CM13.4. Centaur Road Reconstruction - Overend Street to Mudge Street Contract No. 20/02903

DATE	30 June 2021	**FIL REFERENCE**	FIL20/02903-02
CONFIDENTIAL	No		
FURTHER ENQUIRIES	Andrew Lawson Service Leader City Projects	**PHONE**	6023 8111
AUTHOR	Thomas Staats		

Purpose of Report

To recommend a preferred contractor and award a contract for the reconstruction of Centaur Road – Overend Street to Mudge Street, through a qualitative and quantitative assessment.

Background

As part of Council's ongoing commitment to maintaining its infrastructure and providing the community with improved roads, Centaur Road has been identified for reconstruction and upgrade, and this includes treatment at the intersection with Mudge Street.

Centaur Road is located in Hamilton Valley, and it is the only access road to the Albury Waste Management and Recycling Centre, and the Albury Animal Management Facility. It is also the only access road for residents living in the Hamilton Valley housing estates. With significant volumes of traffic, including a high percentage of heavy vehicles (50%), the road has severely deteriorated. The section of Centaur Road between Overend Street and Mudge Street is particularly in poor condition and requires a full road reconstruction.

The reconstructed road will incorporate safety improvements, notably the curves and road intersection alignments, inclusion of a shared pathway, and enhancement of a section of the Hamilton Valley Creek.

The scope of the works for this contract include:

- construction of 7,240m^2 of new pavement;
- 1,446 metres of kerb and guttering;
- 617 metres of piped drainage;
- 768 metres of conduit installation to link the Albury Waste Management Centre to the AlburyCity Optic Fibre network;
- installation of 150 metres of water supply pipe;
- 129 metres of creek works to remove woody weeds, reinstate with native vegetation;
- an 8.7 metre extension to an existing box culvert under Centaur Road;
- a 5.5 metre extension to an existing 1050mm diameter piped culvert under Mudge Street;
- four new concrete driveways;
- 1,028m^2 of new 2.5m wide gravel shared pathways and pedestrian crossing;

- landscaping of the construction area; and
- maintenance of access to the Albury Waste Management Centre, Recycling Centre, Albury Animal Management Facility, and residences during the construction period.

Tenders were invited for Contract No. 20/02903 – Centaur Road Reconstruction, Overend Street to Mudge Street, and advertised in the Border Mail, Sydney Morning Herald and on Tenderlink. Tenders closed at 12 noon on Tuesday 13 April 2021.

The contract duration is estimated at 16 weeks and will be completed in the 2021/22 financial year.

Council's budget allocation for the project is $2.31M including GST ($660K in 2020/21 year & $1.65M in 2021/22 year) including a contribution of $1.54M from the NSW State Government under the Fixing Local Roads Program. The project budget includes provision for Project Management & Administration, Environmental Management, and a Community Awareness program.

This contract was originally presented to Council at its meeting on 24 May 2021 for decision, however was deferred pending the finalisation of the Review of Environmental Factors.

A location plan is attached for information.

Tender Assessment

At the close of tenders, submissions were received from the following companies:

- Cartwright Civil Contracting Pty Ltd (Wodonga, VIC);
- Longford Civil Pty Ltd (Howlong, NSW);
- Civil and Civic Group Pty Ltd (Kingston, ACT); and
- BR Durham Sons Pty Ltd (Mulgrave, NSW).

All tenders were evaluated in accordance with Council's Procurement Policy and in consultation with the Procurement Services Team Leader – Elisha Lieschke. The assessment panel for the tender comprised Senior Engineering Designer – Josh McLinden, Senior Project Engineer – Malcolm France and Engineering Designer – Thomas Staats.

Conformity Check

A conformity assessment was undertaken to ensure all submissions received were in accordance with the contract documentation and specification.

Company	Pricing Details	Supporting Information	WHS Documentation	Comment
Cartwright Civil Contracting Pty Ltd	✓	✓	✓	Conforming submission
Longford Civil Pty Ltd	✓	✓	✓	Conforming submission
Civil and Civic Group Pty Ltd	✓	✓	✓	Conforming submission
BR Durham Sons Pty Ltd	x	x	x	Non-conforming

As indicated above, Cartwright Civil Contracting Pty Ltd, Longford Civil Pty Ltd and Civil and Civic Group Pty Ltd's submissions were assessed as conforming tenders. BR Durham Sons Pty Ltd submitted only a sales flyer in lieu of any required tender information, and therefore were deemed non-conforming. As such, no further assessment of BR Durham Sons Pty Ltd's submission was made.

The remaining companies are WHS registered with Council.

Qualitative Assessment

A qualitative assessment considered a range of issues including:

- past performance – including referee checks, relevant experience, and expertise in performing same or similar projects;
- methodology and program – project work methods, management and proposed program;
- capacity – current and future commitments and workload;
- capability – including availability of resources, equipment, and contract management capabilities; and
- benefit to local region – social and community benefit to the Albury/Wodonga region.

Company	Past Performance (25%)	Methodology & Program (30%)	Capacity (20%)	Capability (15%)	Local Benefit (10%)	Total (100%)
Cartwright Civil Contracting Pty Ltd	20	24	16	12	8	80
Longford Civil Pty Ltd	20	24	16	12	8	80
Civil and Civic Group Pty Ltd	15	18	12	9	2	56

Cartwright Civil Contracting Pty Ltd is a locally based company which has undertaken a number of similar projects in Victoria and NSW. Recently the company has completed a number of subdivisions including Farm 11 – Stages 1 & 2, Griffith, Hillford Estate Stage 1, Thurgoona, Riverina Grove Stages 1-5, Griffith, 47 Table Top Road, Thurgoona, Illuka Estate Stage 3, Thurgoona and Yarrabee Estate Stage 3 & 4, Thurgoona.

Cartwright Civil Contracting Pty Ltd currently has five projects in hand including Hillford Estate Stages 3 & 4 (expected to be completed in October 2021), Hillford Estate Froglet ponds (expected to be completed in May 2021), Farm 11 – Stages 3, 4 & 5, Griffith (expected to be completed in May 2021), Lot 9 Ruby Court, Albury (expected to be completed in June 2021) and Supply of DGB to Cummings Road, Culcairn (expected to be completed in May 2021).

A financial assessment of the capacity of Cartwright Civil Contracting Pty Ltd to undertake the project was conducted which indicated that they are in a good financial position to satisfactorily complete the project.

Referee information indicated the company are very professional, complete projects to a high standard within the allocated timeframes, and manage their subcontractors effectively. The company is co-operative and has been involved in a number of projects throughout the region.

Overall Cartwright Civil Contracting Pty Ltd's standard of works and procedures have met the requirements for AlburyCity on similar projects, the most recent being Racecourse Road Stage 2 in December 2016.

The company has submitted a detailed, logical, and extensive methodology which highlighted how they plan to deal with a number of key site issues, including traffic control. The works program included in the submission gave a clear timeline of works and indicated a contract period of 16 weeks in line with Council's estimate.

Cartwright Civil Contracting Pty Ltd is locally based and has stated that if successful, 100% of the labour, plant, and materials for this project will be sourced locally. The company has indicated that they are current sponsors of a local sporting group.

Longford Civil Pty Ltd is a locally based company from Howlong, NSW, and they have undertaken a number of projects throughout Albury, Wodonga and the local region. Recently the company has completed a number of projects including Sladen Street in Henty which included reconstruction of Sladen Streetscape and drainage upgrade, Kywong-Howlong Road Stage 1 road and drainage reconstruction which included 2km of road reconstruction under live traffic conditions, including drainage and shoulder works, and Kywong-Howlong Road Stage 2 which included a further 4km of road and drainage reconstruction including associated drainage and concrete and shoulder works under live traffic conditions.

Their current work commitments include design and construction of Beechworth Trunk Sewer & Pump Station for North East Water (design and documentation stage, construction to commence late 2022), Four Mile Road Subdivision Benalla – 26 lots (expected to be completed in May 2021), a subdivision in Mulwala (expected to be completed in May 2021) and Inglis Road Benalla 13 lot subdivision (expected to be completed in May 2021).

A financial assessment of the capacity of Longford Civil Pty Ltd to undertake the project was conducted which indicated that they are in a good financial position to satisfactorily complete the project.

Referee information indicated that Longford Civil Pty Ltd typically manage their time, subcontractors, and resources well and are co-operative to work with. Referees also advised that they would happily employ Longford Civil Pty Ltd to work again on future projects, and that Longford Civil Pty Ltd's projects were completed on time and to a high standard.

Longford Civil Pty Ltd has previously undertaken work for AlburyCity completing the Ettamogah Sewerage Augmentation in 2020, Kerr Road Watermain in 2019 and Table Top Road Watermain in 2018; works were completed on time and to an adequate standard. Longford Civil Pty Ltd has not previously undertaken a road construction project for AlburyCity.

The proposed works program indicates a 15-week construction period which is reasonable for a road reconstruction project of this scale. The supplied methodology provides good detail around all major aspects of the construction project including environmental considerations and traffic control.

All staff and subcontractors employed are locally based, with 100% of materials to be sourced locally. The company provides sponsorship to a local sporting group.

Civil and Civic Group Pty Ltd is a construction group based in Canberra, ACT and has undertaken a number of projects throughout the ACT. Recently the company has completed a number of projects including Shoreline Residential Precinct for Nova Builder along the waterfront of Lake Tuggeranong, ACT, Kova Development for Stycon Consultants, Andriolo Industrial Estate for Bob Andriolo and works on the Birch Building ANU for O'Neill & Brown Plumbing group.

Civil and Civic Group Pty Ltd's current work commitments include Kambah BMX track – earthworks, road and track construction in Canberra (expected to be completed in 2023), Williamsdale remediation earthworks and road construction, Canberra (expected to be completed in 2023), Aranda bulk and detailed excavation, sediment control, temporary access road construction, supply and compact material, Armada ACT, (expected to be completed in July 2021).

Civil and Civic Group Pty Ltd is a relatively young company that could only provide limited financial records to facilitate the required financial assessment. Based on the available information, the company could present as a financial risk for Council with regard to the delivery of this project.

Council could not satisfactorily assess if Civil and Civic Group Pty Ltd were in an acceptable financial position to undertake the works, and Council notes that they recently underwent a company restructure. The company is however currently signed up under a civil works panel contract with Local Government Procurement.

Referee information indicated that Civil and Civic Group Pty Ltd were punctual and managed their time well, managed subcontractors and resources well and were co-operative to work with. They also advised that Civil and Civic Group Pty Ltd were happy to fix defects and were best managed when regular weekly meetings occurred to keep works on track. Works were reportedly completed on time and to an adequate standard.

The proposed works program indicates a 22-week construction period which is longer than expected for a project of this scale. The supplied methodology is satisfactory, providing some detail around

major aspects of the construction project including traffic control and maintaining traffic flows along Centaur Road. The company also provided a WHS plan as part of their submission.

From the information provided, all companies demonstrated the required management systems, experience, construction plant, resources, and availability to provide AlburyCity with a quality product.

Quantitative Assessment (100%)

The lump sum tender prices and ratings relative to the lowest price are tabulated below.

Company	Estimated Contract Value (including GST)	Rating (100)
Longford Civil Pty Ltd	$ 1,242,454.91	100
Cartwright Civil Contracting Pty Ltd	$ 1,924,493.74	65
Civil and Civic Corporation Pty Ltd	$ 2,372,026.25	52

The budget allocation for the project is $2.31M including GST, with two tender submissions being within the allocated budget.

As detailed above, the submission from Longford Civil Pty Ltd was the most favourable from a cost perspective, being $682K (55%) more favourable than Cartwright Civil Contracting Pty Ltd and $1.13M (91%) more favourable than Civil and Civic Corporation Pty Ltd.

It should be noted that the submission from Longford Civil Pty Ltd was significantly cheaper than both Council's estimate and the other tender submissions. Clarification was sought from the tenderer for any potential errors or omissions within the pricing in their submission. The tenderer subsequently reviewed their submission and confirmed the price to be correct and inclusive of all items listed in the contract and consistent with their detailed methodology provided.

Risk

- **Business Risk** – Financial risks are possible if latent/unknown construction issues are encountered. Location of existing services, as well as environmental investigations have been undertaken to reduce this risk.
- **Corporate Risk** – This project is located on a high use road within Hamilton Valley and as such, will be visible and may cause disruption to the community. The completion of this project will provide safe travel for vehicles accessing the commercial and industrial areas, and pedestrians and horses using the shared path to access the Nail Can Hill Reserve area. Residents of Centaur Road and surrounds will be provided with a safer road and improved amenity, and this is part of Council's ongoing commitment to efficiently and effectively managing community assets. The risk area is considered low.
- **WHS and Public Risk** – WHS risks due to the construction works will be controlled in accordance with AlburyCity procedures. The contractor will be WHS registered with AlburyCity and will be required to implement relevant Safe Work Method Statements and undergo safety

inspections. The contractor will implement Traffic Control Management Plans to provide a safe environment for the worksite and the community.

- **Environmental Risk** – A Review of Environmental Factors has been undertaken for these works to identify any risks and suitable measures to mitigate them. The risks identified were considered low despite the presence of endangered species being present in the greater locality. Sediment and erosion control practices will be implemented to reduce these risks.
- **Delivery Program Risk** – Standard risks associated with construction are possible, including delays due to inclement weather and changes due to latent/unknown construction issues. However, the work site is a constructed environment with existing drainage and pavement providing good access, hardstands, and drainage of the site, minimising down time. Site investigations have been undertaken during the design and planning phase, with results indicating the risk to delivery is low.

Community Engagement

This project is located within a busy road corridor that services the Albury Waste Management and Recycling Centre, and the Albury Animal Management Facility, and local residents living in Hamilton Valley.

The project is consistent with various themes within The Community Strategic Plan – Albury 2030, which has undergone extensive community consultation prior to adoption.

The project was subsequently included in the 2020/21 Works Delivery Program, which was endorsed by Council following the essential community consultation including the public exhibition period prior to Council adoption.

The project is included on Council's website (Major Projects section), a letter drop has been prepared to inform local residents of the works, and variable message boards will be utilised on the roadway prior to the commencement of the project to inform Albury Waste Management Centre customers, road users and residents of the imminent commencement of the works.

Summary

The scoring for the qualitative and quantitative assessment is summarised in the following table:

Company	Qualitative	Quantitative
Longford Civil Pty Ltd	80	100
Cartwright Civil Contracting Pty Ltd	80	65
Civil and Civic Corporation Pty Ltd	56	52

From the qualitative assessment, all companies have demonstrated the required management systems, experience, resources, and availability to successfully undertake this project.

From a quantitative perspective the submission from Longford Civil Pty Ltd was assessed as being the most advantageous. The submission was $682K (55%) more favourable than Cartwright Civil Contracting Pty Ltd and $1.13M (91%) more favourable than Civil and Civic Corporation Pty Ltd.

As noted earlier, the price submitted by Longford Civil Pty Ltd was significantly cheaper than the Council estimate with clarification on the pricing sought from the tenderer and deemed appropriate. Further, an assessment of the financial capacity of Longford Civil Pty Ltd to undertake this contract was undertaken and indicate positively their ability to do so.

Therefore, based on the qualitative and quantitative assessments, it is deemed that the submission from Longford Civil Pty Ltd provides the best value for Council to deliver this project.

Conclusion

Council invited tenders for Contract No. 20/02903 – Reconstruction of Centaur Road, Overend Street to Mudge Street, and received four submissions, with one deemed non-conforming and not further considered.

Centaur Road, between Overend Street and Mudge Street, is in poor condition and requires a full road reconstruction. It also forms critical infrastructure that services the Albury Waste Management Centre, Recycling Centre, Albury Animal Management Facility, and residents of Hamilton Valley and is the only access road to these locations.

The scope of works in this contract includes complete reconstruction of the existing road, including construction of new kerb and gutter, drainage, optic fibre conduit, water supply main, creek improvement works, box culvert and pipe culvert extensions, concrete driveways, shared path and a pedestrian crossing.

A quantitative and qualitative assessment indicated that Longford Civil Pty Ltd was the most favourable submission. Their tendered price of $1,242,454.91 including GST is within the budget allocation of $2.31M including GST.

Recommendation

That Council accepts the tender from Longford Civil Pty Ltd for Contract No. 20/02903 – Centaur Road Reconstruction, Overend Street to Mudge Street, for the lump sum amount of $1,242,454.91 (including GST).

Attachments

1. Location Plan – Centaur Road Reconstruction – Locality Plan (DOC21/97083).