Lee, and Leading Hand Turf & Irrigation – Walter Shannon.

Conformity Check

A conformity assessment was undertaken to ensure all submissions received were in accordance with the contract documentation and specification. All submissions were assessed as conforming tenders as outlined in the below table.

Company	Pricing Details	Supporting	WHS	Comment
		Information	Documentation	
Mappell Pty Ltd	✓	✓	✓	Conforming
				submission
Trevor J Jones	✓	✓	✓	Conforming
Commercial Mowing				submission

Ovation Services Group	✓	✓	✓	Conforming
Pty Ltd				submission
UDL Group Pty Ltd	✓	✓	✓	Conforming
				submission
Double Gully Services	✓	✓	✓	Conforming
Pty Ltd				submission

Qualitative Assessment

A qualitative assessment considered a range of issues including:

- past performance including referee checks, relevant experience and expertise in performing same or similar projects;
- methodology and program project methodology and proposed program;
- capacity current and future commitments and workload;
- capability including availability of resources, equipment and contract management capabilities; and
- benefit to local region social and community benefit to the Albury/Wodonga region.

Company	Past Performance (30%)	Methodology & Program (20%)	Capacity (20%)	Capability (20%)	Local Benefit (10%)	Total (100%)
Trevor J Jones	28	13	13	11	7	72
Commercial Mowing						
Double Gully Services	18	9	13	13	8	61
Pty Ltd						
Mappell Pty Ltd	20	9	11	13	8	61
UDL Group Pty Ltd	14	12	11	12	4	53
Ovation Services	8	4	3	7	3	25
Group Pty Ltd						

Trevor J Jones Commercial Mowing is a locally based company (Albury) and is a long-time contractor for AlburyCity, providing consistently excellent service. This company has similar contracts with Vitasoy, Hume Country Retirement Resort and Wodonga Primary School. Their plant and equipment are of recent manufacture and well maintained.

Their current work commitments include Hume Country Retirement Resort (Albury) – ongoing, NSW Government Health Murrumbidgee Local Health District (Albury) – ongoing, Wodonga Primary School (Wodonga) – ongoing, and News Printers (Wodonga) – ongoing.

Referee information indicated that the company typically is reliable, consistent and a good communicator. The standard of their plant and equipment is excellent, and they have sufficient resources to ensure all works are completed to an excellent standard in the specified timeframes. The panel considered that this company has the experience, capacity and resources to successfully fill the requirements of this contract.

Trevor J Jones Commercial Mowing is currently servicing a portion of the current mowing contract for AlburyCity, as well as performing regular ad hoc mowing for AlburyCity at various locations. Trevor J Jones Commercial Mowing consistently provides excellent service to AlburyCity.

Methodology provided included details of their proposed Works Program that will be completed on a rolling fortnightly roster to keep up to date with the required intervention dates. This rolling roster system has proven effective in meeting and exceeding timelines in the current and previous contracts.

Trevor J Jones Commercial Mowing is locally based family run business, employing local staff and procuring locally, with 100% of labour and materials sourced locally.

Double Gully Services Pty Ltd is based in Upper Gundowring Victoria and has previously completed similar contracts with Shenoc Pty Ltd (Highway/Freeway Slashing), AGL (Bogong Village and Upper Kiewa Valley) and Bonegilla Migrant Experience (City of Wodonga).

Their current work commitments include AGL (Bogong Village and Upper Kiewa Valley) – ongoing, Bonegilla Migrant Experience (City of Wodonga) – expected completion 2023, Defence Housing – expected completion 2022, as well as several ongoing contracts with local schools.

Double Gully Services Pty Ltd have serviced areas in a previous mowing contract for AlburyCity. Their performance in their last contract is rated as satisfactory, although requiring regular follow-up to ensure contract specifications were met.

Referee information indicated the company is flexible, has good time management skills and is happy to vary the contract scope if necessary. They follow instruction well and have adequate equipment to complete their current contracts. The panel considered that this company has the experience, capacity and resources to successfully fill the requirements of this contract.

Methodology provided was basic with limited content. However, the vendor is proposing to establish a designated AlburyCity Contract team consisting of two dedicated team members with two front deck mowers and a tractor and mower/slasher for big areas. An extra tractor and mower/slasher can be provided during peak growing times.

Double Gully Services Pty Ltd is locally based, employs local staff, procures 100% of labour and materials locally, and sponsors local sporting and community groups.

Mappell Pty Ltd is a current AlburyCity contractor. They are a local company based in Howlong NSW and have provided good service throughout the current contract period. Council also regularly utilises their turf management expertise and specialised turf services with highly satisfactory results. Other similar contracts undertaken by Mappell Pty Ltd include the maintenance and development of the Wodonga Golf Club and a similar maintenance contract for Alpine Shire.

Their current work commitments include Wodonga Golf Club (Wodonga) – ongoing, and Alpine Shire (Parks reserves and sports field maintenance) – ongoing.

Referee information indicated that the company meets client expectations and has good communication and time management skills. They have appropriate plant and equipment and sufficient resources to complete works during peak periods. The panel considered that this company has the experience, capacity and resources to successfully fill the requirements of this contract.

Mappell Pty Ltd is currently servicing a portion of the current mowing contract for AlburyCity, as well as performing regular turf management and specialised turf services for AlburyCity. Mappell Pty Ltd has typically provided good service to AlburyCity throughout the previous contact. However, there have been occasions where they required prompting from the AlburyCity contract manager to ensure service levels are maintained. This was mainly due to some staffing issues that have since been rectified.

Methodology provided was quite limited and only included a capability statement that referenced their turf management capabilities. However, their past performance managing the current contract demonstrates their ability to deliver the desired service.

Mappell Pty Ltd is locally based, employs local staff, procures 100% of labour and materials locally, and sponsors local sporting and community groups.

UDL Group Pty Ltd is a current AlburyCity contractor based in Melbourne that provides all types of commercial landscape services for developers, architects and local authorities, mainly in and around the Melbourne area. Recent projects of a similar type to this tender include works for Surf Coast Council and Hume City Council. They are well resourced in terms of machinery and labour, although historically in past contracts for Albury this resource component has been exclusively subcontracted.

Their current work commitments include Hume City Council – May 2016 – May 2021, Satterley Property Group – April 2013 – ongoing, and Manningham City Council – November 2021.

Referee information indicated the company's output and time management skills are excellent with strong WHS systems and reporting and auditing processes. All tasks are completed to specification and plant and equipment is suitable for the task. The panel considered that this company has the experience, capacity and resources to successfully fill the requirements of this contract. However, the reliance on local sub-contractors to complete the work has led to recent servicing issues with the current contract.

UDL Group Pty Ltd is currently servicing a portion of the current mowing contract for AlburyCity as well as performing regular ad hoc mowing for AlburyCity at various locations. UDL Group Pty Ltd provides adequate service to AlburyCity. However, they periodically require intervention from the AlburyCity contract manager to ensure service levels are maintained.

Methodology provided was a generic capability statement that referenced their extensive management systems in place to manage similar contracts. However, they are proposing to utilise a sub-contractor to service the contract. Their past performance managing the current contract with sub-contractors suggests they would have the ability to continue to deliver the desired service to an acceptable level.

UDL Group Pty Ltd is a Melbourne based Company that employs local sub-contractors and procures 100% of labour and materials locally. However, they do not currently sponsor local sporting or community groups.

Ovation Services Group Pty Ltd is based in Tuggerah NSW and has not previously undertaken any work for AlburyCity. The vendor only cited very limited relevant experience completed during the last three years (primarily related to bushfire mitigation) and did not provide a schedule of plant and equipment that would be available to support the moving works.

No methodology was provided, and it was unclear how the vendor was proposing to service this contract given they were not proposing to engage sub-contractors, and were proposing to use staff resources based in the Canberra region, offset with some local labour. The company does not sponsor local sporting or community groups, but would source ~75% of small plant and equipment locally.

The vendor rated comparatively lower in the qualitative assessment due to not having identified any specific local resources to mobilise and deliver the contract, as well as concerns about the company's limited experience in delivering this type of contract. Consequently, the panel considered that this company does not have the experience, capacity and resources to successfully fill the requirements of this contract. As such, no further assessment of Ovation Services Group's submission was made.

From the information provided, four companies (Trevor J Jones Commercial Mowing, Double Gully Services Pty Ltd, Mappell Pty Ltd, and UDL Group Pty Ltd) demonstrate the required management systems, experience, construction plant, resources and availability to provide AlburyCity with a quality product.

Quantitative Assessment (100%)

As part of the evaluation process, in order to fairly compare each submission, the lowest rate offered for each zone was assigned to the shortlisted vendor, as identified in the table below. It should be noted that Double Gully Services Pty Ltd elected to submit prices for incomplete zones in four instances (East Albury, Lavington, Thurgoona, and West Albury) as they wished not to undertake all sites within each of these zones. The evaluation panel reviewed the individual site costs in these instances and found their quoted individual site costs to be comparative to those supplied by other vendors. Therefore, to ensure continuity of service and provide for effective contract management, the panel elected to award entire zones to vendors, rather than awarding incomplete zones that would result in splitting up zones and awarding individual sites. The awarding of entire zones in this way is consistent with the tender schedules that clearly articulated Council's preference for vendors to apply and price for the entirety of each of the zones. The results are tabulated below.

Vendor	Double Gully Pty Ltd	Mappell Pty Ltd	Trevor Jones	UDL Group Pty Ltd	Lowest complete zone price	Lowest complete zone vendor
Albury Zone		\$31,925		\$26,224	\$26,224	UDL
East Albury	(\$44,179)*	\$60,500		\$61,264.50	\$60,500	Mappell

Vendor	Double Gully Pty Ltd	Mappell Pty Ltd	Trevor Jones	UDL Group Pty Ltd	Lowest complete zone price	Lowest complete zone vendor
Zone						
Glenroy Zone		\$10,710		\$15,301	\$10,710	Mappell
Lake Hume Village Zone	\$7622	\$8,220		\$ 8,602.00	\$7622	Double Gully
Lavington Zone	(\$3720)*	\$58,540		\$75,691	\$58,540	Mappell
North Albury Zone		\$17,670	\$11,766	\$20,372	\$11,766	Jones
Roadsides - General Zones	\$155,880	\$240,000		\$185,790	\$155,880	Double Gully
South Albury Zone		\$10,410	\$7260	\$ 7,881.50	\$7260	Jones
Springdale Heights Zone		\$13680	\$8119	\$12,094.50	\$8119	Jones
Table Top Zone	\$20,120	\$10,200	\$22,590	\$20,669.	\$10,200	Mappell
Thurgoona Zone	(\$14,323)*	\$21,730		\$23,232.	\$21,730	Mappell
West Albury Zone	(\$12,802)*	\$38,990		\$39,765.	\$38,990	Mappell

^{*}Note: Figures in brackets represent incomplete zones, with costings not provided for the entirety of all sites within the zone.

The table below summarises the total contract value over three years for each of the vendors whereby they submitted the lowest price for each of the complete zones:

Company	Zones	Price for 3 yrs (Including GST)
Trevor J Jones Commercial Mowing	North Albury	\$81,435.00
	South Albury	
	Springdale Heights	
Double Gully Services Pty Ltd	Lake Hume Village	\$490,506.00
	Roadsides - General	
Mappell Pty Ltd	East Albury	\$602,010.00
	Glenroy	
	Lavington	
	Table Top	
	Thurgoona	
	West Albury	
UDL Group Pty Ltd	Albury	\$78,672.00
Total	12	\$1,252,623.00

The cost for the existing contract (2018-2021) was \$876K and the cost for the contract prior to that (2015-2018) was \$696K. In relative terms, the total price of \$1,252,623 for the new contract (2021-2024) appears to represent good value for money considering the addition of 13 new sites, CPI inflation, and comparison with internal and external market rates. The total cost has been accounted for in developing current and future maintenance budgets.

Ad hoc schedule of rates

Vendors also supplied a schedule of rates (per square metre) to form a panel contract for ad hoc mowing services to Council for those areas outside of the 151 sites included in this contract. From a business continuity perspective, this will allow Council to award incidental and casual works when required (eg. high growth maintenance periods). The costs are relatively consistent as identified in the table below:

Vendor \$/M2 rate	Trevor J Jones Commercial	Double Gully Services Pty	Mappell Pty Ltd	UDL Group Pty Ltd
(Including GST)	Mowing	Ltd	Liu	Liu
Monthly (Roadsides)	\$0.012	\$0.010	\$0.012	\$0.060
Major (Irrigated parkland)	\$0.015	\$0.012	\$0.012	\$0.060
Intermediate (Non-irrigated parkland)	\$0.014	\$0.012	\$0.010	\$0.040
Minor (Laneways, walkways, medians)	\$0.012	\$0.012	\$0.020	\$0.040

Risk

- Business Risk Council's budget allocation to undertake these services is included within the
 relevant facility maintenance amounts. Financial risk is further managed through the surety of
 rates provided under the contract. Procurement requirements are managed through the
 creation of the panel contract with suitably qualified contractors.
- **Corporate Risk** The selection of contractors with the appropriate qualifications, experience and proven management systems will ensure that a consistent and high level of service is provided to the community.
- WHS and Public Risk Effective and consistent maintenance has a positive impact on WHS and public liability risks. WHS risks are controlled as the works will be controlled in accordance with AlburyCity procedures.
- Environmental Risk Work completed as part of this contact will be governed by current
 environmental policies and procedures. Each of the vendors also provided copies of their
 Environmental Management Policy and mowing procedures, to mitigate any risks to the
 environment.
- Delivery Program Risk The provision of these services will assist in reducing reactive
 maintenance ensuring more efficient use of internal resources. Having a panel of multiple
 suppliers, helps ensure business continuity and minimises the risk of 'under-servicing' for
 Council.

Community Engagement

The community have an expectation that our parks, reserves and roadsides will be maintained to a high standard. By allocating contractors to an entire zone, it will allow Council Officers to more efficiently monitor the performance of the contractor to ensure compliance with the standards outlined in the contract schedules. In instances whereby the community expectations of mowing standards are not fulfilled, the community can contact Council and provide feedback for follow-up by Council Officers.

This mowing services contract is relevant to a number of key strategic themes in the Albury 2030 Community Strategic Plan, including:

Theme One – A Growing Sustainable Economy.

1.8 Albury's infrastructure and assets are well managed and maintained.

Theme Three – A Caring Community.

- 3.2.1 Develop and implement strategies to improve community safety and amenity.
- 3.3.4 Ensure appropriate infrastructure including accessible path networks/encourage active lifestyles.
- 3.4 Albury offers a diverse and accessible range of facilities and activities for all ages.

Summary

The scoring for the qualitative and quantitative assessment is summarised in the following table:

Company	Qualitative	Quantitative \$ price for 3 years (inc GST)	Zones
Trevor J Jones Commercial Mowing	72	\$81,435.00	North Albury South Albury Springdale Heights
Double Gully Services Pty Ltd	61	\$490,506.00	Lake Hume Village Roadsides - General
Mappell Pty Ltd	61	\$602,010.00	East Albury Glenroy Lavington Table Top Thurgoona West Albury
UDL Group Pty Ltd	52	\$78,672.00	Albury
	TOTAL	\$1,252,623.00	

From the qualitative assessment, Trevor J Jones Commercial Mowing rated highly in past performance, methodology, capacity and capability. Double Gully Services Pty Ltd, Mappell Pty Ltd, and UDL Group Pty Ltd rated slightly lower. All vendors scored relatively low for their 'methodology & program' scores based on their information either being limited, or provision of generic capability statements. However, there is minimal risk associated with the low 'methodology & program' scores given vendors have been provided the intervention dates outlining when services are to be completed and a specification of required service. In summary, the tender assessment panel considered that each of these vendors has the experience, capability and resources to meet the requirements of the tender.

From a quantitative perspective, the panel awarded entire zones to vendors on the basis of complete zone lowest cost, rather than awarding incomplete zones that would result in splitting up zones and awarding individual sites. This resulted in all four vendors being awarded between one and six complete zones each, which has achieved the tender intent of having multiple suppliers to undertake the full extent of works, whilst minimising risk to Council and maximising business continuity.

Conclusion

Council invited tenders for a separable portions contract for the provision of mowing services for Council parks, reserves and roadsides. The maintenance procedures to be undertaken for the contract include mowing, weed control, trimming, edging and removal of debris and rubbish for 151 sites across AlburyCity.

The sites are categorised by function, facilities and utilisation. Frequencies for maintenance to be performed and the operations to be carried out at each site are specified depending on site category, with an increased focus to be applied during periods of increased growth.

Council also intends to use the panel of providers established via this tender, for ad hoc mowing services using casual rates as required at other Council locations for the duration of this contract.

Five vendors made submissions, some tendering for every zone and others for only some of the zones. A qualitative and quantitative assessment was undertaken, revealing that the following four vendors have the required expertise, resources and experience to undertake the contract:

- Trevor J. Jones Mowing Services;
- Double Gully Services Pty Ltd;
- Mappell Pty Ltd; and
- UDL Group Pty Ltd.

These vendors were assessed as having met all requirements stipulated in the tender scope and specification, as well as providing the most favourable price for the respective zones. This resulted in all four vendors being awarded between one and six complete zones each, which has achieved the tender intent of having multiple suppliers to undertake the full extent of works, whilst minimising risk to Council and maximising business continuity.

The tender is considered an essential service for maintenance of the sites. Offering a three-year contract term (1 July 2021 – 30 June 2024) provides surety of service, economy of scale and minimises AlburyCity's exposure to unpredictable price rises.

Recommendation

a. That Council accepts the tenders from the respective companies as listed in the following table for Separable Portions Contract No.21/01091 - Provision of Mowing Services for Council Parks, Reserves and Roadsides, for a three-year term commencing 1 July 2021 and ending 30 June 2024, for the lump sum amount of \$1,252,623.00 (including GST); and

Company	Zones	Price for 3 yrs (Including GST)
Trevor J Jones Commercial Mowing	North Albury	\$81,435.00
	South Albury	
	Springdale Heights	
Double Gully Services Pty Ltd	Lake Hume Village	\$490,506.00
	Roadsides - General	
Mappell Pty Ltd	East Albury	\$602,010.00
	Glenroy	
	Lavington	
	Table Top	
	Thurgoona	
	West Albury	
UDL Group Pty Ltd	Albury	\$78,672.00
Total		\$1,252,623.00

b. That Council establishes a Council wide panel for ad hoc casual mowing services, using the respective companies and rates as listed in the below table.

Vendor \$/M2 rate (Including GST)	Trevor J Jones Commercial Mowing	Double Gully Services Pty Ltd	Mappell Pty Ltd	UDL Group Pty Ltd
Monthly (Roadsides)	\$0.012	\$0.010	\$0.012	\$0.060
Major (Irrigated parkland)	\$0.015	\$0.012	\$0.012	\$0.060
Intermediate (Non- irrigated parkland)	\$0.014	\$0.012	\$0.010	\$0.040
Minor (Laneways, walkways, medians)	\$0.012	\$0.012	\$0.020	\$0.040