CM13.4. Melrose Park Sports Pavilion Contract No. 23/01041

DATE	17 November 2023	**FIL REFERENCE**	FIL23/01041-02
CONFIDENTIAL	No		
FURTHER ENQUIRIES	Andrew Lawson City Projects	**PHONE**	6023 8111
AUTHOR	Isaac Greene		

Purpose of Report

To recommend a preferred contractor for the construction of Melrose Park Sports Pavilion, through a qualitative and quantitative assessment.

Background

Melrose Park is a local sports ground in Lavington and is the home of the Melrose Park Soccer Club.

In September 2021, the original Melrose Park amenities building was extensively damaged by fire and, as a result, demolished. Temporary facilities were funded and established through collaboration between the Melrose Football Club, Albury Wodonga Football Association, and AlburyCity. The temporary amenity facilities do not adequately cater to the needs of the various user groups.

To address these inadequacies, and to accommodate the Club's recent significant growth and increased participation, particularly female, the design of a new sports pavilion has been completed in consultation with the Melrose Football Club and relevant sport standards. The new sports pavilion includes referee rooms, dedicated male and female change facilities, accessible public toilets, kitchen, function room, storage, and community spaces.

Council’s budget allocation for the project is $3.85M (including GST). The NSW Government is providing $350K through the 2019 Election Commitments Program, as well as a further $275K through the Stronger Country Communities Program (Round 4).

Tenders were invited for Contract No.23/01041 – Construction of Melrose Park Sports Pavilion, and advertised in the Border Mail, Sydney Morning Herald and on Tenderlink. Tenders closed at 12 noon on Tuesday 19 September 2023.

The contract duration is estimated at 40 weeks and will be completed in the 2024/25 financial year.

A location plan is attached for information (Attachment 1).

Tender Assessment

At the close of tenders, submissions were received from the following companies:

- Binding Building Pty Ltd (Lavington, NSW);
- Colin Joss & Co Pty Ltd t/a Joss Facility Management (Albury, NSW);
- Monarch Building Solutions Australia Pty Ltd (Canberra, ACT);
- Premier Building Constructions Pty Ltd (Wodonga, VIC);
- Q1 Constructions Pty Ltd (Wodonga, VIC);
- Red Airconditioning Albury Wodonga (Albury, NSW);
- TCH Pty Ltd (Wodonga, VIC);
- Ultra Project Services Pty Ltd (Wangaratta, VIC); and
- Verde Build Pty Ltd (Albury, NSW).

All tenders were evaluated in accordance with Council's Procurement Policy and Guidelines. The assessment panel for the tender comprised of Sourcing Coordinator – Paul Dwyer, Open Space Coordinator – Ben Hooper, Senior Design Lead – Douglas Howard, and Team Leader Project Delivery – Isaac Greene.

Conformity Check

A conformity assessment was undertaken to ensure all submissions received were in accordance with the contract documentation and specification.

Company	Pricing Details	Supporting Information	WHS Documentation	Comment
Binding Building Pty Ltd	✓	✓	✓	Conforming
Colin Joss & Co Pty Limited t/a Joss Facility Management	✓	✓	✓	Conforming
Monarch Building Solutions Australia Pty Ltd	✓	✓	✓	Conforming
Premier Building Constructions Pty Ltd	✓	✓	✓	Conforming
Q1 Constructions Pty Ltd	✓	✓	✓	Conforming
Red Airconditioning Pty Ltd	X	X	X	Non-conforming
TCH Pty Ltd	X	X	X	Non-conforming
Ultra Project Services	✓	✓	✓	Conforming
Verde Build Pty Ltd	✓	✓	✓	Conforming

As indicated above, submissions from Red Airconditioning Pty Ltd and TCH Pty Ltd were deemed non-conforming as they were incomplete submissions, providing just a single quotation for components of the works only (mechanical plant and roller shutters, respectively) and were not considered further for this contract.

All remaining submissions were assessed as conforming tenders, and all companies are either WHS registered with Council or demonstrate the capacity to achieve this status.

Qualitative Assessment

A qualitative assessment considered a range of issues including:

- past performance – referee checks, relevant experience and expertise in performing same or similar projects;
- methodology and program – project methodology and proposed program;
- capacity – current and future commitments and workload;
- capability – availability of resources, equipment and contract management capabilities; and
- benefit to local region – social and community benefit to the Albury/Wodonga region.

Company	Past Performance (30%)	Methodology & Program (30%)	Capacity (20%)	Capability (10%)	Local Benefit (10%)	Total (100%)
Monarch Building Solutions Australia Pty Ltd	28	28	19	9	8	92
Premier Building Constructions Pty Ltd	20	24	17	8	6	75
Colin Joss & Co Pty Limited t/a Joss Facility Management	22	18	17	8	7	72
Ultra Project Services Pty Ltd	22	22	15	7	5	71
Q1 Constructions Pty Ltd	22	18	15	8	6	69
Binding Building Pty Ltd	22	18	13	7	6	66
Verde Build Pty Ltd	16	18	9	6	6	55

Monarch Building Solutions Australia Pty Ltd is based in Fyshwick ACT. with an established local office and presence in Albury. They have a substantial portfolio of recently completed projects for local government, ACT government and federal government bodies.

A comprehensive list of sporting facility upgrades and new constructions were provided as reference projects within their submission, demonstrating an excellent capability and capacity to deliver this project. These previously complete projects ranged in value between $700K and $12M, with a significant portion being delivered across regional NSW and in the ACT.

Monarch Building Solutions Australia Pty Ltd's current commitments include Chapman Early Learning Centre (expected completion, October 2023), Greenway Housing (expected completion, December 2023), McDonald's and Metro Fuel Station (expected completion, November 2023) and Defence Housing Australia (DHA) "The Crossing" in Coombs (expected completion, December 2024).

Monarch Building Solutions Australia Pty Ltd provided a detailed methodology and program, which set their submission apart and provided the assessment panel with confidence that they can deliver the project to a high standard. Monarch Building Solutions Australia Pty Ltd also outlined that an experienced project delivery team would be assigned to the project, which is backed by a senior management team with demonstrated large capital infrastructure delivery experience. The program provided indicated a 36-week completion period.

Referee information also indicated that Monarch Building Solutions Australia Pty Ltd are a high performing contractor with demonstrated project management capabilities and can achieve quality outcomes and timely milestone delivery.

Monarch Building Solutions Australia Pty Ltd recently completed the Albury City Council Pumphouse Refurbishment project. Council's experience was a positive one, with effective communication, project management and delivery experience applied.

Monarch Building Solutions Australia Pty Ltd participate in community organisations through sponsorship and donations, with funding support provided to a local junior rugby league club. The list of subcontractors nominated suggest between 90-100% of the trades would be local. Local material supply was also nominated at 100%.

Premier Building Construction Pty Ltd is a locally based company and has completed a range of similar projects throughout Albury Wodonga and further afield.

Premier Building Construction Pty Ltd is currently engaged to deliver projects of a similar scale with several of them nominated to be completed prior to the commencement of this project, including Sacred Heart Primary school (expected completion, November 2023), Wodonga Community Care Facility (expected completion, November 2023) and Scots School Albury (expected completion, June 2024).

Premier Building Construction Pty Ltd demonstrated that they have the required past experience, capability and capacity to deliver a project of this scale and complexity and provided a detailed methodology. The program provided indicated a 33-week construction period.

Referee information indicated that the company is willing to look at ways to improve communication when projects fall behind or when key staff changes occur. In other projects they have sought to understand the client requirements and deliver over and above expectations.

Premier Building Construction Pty Ltd provides sponsorship to various local sporting clubs and detailed that they work closely with TAFE organisations across the border in training new construction apprentices.

Premier Building Construction Pty Ltd nominated 100% of labour and subcontractors from the Albury Wodonga region as well as locally sourced construction materials to deliver this project.

Colin Joss & Co Pty Limited t/a Joss Facility Management, is an Albury based company, with experience in undertaking similar projects in the past. The Facility Management division of Colin Joss & Co Pty Ltd typically undertake smaller construction jobs as well as provide facility management services across numerous contracts.

Joss Facility Management's current work commitments include the delivery of Albury High School Amenities and works for the Tallangatta Health Service, both of which are scheduled for completion later this year. They have also recently commenced works on The Rock Rural Fire Service building (expected completion, February 2024).

Referee information indicated that the company performs above expectations and delivers superior project outcomes. Council has not had direct dealings with the Facility Management arm of the Joss Group but is familiar with the work health safety, quality and environmental systems typically used by the Joss Group when delivering a project.

The methodology provided by Joss Facility Management was relatively generic and covered only the main elements of the project, with minimal specific details provided. The program provided indicated a 48-week construction period.

Joss Facility Management nominated 95% for both local labour and subcontractor involvement, as well as local material to be used in the delivery of this project. The Joss Group is a sponsor of local sporting teams and donates to community organisations such as the Albury Wodonga Regional Cancer Centre and the Clontarf Foundation.

Ultra Project Services Pty Ltd is a locally based company from Wangaratta and has a history of performing works of a similar scale to the Melrose Sports Pavilion project. Ultra Project Services Pty Ltd has recently completed projects for Wagga Wagga City Council and building works for Bandiana Defence site for Augility, on behalf of Department of Defence.

Ultra Project Services Pty Ltd's current work commitments include a program of building works for the Victorian School Building Authority across Edi, Greta, Whitfield and Beechworth (expected completion November 2023).

Referee information indicated that the company typically delivers work to a high standard with minimal defects. Excellent communication was noted on a previous project with one referee highlighting the stringent requirements their customer had that Ultra Project Services Pty Ltd was able to deliver upon. Ultra Project Services Pty Ltd have previously worked with AlburyCity in delivering the Workshop Wash Down Bay at the Albury Waste Management Centre, which was a positive experience.

The work methodology provided by Ultra Project Services Pty Ltd was simple, however straightforward, and the program was logical covering all major aspects of the project. Ultra Project Services Pty Ltd demonstrated that they have quality work health and safety systems and environmental policies in place for the delivery of projects. The program provided indicated a 30-week construction period.

Ultra Project Services Pty Ltd nominated 10% of the company staff are in the Albury Wodonga region (the remainder in Wangaratta) with 85% of the labour and subcontractors for this project also coming from the Albury Wodonga region. Majority of the materials are also nominated as being sourced from the Albury Wodonga region. Ultra Project Services Pty Ltd give back to the community through sporting club sponsorship and volunteering.

Q1 Constructions Pty Ltd is a Wodonga based local construction company. Q1 Constructions Pty Ltd has delivered a range of projects for local government, state government and private industry.

Their recently completed projects include Wodonga Institute of TAFE Trade Centre, Hungry Jacks Lavington, St Patricks Primary School and a project for the Victorian Department of Education and Victoria Police.

The company's current work commitments include OTR Service Station Wodonga (expected completion, November 2023), Kirinari Office Fit-Out (expected completion, November 2023) and Hungry Jacks, Griffith (expected completion, February 2024).

The company has demonstrated experience delivering projects for public sector clients including Bright and Corryong Police Stations, and the Victorian Department of Education.

Referee information indicated that Q1 Constructions Pty Ltd consistently delivers a quality outcome. Management of project timelines and subcontractors was above average, and they have demonstrated a good project management capability. Referees stated that they would have no objection to working with Q1 Constructions Pty Ltd again, with one referee indicating an ongoing business relationship. AlburyCity has no recent experience with Q1 Constructions Pty Ltd.

The tender submission provided by Q1 Constructions Pty Ltd included a construction methodology and associated program. Their construction methodology was basic, covering only the major project activities, and did not elaborate on major construction activities within the project. The program provided indicated a 35-week construction period.

Q1 Constructions Pty Ltd nominated that 100% of labour, subcontractors and materials would be from the local Albury Wodonga region.

Binding Building Pty Ltd is a locally based Lavington company and has undertaken several construction projects throughout Albury Wodonga.

Binding Building Pty Ltd specialises in commercial and residential construction with some recently completed projects including heritage renovations at the Albury Cinema Centre, Wodonga Racecourse Exhibition Centre Redevelopment – Stage 1 & 2 and public amenities for Wodonga.

Binding Building Pty Ltd's current work commitments include several residential house renovations and extensions for private clients, as well as the new Albury Skate Park Amenities for Albury City Council.

External referee information indicated that Binding Building Pty Ltd is a reliable contractor that consistently achieves project milestones within advised timeframes. This referee experience is supported by Albury City Council's own experience, where Binding Building has demonstrated high levels of co-operation and delivery performance on the new Skate Park Amenities project.

Binding Building Pty Ltd's work methodology and program are logical, with consideration given to site management, environmental and waste management. The indicative program was the longest received at 60 weeks.

The company utilises an online WHS system to manage and maintain records of safety compliance and quality on site.

Binding Building Pty Ltd employs locals and 100% of subcontractors and materials proposed for this project are also sourced locally. Binding Building Pty Ltd also provides local sponsorship to sporting groups, as well as donations to charities.

Verde Build Pty Ltd is a recently formed locally based company and has undertaken several projects in the past under the business name 'Hayne Baker Constructions' across Albury Wodonga.

Their current work commitments include some home renovations across Albury, West Albury and Table Top (expected completion early 2024).

Referee information indicated that the company has good connections in the Albury Wodonga building industry and provided great support to bring projects back on time and in delivering quality outcomes.

The work methodology provided was basic, however clear and covered all major elements. The program indicated a 50-week construction duration.

Verde Build Pty Ltd employs all local staff, with 90% of materials and subcontractors predominately located within the Albury Wodonga region. Verde Build Pty Ltd sponsors sporting groups and community organisations and provides training opportunities via school-based work experience.

From the information provided, all companies demonstrate the required management systems, experience, construction plant, resources and availability to provide AlburyCity with a quality product.

Quantitative Assessment (100%)

The lump sum tender prices and ratings relative to the lowest price are tabulated below.

Company	Estimated Contract Value (including GST)	Rating (100)
Premier Building Constructions Pty Ltd	$2,692,599.62	100
Q1 Constructions Pty Ltd	$2,980,205.80	90
Binding Building Pty Ltd	$3,052,562.01	88
Ultra Project Services Pty Ltd	$3,189,280.73	84
Colin Joss & Co Pty Limited t/as Joss Facility Management	$3,313,878.70	81
Monarch Building Solutions Australia Pty Ltd	$3,379,700.00	80
Verde Build Pty Ltd	$4,478,545.16	60

The budget allocation for the project is $3.85M (including GST), with six submissions being within the allocated budget.

As detailed above, the submission from Premier Building Constructions Pty Ltd was the most favourable from a cost perspective, being $288K (11%) more favourable than Q1 Constructions Pty Ltd, $360K (13%) more favourable than Binding Building Pty Ltd and between $497K (18%) and $1.79M (66%) more favourable than the other submissions.

Risk

- **Business Risk** – financial risks during construction are possible if latent/unknown conditions are encountered. To mitigate this risk, a previous procurement process was completed for the engagement of a lead architect to complete the comprehensive design as well as provide ongoing construction phase services for the project.

- **Corporate Risk** – the temporary facilities are not meeting the needs of participant, spectator or community demands. Establishing a quality facility that meets the requirements of all participants, spectators and the general community will provide a positive image for the Council.

- **WHS and Public Risk** – WHS risks due to the construction works will be controlled in accordance with AlburyCity procedures. The contractor will be WHS registered with AlburyCity and will be required to implement relevant Safe Work Method Statements and safety inspections.

- **Environmental Risk** – a Review of Environmental Factors (REF) has been undertaken to identify any environmental risks and suitable measures to mitigate them (Attachment 2). It was determined that no trees will be removed and that all predicted environmental and cultural heritage impacts can be avoided and/or managed such that the project will not lead to significant impact to the environment.

- **Delivery Program Risk** – standard delivery program risks are possible, such as delays due to inclement weather, supply chain lead times, or adverse site conditions and contractor caused delays. Geotechnical investigations have been undertaken to mitigate some of these risks.

Community Engagement

There has been significant engagement with the Melrose Park Soccer Club and Albury Wodonga Football Association regarding this project. AlburyCity has also been able to support the provision of temporary facilities whilst the process of designing and constructing a replacement facility was underway. The broader community were also given the opportunity to provide comments on the proposed upgrades via 'Have Your Say', which was publicly advertised from 21 July 2021 to 6 August 2021 on the AlburyCity website.

This project also aligns with the Towards Albury 2050 Community Strategic Plan, and is included within Albury City Council's Four Year Delivery Program (2023-27) under "A Caring Community", Outcome 3.5, and specifically relates to Item 3.5.2, "Our buildings and spaces are designed to be inclusive and accessible to all community members".

This project also identifies with the Two Cities One Community Strategic Plan community aspiration of "Our Community" and specifically, with Outcome 3.3 "our community is healthy and has a strong sense of wellbeing". The delivery of this project will improve user experiences at Melrose Park, with user participation from leagues and teams on both sides of the border and from the local government areas of AlburyCity, City of Wodonga, Federation Council and Alpine Shire Council.

To keep the community informed on the progress of construction, the project will also be included on the Major Projects section of Albury City Council's website, with construction updates also provided via social media.

Summary

The scoring for the qualitative and quantitative assessment is summarised in the following table:

Company	Qualitative	Quantitative
Premier Building Constructions Pty Ltd	75	100
Monarch Building Solutions Australia Pty Ltd	92	80
Q1 Constructions Pty Ltd	69	90
Binding Building Pty Ltd	66	88
Colin Joss & Co Pty Limited t/as Joss Facility Management	72	81
Ultra Project Services Pty Ltd	71	84
Verde Build Pty Ltd	55	60

From the qualitative assessment, all companies have the required management systems, experience, resources, and availability to successfully undertake this project.

From a quantitative perspective the submission from Premier Building Constructions Pty Ltd was assessed as being the most advantageous. The submission was between $288K (10%) and $1.79M (66%) more favourable than the other submissions.

Therefore, based on the qualitative and quantitative assessments, it is deemed that the submission from Premier Building Constructions Pty Ltd provides the best value for Council to deliver this project.

Conclusion

Council invited tenders for Melrose Park Sports Pavilion and received nine submissions.

The new Melrose Park Sports Pavilion will provide ongoing facilities for the users at Melrose Park, following the demolition of the previous building due to fire damage. The new pavilion will also address the identified amenity deficiencies of the previous building, such as lack of change facilities to accommodate both male and female participation, accessible public toilets, storage, and community space.

A quantitative and qualitative assessment indicated that Premier Building Constructions Pty Ltd was the most favourable submission. Their tendered price of $2,692,599.62 (including GST) is within the budget allocation of $3,850,000 (including GST) and is considered value for money and the most advantageous for Council.

Recommendation

That Council accepts the tender from Premier Building Constructions Pty Ltd, for Contract No. 23/01041 for the Construction of the Melrose Park Sports Pavilion, for the lump sum of $2,692,599.62 (including GST).

Attachments

1. Location plan (DOC23/407009).
2. Review of Environmental Factors Report (DOC23/406427).