CM13.3. Thurgoona Drive & Evesham Place Intersection Road Widening Contract No. 23/01391

DATE	14 November 2023	**FIL REFERENCE**	FIL23/01391-02
CONFIDENTIAL	No		
FURTHER ENQUIRIES	Andrew Lawson City Projects	**PHONE**	6023 8111
AUTHOR	Clenisa Canafe		

Purpose of Report

To recommend a preferred contractor for the construction of the Thurgoona Drive and Evesham Place Intersection Road Widening project, through a qualitative and quantitative assessment.

Background

This project will upgrade the intersection of Thurgoona Drive and Evesham Place to support the increased traffic demand and growth in Thurgoona and improve the safety of the local transport network. This project widens approximately 210 metres of Thurgoona Drive to create an additional 3.5-metre-wide travel lane. This widening enables a dedicated right-hand turn lane on the western approach of Thurgoona Drive into Evesham Place and will delineate incoming motorists to mitigate the risk of collision with turning traffic.

The improvement works include:

- excavation and widening of the existing pavement;
- subgrade preparation and stabilisation;
- pavement construction;
- asphalt surfacing;
- installation of guardrails;
- relocation of a single light pole;
- relocation and installation of road signs; and
- line marking.

Tenders were invited for Contract No. 23/01391 - Thurgoona Drive and Evesham Place Intersection Road Widening, and advertised in the Border Mail, Sydney Morning Herald, and on Tenderlink. Tenders closed at 12 noon on Tuesday 17 October 2023.

The contract duration is estimated at eight weeks and will be completed in the 2023/24 financial year.

Council's budget allocation for the project is $550,000 (including GST).

A location map is attached for information (Attachment 1).

Tender Assessment

At the close of tenders, three submissions were received from the following companies:

- A P Delaney & Co Pty Ltd (Albury, NSW);
- Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd (Wodonga, VIC); and
- Hutchinson Civil Pty Ltd (Lavington, NSW).

All tenders were evaluated in accordance with Council's Procurement Policy and Guidelines. The assessment panel for the tender comprised of Senior Project Engineer – Clenisa Canafe, Design Team Leader – Josh McLinden, and Sourcing Coordinator – Paul Dwyer.

Conformity Check

A conformity assessment was undertaken to ensure all submissions received were in accordance with the contract documentation and specification.

Company	Pricing Details	Supporting Information	WHS Documentation	Comment
A P Delaney & Co Pty Ltd	✓	✓	✓	Conforming
Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd	✓	✓	✓	Conforming
Hutchinson Civil Pty Ltd	✓	✓	✓	Conforming

As indicated above, all submissions were assessed as conforming tenders, and all companies are WHS registered with Council.

Qualitative Assessment

A qualitative assessment considered a range of issues including:

- past performance – referee checks, relevant experience, and expertise in performing same or similar projects;
- methodology and program – project methodology and proposed program;
- capacity – availability of resources, current and future commitments, and workload;
- capability – supplier ability to deliver the request and contract management capabilities; and
- benefit to local region – social and community benefit to the Albury/Wodonga region.

Company	Past Performance (35%)	Methodology & Program (25%)	Capacity (20%)	Capability (10%)	Local Benefit (10%)	Total (100%)
Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd	28	23	16	8	8	83
A P Delaney & Co Pty Ltd	28	20	16	8	9	81
Hutchinson Civil Pty Ltd	28	17	16	8	8	77

Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd is a locally based company (Wodonga VIC) that has undertaken several similar road reconstruction projects throughout the local region, including works for AlburyCity.

The company's current work commitments include Centaur Road Reconstruction (anticipated completion February 2024) and Southern View Drainage (anticipated completion February 2024) projects for AlburyCity, Corryong Streetscape for Eda Project Management (anticipated completion year 2024), and Governor's Hill Stage 7 for Premise (anticipated completion March 2024). Given the size of the company, it was concluded by the assessment panel that a contract of this scale would not impact the contractor's ability to deliver this project.

Referee information indicated that the contractor is adequately resourced, delivers quality outcomes, and is highly rated for their overall performance on projects.

Notable projects delivered by Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd for AlburyCity include the $9M Albury Riverside Precinct, Ernest Grant Park Car Park, Keene Street Road Reconstruction – Stage 1, Play Space and Skate Park, several stages of the Kerr Road Reconstruction, and the Elizabeth Mitchell/Thurgoona Drive Intersection Realignment. These projects were completed to a high standard.

Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd submitted a five-week program. Their methodology also detailed all required construction activities including traffic management.

Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd indicated that for this procurement activity, 90% of materials, plant and equipment will be sourced from the local region, however their nominated stabilisation subcontractor is not local. The company also listed several local community and sporting groups that they sponsor.

A P Delaney & Co Pty Ltd is a locally based company (Albury NSW) and has undertaken several similar contracts with both private and government clients.

Notable projects currently being delivered by A P Delaney & Co Pty Ltd include the $2M Albury Airport Taxiway Bravo Upgrade for AlburyCity (anticipated completion June 2024), the $3.4M Brooklyn Fields Stage 5 Residential Subdivision for Peter Bowen Homes/SJE Consulting (anticipated completion January 2024), and the $2.3M Corowa Saleyards Upgrade for Federation Council (anticipated completion June 2024). Considering the size of the company, the assessment panel concluded that a contract of this scale would not impact their ability to deliver this project.

AlburyCity has previous experience dealing with A P Delaney & Co Pty Ltd. Projects previously delivered for AlburyCity include the Nexus Stormwater Basin and Drainage Line (completed July 2023), Travel Stop Way Roundabout (completed August 2017), Stage 1 of the Nexus Industrial Precinct (completed February 2018) and the Monument Hill Redevelopment (completed April 2019). These engagements have been positive, with a high level of service and a quality product delivered.

Referee information indicated that the contractor is highly recommended, completes projects to a high standard, and works collaboratively during difficult work situations.

The contractor submitted a methodology which is reflected in their program of six weeks from site establishment. The contractor also indicated in their submission that all waste asphalt and concrete materials demolished as part of the works will be transported to a local A P Delaney & Co Pty Ltd quarry where they intend to recycle materials for future road projects.

A P Delaney & Co Pty Ltd's head office is in Albury, and they provide ongoing sponsorship to several local community and sporting groups. It was acknowledged that should they be successful, all materials will be sourced from the local region, including from their own local quarry. They have also nominated local specialist subcontractors in their submission.

Hutchinson Civil Pty Ltd is a locally based company (Lavington NSW). Their recent projects include a variety of civil works for both public and private clients within the region.

Projects currently being completed include the Albury Waste Management Centre Material Recycling Facility for Southern Cross Developers (anticipated completion December 2023), Howlong UPA for Southern Cross Developers (anticipated completion December 2023), and Walla Solar Farm for Gransolar Construction. Due to their current commitments nearing completion, it was concluded that, should Hutchinson Civil Pty Ltd be awarded this contract, they would have sufficient capacity to deliver this project.

Referee information suggests that Hutchinson Civil Pty Ltd is a capable and highly cooperative contractor who delivers quality products. They can identify areas for improvement and are fair and reasonable with respect to contract variations and claims.

Council has previous engagements with Hutchinson Civil Pty Ltd on similar and more complex projects, including the Keene Street Reconstruction Stage 2 (completed October 2022) where their past performance was considered high.

The contractor provided a methodology outlining the logical sequence of events including traffic management. Their indicated duration for the works was eight weeks from site establishment.

Hutchinson Civil Pty Ltd indicated that for this procurement activity, all materials, labour, plant, and equipment would be sourced from the local region, however their nominated stabilisation subcontractor is not local. The company also sponsors local community and sporting clubs.

From the information provided, all companies demonstrated the required management systems, experience, construction plant, resources and availability to provide AlburyCity with a quality product.

Quantitative Assessment (100%)

The lump sum tender prices and ratings relative to the lowest price are tabulated below.

Company	Contract Value (including GST)	Rating (100)
Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd	$450,219.00	100
Hutchinson Civil Pty Ltd	$534,617.60	84
A P Delaney & Co Pty Ltd	$544,280.00	83

The budget allocation for the project is $550,000 (including GST), with all submissions being within the allocated budget.

As detailed above, the submission from Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd was the most favourable from a cost perspective, being $84K (19%) more favourable than Hutchinson Civil Pty Ltd, and $94K (21%) more favourable than A P Delaney & Co Pty Ltd.

Risk

- **Business Risk** – the project site currently services Thurgoona Country Club Resort and the Diamond Drive mixed business zoned subdivision. Impact to these existing businesses may result from these works. To mitigate this risk, it is a condition of the tender that Thurgoona Drive, Evesham Place and Diamond Drive remain accessible to the public for the entirety of the works.

- **Corporate Risk** – delay in delivering this infrastructure may mean that the increasing growth in Thurgoona is not adequately catered for, therefore affecting Council's branding and image.

- **WHS and Public Risk** – WHS risks due to the construction works will be controlled in accordance with Council's procedures. The contractor will be WHS registered by Council and will be required to implement relevant Safe Work Method Statements and safety inspections. The construction zone will be under traffic management conditions during the works. The contractor will be required to submit a Traffic Management Plan to minimise construction impact to the existing businesses in the precinct and to allow safe movement of both construction vehicles and public vehicles.

- **Environmental Risk** – an Environmental Review has been undertaken to identify any environmental risks and suitable measures to mitigate them (Attachment 2). Given the short-term nature of the works and the minimal removal of native vegetation, it was assessed that the project is not likely to have a significant impact to the environment.

- **Delivery Program Risk** – the duration of the works is weather dependent. There is the possibility of delivery delays due to inclement weather, and contractor-caused delays.

Community Engagement

The project is consistent with several themes and strategic actions identified within Towards Albury 2050, which is Albury's Community Strategic Plan that has undergone extensive community consultation prior to adoption. These themes and strategic actions include:

1.1 Albury is a liveable city supporting sustainable population growth through the provision of high-quality infrastructure, industry leading services and high levels of amenity.
1.1.1 Responsibly provide residential and commercial development options for our growing city, whilst prioritising sustainability.

1.2 Albury has an accessible, integrated transport network that connects our city through safe and efficient travel options.
1.2.1 Effectively plan, upgrade, and maintain our network of roads, bridges, cycleways, footpaths, walkways, and street lighting.

In addition to Towards Albury 2050, this project was also identified as an individual action in the Four-Year Delivery Program, which also underwent extensive community consultation.

To keep the community informed throughout the works, frequent project updates will be made via AlburyCity's Major Projects webpage and social media.

Summary

The scoring for the qualitative and quantitative assessment is summarised in the following table:

Company	Quantitative	Qualitative
Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd	100	83
A P Delaney & Co Pty Ltd	83	81
Hutchinson Civil Pty Ltd	84	77

From the qualitative assessment, all companies have the required management systems, experience, resources, and availability to successfully undertake this project. The only differences relate to the individual construction methodologies and programs.

From a quantitative perspective, the submission from Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd was assessed as being the most advantageous. The submission was between $84K (19%) and $94 (21%) more favourable than the other submissions.

Therefore, based on the qualitative and quantitative assessments, it is deemed that the submission from Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd provides the best value for Council to deliver this project.

Conclusion

Council invited tenders for Contract No. 23/01391 Thurgoona Drive and Evesham Place Intersection Road Widening, and received three submissions.

The project relates to the upgrade of the intersection of Thurgoona Drive and Evesham Place to support the increased traffic demand and growth in Thurgoona and improve the safety of the local transport network. This project widens approximately 210 metres of Thurgoona Drive to create an additional 3.5-metre-wide travel lane. This travel lane enables a dedicated right-hand turn lane on the western approach of Thurgoona Drive into Evesham Place and will delineate incoming motorists to mitigate the risk of collision with turning traffic.

The project involves pavement reconstruction, installation of guardrails and road signs, relocation of single light pole, and line marking.

A quantitative and qualitative assessment indicated that the submission from Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd was the most favourable. Their tendered price of $450,219 (including GST), is within the budget allocation of $550,000 (including GST).

Considering the above, and based on the qualitative and quantitative assessments, it is deemed that the submission from Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd provides the best value for Council to deliver this project.

Recommendation

That Council accepts the tender from Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd for Contract No. 23/01391 Thurgoona Drive and Evesham Place Intersection Road Widening, for the lump sum price of $450,219 (including GST).

Attachments

1. Locality Map (DOC23/401846).
2. Environmental Considerations for Thurgoona Drive & Evesham Place (DOC23/357811).