CM13.4. Lavington Sports Ground Pearsall Street Carpark Construction Contract No. 19/05460

DATE	10 March 2020	**FIL REFERENCE**	FIL19/05460
CONFIDENTIAL	No		
FURTHER ENQUIRIES	Andrew Lawson City Projects	**PHONE**	6023 8111
AUTHOR	Ross Tuckwell		

Purpose of Report

To recommend a preferred contractor for the construction of the Pearsall Street Carpark, which forms part of the overall redevelopment of the Lavington Sports Ground, through a qualitative and quantitative assessment.

Background

The Lavington Sports Ground (LSG) was purchased from the Panthers Group in 2009. Following the purchase, a number of upgrades and refurbishments were considered which led to the development of concept plans for the facility. Council has continued to invest in the facility since 2009 including the purchase of the 4.6ha of land to the east for the development of additional multi-purpose playing fields, which has now been completed.

Council identified the LSG redevelopment as a priority project for the city, allocating funding accordingly and seeking matching external funds, whilst also endorsing a master plan for the site in April 2016.

The LSG redevelopment commenced in mid-2016 after Council received $4.025M from the Federal Government through the National Stronger Regions Funding. In 2018 AlburyCity was successful in receiving a further $3.153M through the NSW Government's Regional Sporting Infrastructure Fund for Stage 3 of the project.

Stage 3 funding includes part of the grandstand upgrades currently under construction and a range of other projects around the precinct enabling the full implementation of the LSG Master Plan. One of these projects is the semi formalised carpark area off Pearsall Street which will provide additional overflow car parking for major events. As per the master plan for the site, this will be constructed in the area south of the new oval and facing onto Pearsall Street.

The carpark design includes a gravel carpark with approximately 320 spaces, concrete footpaths to the entry gate, new drainage structures, and improved access from Pearsall Street.

The scope of the works included in this contract is summarised below:

- earthworks, including 2,500m^3 of cut to fill;

- reshaping the existing channel to redirect overland stormwater flows;
- supply and installation of 525 diameter concrete pipe culverts;
- subgrade preparation of the carpark;
- supply, placement and compaction of gravel layer to the 8,000m^2 carpark; and
- construction of 425 metres of concrete footpaths.

Tenders were invited for Contract No.19/05460, and advertised in the Border Mail, Sydney Morning Herald and on Tenderlink. Tenders closed at 12 noon on Tuesday 18 February 2020.

The contract duration is estimated at six weeks and will be completed in the 2019/20 financial year.

Council's budget allocation for the project is $340K including GST.

A location plan is attached for information.

Tender Assessment

At the close of tenders, submissions were received from the following companies:

- Abbott Construction Pty Ltd (Albury, NSW);
- AP Delaney Co. (Albury, NSW);
- Cartwright Civil Contracting Pty Ltd (Wodonga, Vic);
- Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd (Wodonga, Vic);
- Hurst Earthmoving Pty Ltd (Albury, NSW);
- Mitchell Construction (Albury)Pty Ltd (Albury, NSW); and
- Walsh Wodonga (Vic) Pty Ltd (Wodonga, Vic).

All tenders were evaluated in accordance with Council's Procurement Policy and Guidelines. The assessment panel for the tender comprised Acting Team Leader Procurement and Contract Management – Gerard Coyle, Team Leader Leisure Facilities – Michael Stanton and Senior Project Engineer – Ross Tuckwell.

Conformity Check

A conformity assessment was undertaken to ensure all submissions received were in accordance with the contract documentation and specification.

Company	Pricing Details	Supporting Information	WHS Documentation	Comment
Abbott Construction Pty Ltd	Yes	Yes	Yes	Conforming
AP Delaney & Co.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Conforming
Cartwright Civil Contracting Pty Ltd	Yes	Yes	Yes	Conforming
Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd	Yes	Yes	Yes	Conforming

Hurst Earthmoving Pty Ltd	Yes	Yes	Yes	Conforming
Mitchell Construction (NSW) Pty Ltd	Yes	No	Yes	Non-conforming
Walsh Wodonga (Vic) Pty Ltd	Yes	No	Yes	Non-conforming

As indicated above, all submissions, with the exception of Mitchell Construction (NSW) Pty Ltd and Walsh Wodonga (Vic) Pty Ltd, were assessed as conforming tenders, and all companies are WHS registered with Council.

Mitchell Constructions (NSW) Pty Ltd failed to submit mandatory tender schedules such as resources, current commitments, company experience, benefit to local region and company financial reports, and Walsh Wodonga (Vic) Pty Ltd failed to submit their company financial reports, as requested during clarification of their tender. Both submissions were not further considered in the following qualitative and quantitative assessments.

Qualitative Assessment

A qualitative assessment considered a range of issues including:

- past performance – including referee checks, relevant experience and expertise in performing same or similar projects;
- program – proposed program;
- capacity – current and future commitments and workload;
- capability – including availability of resources, equipment and contract management capabilities; and
- benefit to local region – social and community benefit to the Albury/Wodonga region.

Company	Past Performance (35%)	Program (25%)	Capacity (20%)	Capability (10%)	Local Benefit (10%)	Total (100%)
Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd	35	25	12	10	7	89
AP Delaney & Co.	35	15	20	10	8	88
Cartwright Civil Contracting Pty Ltd	28	20	20	8	6	82
Hurst Earthmoving Pty Ltd	28	20	16	8	6	78
Abbott Construction Pty Ltd	28	10	12	6	7	63

Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd is a locally based company and has undertaken a number of similar projects throughout the local region. They are currently engaged by AlburyCity to construct Wagga Road Beautification Stage 2, Kerr Road Stage 6, and the Thurgoona Drive and Elizabeth Mitchell Drive intersection.

Their current work commitments include the above projects for AlburyCity, The Wangaratta Rail Precinct (expected to be completed in January 2021), and three subdivision projects (expected to be completed in March and April 2020). Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd were queried by the assessment panel regarding available resources, specifically supervision for this project, and they advised that qualified resources will be made available. Based on this response, the assessment panel are confident Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd can appropriately resource this project.

Referee information indicated that the company typically completed projects to a high standard on or before the date of practical completion. The company has good coordination procedures and is professional in managing the construction site, their suppliers and subcontractors.

Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd's standard of works and procedures have been to a high standard on similar projects for AlburyCity (Kerr Road Reconstruction Stages 1 – 5, and Les O'Brien Athletics Precinct Terraced Seating), and their projects have been well resourced and completed on program.

Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd has submitted a 6-week construction program, commencing on 30 March 2020, and clearly shows activities and durations.

Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd has indicated that should they be awarded this tender, 100% of the materials, plant and labour will be sourced from the local region. The company has also listed a number of local community groups, sporting groups and fundraising events which they sponsor.

A P Delaney & Co Pty Ltd is a locally based company and has undertaken a number of similar projects in the local region. Recently the company has completed the Fairway Gardens Estate – Stage 9 in Thurgoona, and White Box Rise Estate – Stage 23 and 24 in Wodonga.

Their current commitments include Ettamogah Rail Hub – siding extension (expected to be completed in August 2020), Brooklyn Fields – Stage 2 (expected to be completed in July 2020) Monument Hill Redevelopment (expected to be completed in March 2020), and Howlong Industrial Estate (expected to be completed in June 2020).

Referee information indicated the company completed projects to a very high standard and typically completed projects within the allocated time frames. The company is quick to respond to scope changes and is very professional in operations.

A P Delaney & Co Pty Ltd's quality of work and procedures have met high standards on similar projects for AlburyCity (Nexus Industrial Subdivision Stage 1 and Travelstop Way roundabout).

AP Delaney & Co Pty Ltd has submitted a basic description for their 6-week construction program, commencing on 13 April 2020.

A P Delaney & Co Pty Ltd have indicated within their submission that should they be awarded this contract, 100% of the materials, plant and labour for this project would be sourced locally. A P Delaney & Co Pty Ltd also note a significant number of community groups, sports teams and events for which they provide sponsorship within the local region, as well as a history of providing

opportunities for engineering students to gain valuable work experience within the construction industry.

Cartwright Civil Contracting Pty Ltd is a locally based company and has undertaken a number of similar projects in the local region. Recently the company has completed a number of subdivisions including Yarrabee Park Stage 4, and Illuka Estate Stages 2 and 3 in Thurgoona.

They currently have three projects in hand including Ceres Drive, Thurgoona (expected to be completed in February 2020), Yarrabee Estate Stage 3, Thurgoona (expected to be completed in March 2020) and Dan Mara Estate, Thurgoona (expected to be completed in May 2020).

Referee information indicated the company typically completed projects to a high standard and within the allocated time frames. The company is cooperative to work with and well resourced.

Cartwright Civil Contracting Pty Ltd's standard of work and procedures have met requirements on similar projects for AlburyCity (Racecourse Road Stage 2).

Cartwright Civil Contracting Pty Ltd has submitted a 5-week construction program, commencing on 30 March 2020, and clearly shows activities and durations.

Cartwright Civil Contracting Pty Ltd has stated that if successful 100% of the labour, plant and materials for this project will be sourced locally. The company has also listed local sporting groups which they sponsor.

Hurst Earthmoving Pty Ltd is a locally based company and has undertaken a number of similar projects in the local region. Recently the company has completed the Table Top watermain augmentation for AlburyCity.

They currently have one project in hand, the Diamond Drive Subdivision, Thurgoona (expected to be completed in March 2020).

Referee information indicated that the company is well managed and completes projects to a good standard. They are collaborative and friendly to work with and add value to their projects.

Hurst Earthmoving Pty Ltd's standard of works and procedures has been to high standard on recent projects for AlburyCity (Tabletop Road Watermain).

Hurst Earthmoving Pty Ltd has submitted a 5-week construction program, commencing on 30 March 2020, and clearly shows activities and durations.

Hurst Earthmoving Pty Ltd has indicated that should they be awarded this tender, 100% of the materials, plant and labour will be sourced from the local region. The company has also listed local sporting groups which they sponsor.

Abbott Constructions Pty Ltd is a locally based company and has undertaken similar projects in the local region. Recently the company has completed the Centaur Road Watermain project for AlburyCity.

They currently have three projects in hand, including Twin Crescent Drain for AlburyCity (expected to be completed in March 2020), Hickey Lane - Civil (expected to be completed in April 2020) and Shepherds Court – Civil (expected to be completed in March 2020).

Referee information indicated that the company has sound communication skills, construction knowledge and works with the client to ensure the scope of the project is delivered.

Abbott Constructions Pty Ltd's standard of works and co-operations has been to a high standard on their previous project for AlburyCity (Centaur Road Watermain).

Abbott Constructions Pty Ltd has submitted a 9-week construction program, that didn't include all activities within the scope of works.

Abbott Constructions Pty Ltd has indicated that should they be awarded this tender, 100% of the materials, plant and labour will be sourced from the local region. The company has also listed local community groups and sporting organisations which they sponsor.

From the information provided, all companies demonstrate the required management systems, experience, construction plant, resources and availability to provide AlburyCity with a quality product.

Quantitative Assessment (100%)

The lump sum tender prices and ratings relative to the lowest price are tabulated below.

Company	Tendered Price (including GST)	Rating (100)
Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd	$279,050.20	100
Cartwright Civil Contracting Pty Ltd	$299,347.40	93
Hurst Earthmoving Pty Ltd	$303,475.70	92
Abbott Construction Pty Ltd	$314,294.95	89
AP Delaney & Co.	$320,870.00	87

The budget allocation for the project is $340K including GST, with all submissions being within the allocated budget.

As detailed above, the submission from Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd was the most favourable from a cost perspective, being $20K (7%) more favourable than Cartwright Civil Contracting Pty Ltd, and between $24K (8%) and $42K (13%) more favourable than the other submissions.

Risk

- Business Risk – There is low risk to the current operations of the Lavington Sports Ground as this area is currently not used. The area is separated by fencing from the other construction and operation activities currently occurring at the Lavington Sports Ground.
- Corporate Risk – This project is located at the Lavington Sports Ground and as such, will be visible to the public. The completion of this project will provide additional parking necessary for this sporting complex to host major events, and interim car parking until the development of the Centaur Road Carpark. This risk area is considered low.
- WHS and Public Risk – WHS risks due to the construction works will be controlled in accordance with AlburyCity procedures. The contractor will be WHS registered with AlburyCity and will be required to implement relevant Safe Work Method Statements and safety inspections.
- Environmental Risk – The contractor will be required to submit Environmental Plans, addressing environment controls to be implemented; in particular, erosion and sediment controls, and air quality.
- Delivery Program Risk – The construction programs are short in duration, with works schedules to be completed prior to winter. Hence delivery program risk is considered low.

Community Engagement

There was extensive community consultation carried out during the development of the LSG Master Plan from late 2015 which was then endorsed by Council in April 2016.

Two separate Development Applications for the LSG Redevelopment were submitted and approved in 2016 with this process including the standard advertising and opportunity for community submissions. In addition, there have been modifications to the Development Applications providing further opportunity for community feedback.

Council staff have continued to meet with stakeholders and provided project updates throughout the process.

Summary

The scoring for the qualitative and quantitative assessment is summarised in the following table:

Company	Quantitative	Qualitative
Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd	100	89
Cartwright Civil Contracting Pty Ltd	93	82
Hurst Earthmoving Pty Ltd	92	78
Abbott Construction Pty Ltd	89	63
AP Delaney & Co.	87	88

From the qualitative assessment, all companies have the required management systems, experience, resources and availability to successfully undertake this project.

From a quantitative perspective the submission from Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd was assessed as being the most advantageous. The submission was between $20K (7%) and $42K (13%) more favourable than the other submissions.

Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd were queried regarding the availability of resources to undertake this project, with consideration that they have been awarded Wagga Road Beautification Stage 2, Kerr Road Stage 6 and the Thurgoona Drive and Elizabeth Mitchell Drive intersection by AlburyCity. They confirmed suitably qualified resources would be made available.

Therefore, based on the qualitative and quantitative assessments, it is deemed that the submission from Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd provides the best value for Council to deliver this project.

Conclusion

Council invited tenders for Lavington Sports Ground – Pearsall Street Carpark and received seven submissions.

The Pearsall Street Carpark is part of Stage 3 of the Lavington Sports Ground redevelopment, for which AlburyCity was successful in receiving a further $3.153M through the NSW Government's Regional Sporting Infrastructure Fund, in 2018.

The scope of the contract includes a gravel carpark with approximately 320 spaces, concrete footpaths to the entry gate, new drainage structures, and improved access from Pearsall Street.

A quantitative and qualitative assessment indicated that Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd was the most favourable submission. Their tendered price of $279,050.20 including GST is within the budget allocation of $340K including GST.

Recommendation

That Council accepts the tender from Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd for Contract No 19/05460 - Lavington Sports Ground Pearsall Street Carpark for the lump sum amount of $279,050.20 (including GST).

Attachments:

Location Plan. (DOC20/32979)