

CM13.5. Provision of Security Patrol Services Contract No. 21/01030

DATE	14 October 2021	FIL REFERENCE	FIL21/01030-02
CONFIDENTIAL	No		
FURTHER ENQUIRIES	Steven Millett Assets, Sustainability & Environment	PHONE	6023 8111
AUTHOR	Richard Boucher		

Purpose of Report

To recommend a preferred contractor for the provision of Security Patrol Services to AlburyCity, through a qualitative and quantitative assessment.

Background

The intent of the contract is to establish a preferred supplier arrangement for the delivery of security services comprising nightly security patrols of 70 Council properties and facilities including community centres, libraries, offices, depots, and other amenities.

The scope of the contract comprises the following core requirements:

- Nightly Patrol Services at sites.
- Providing a rapid response service to Personal and Duress Alarms/calls.
- Removing/Replacing Bollards in AMP lane.
- Ensuring identified Public Toilets are checked and locked at dusk.
- Providing a Static Guard service as required.
- Provide co-ordinated attendances in conjunction with AlburyCity staff members in response to other security incidents.
- Report damage and issues at any facility to Albury City as soon as possible.

These services are to be provided on a 24/7 basis, inclusive of all weekends and public holidays.

The tender is considered an essential service for the safety and security of Council staff and the community, as well as asset protection.

Tenders were invited for the supply of Security Patrol Services for a two-year term (plus optional one year extension) commencing 1 December 2021, on a fixed price basis and with provision for rise and fall in line with CPI.

Tenders were in the format of a schedule of rates with daily service frequencies for routine attendance works, with provision for hourly rates for additional planned attendances, unplanned attendances, and static guard services.

The scope of works is based upon the current contract's security requirements with a review undertaken by experienced staff managing the existing contract in consultation with coordinators and Council staff at the sites included within this contract.

Following a review of security requirements at Council facilities and the addition of new buildings the contract now includes increased and additional services at the following sites:

- Albury Botanic Gardens;
- Glenmorous Gardens;
- Pioneer Cemetery;
- Volt Lane car park;
- Wilson Street car park;
- Airport car park;
- Kiewa Street car park;
- Animal Management Centre;
- Bunton Park public toilets and sports amenities;
- JC King Park public toilet and sports amenities;
- Murrayfield public toilets and sports amenities;
- Waites Park public toilets and sports amenities;
- Albury Waste Management Centre (new buildings);
- Lavington Sports Ground, and outbuildings; and
- Community Wood Fired Ovens at Hovell Tree Park.

The scope of works has been reviewed to include specific requirements on the provision of rapid response to duress alarm activation. There are also additional requirements for recording and reporting of patrol movements and activities to ensure critical timeframes and attendances are adhered to, and to further allow AlburyCity to respond to incidents and vandalism in a timely manner.

A two-year contract term, plus an optional one-year extension along with the above inclusions, provides surety of service, economy of scale and minimises AlburyCity's exposure to unpredictable price rises.

Tenders were invited for Contract No. 21/01030 – Security Patrol Services, and advertised in the Border Mail on 24 July 2021, Sydney Morning Herald on 27 July 2021, and on Tenderlink on 26 July 2021. Tenders closed at 12 noon on Tuesday 17 August 2021.

Tender Assessment

At the close of tenders, submissions were received from the following five companies:

1. Backup Security Pty Ltd (North Albury, NSW);
2. ECS International Security (Parramatta, NSW);
3. Jeff Clarke Security Pty Ltd (Wodonga, VIC);
4. Partisan Protective Services (Seven Hills, NSW); and
5. Paynter Security Pty Ltd (Lavington, NSW).

All tenders were evaluated in accordance with Council's Procurement Policy and Guidelines. The assessment panel for the tender comprised Team Leader Property & Buildings, Richard Boucher; Acting Building Services Coordinator, Craig Dainer; Assistant Building Services Coordinator, David Elliot; Building Administration Support Officer, Catherine Trinnick; and Team Leader Procurement Services, Elisha Lieschke as a non-scoring observer.

Conformity Check

A conformity assessment was undertaken to ensure all submissions received were in accordance with the contract documentation and specification issued by AlburyCity.

Company	Pricing Details	Supporting Information	WHS Documentation	Comment
Backup Security Pty Ltd	Yes	Yes	Yes	Conforming
ECS International Security	Yes	Yes	Yes	Conforming
Jeff Clarke Security Pty Ltd	Yes	Yes	Yes	Conforming
Partisan Protective Services	Yes	Proposed Amendments	Yes	Partially Conforming
Paynter Security Pty Ltd	Yes	Yes	Yes	Conforming

As indicated above, four submissions were assessed as conforming tenders, one indicated proposed variations to Council's standard contract requirements. The assessment panel determined that legal advice would be required to the proposed contract changes requested by Partisan Protective Services should it be identified as the preferred contractor.

All five companies provided the necessary WHS documentation to be successfully registered with Council.

Quantitative Assessment (100%)

The lump sum tender prices and ratings relative to the lowest price are tabulated below.

Company	Estimated Contract Value (including GST) for 2 Years Term	Rating (100)
Jeff Clarke Security Pty Ltd	\$446,823.68	100
Backup Security Pty Ltd	\$474,090.76	94
Partisan Protective Services	\$660,442.98	68
Paynter Security Pty Ltd	\$1,120,199.08	40
ECS International Security	\$1,183,512.00	38

The budget allocation for the project, based on historical costs of this contract, for a two-year term is \$334K including GST. No submissions received were within the budget allocation.

This budget allocation is based on current and historical costs of the current contract established in 2018. Only one tender fell within that budget allocation. The remaining submissions received at the time more closely aligned with pricing received in this instance. The average of submissions received for the current contract in 2018 were 89% higher than the lowest submission received.

The scope of security patrol works as advertised now in 2021, whilst at its core is unchanged from that of 2018, has been presented in a more detailed format, to account for misunderstandings of requirements experienced during the operations of the 2018 contract. As detailed above, numerous additional sites have been included, and some sites now have additional or amended requirements captured in the tendered scope of works. Due to this, an increase in costs was expected for this contract.

As detailed above, the submission from Jeff Clarke Security Pty Ltd was the most favourable from a cost perspective, being \$27K less than Backup Security Pty Ltd, \$213K more favourable than Partisan Protective Services, and \$673K cheaper than the other submissions. Based upon the initial quantitative differences in the tender submissions received from Paynter Security Pty Ltd and ECS International Security, the assessment panel determined not to consider these submissions further.

Based on the quantitative assessment, tender submissions from the following three companies (shown in alphabetical order) were shortlisted and subject to further consideration in this report.

- Backup Security Pty Ltd.
- Jeff Clarke Security Pty Ltd.
- Partisan Protective Services.

Qualitative Assessment

A qualitative assessment considered a range of issues including:

- Past Performance – including referee checks, relevant experience, and expertise in performing same or similar projects.
- Methodology and Program – project methodology and proposed program.
- Capacity – current and future commitments and workload.
- Capability – including availability of resources, equipment, and contract management capabilities.
- Benefit to Local Region – social and community benefit to the Albury/Wodonga region.

Company	Past Performance (20%)	Methodology & Program (20%)	Capacity (25%)	Capability (25%)	Local Benefit (10%)	Total (100%)
Backup Security Pty Ltd	15	16	15	20	8	74
Jeff Clarke Security Pty Ltd	13	11	16	14	9	63
Partisan Protective Services	11	12	15	15	5	58

Backup Security Pty Ltd is a locally based company and has, or is currently servicing, several similar contracts with other local authorities in the region including:

- Patrols, Alarm Responses, and Static Guard services to Alpine Shire Council; and
- Static Guard Services and on-site CCTV monitoring for Rural City of Wangaratta.

In addition to the above, the contractor has ongoing work commitments in the local area including:

- Concierge Security Services, Crowd Control Services, Patrol Services and Alarm responses for SS&A Club Albury.
- Patrol Services and Alarm Responses for Properties NSW premises in Albury as subcontractors through JLL Pty Ltd.
- Patrol Services, Cash in Transit services and Alarm Responses for IGA supermarkets East Albury and Springdale Heights.
- Patrols, Alarm Responses and ad hoc Static Guard services for Albury Wodonga Aboriginal Health Service.
- Crowd Control and Static Guard services at Mulwala Water Ski Club.
- Alarm Responses and Static Guard services to Department of Education and Training – Victoria, as subcontractors through Wilsons Security.

Referee information indicated that Backup Security Pty Ltd perform strongly and all referees scored well in all areas in response to this. No issues were reported regarding response times to works, WHS management, or Environmental preservation matters. Comments received reported high satisfaction levels with resource allocation, communication, cooperation, and note they are open and pro-active, work hard to upskill their staff, and all referees rate highly for overall satisfaction with this contractor.

Parent company, Jaclak Pty Ltd, and local subsidiary Border Security are long term service providers to AlburyCity and are operated by the same General Manager as Backup Security Pty Ltd. Border Security perform Service & Maintenance of our Security Systems, Access Control Systems & CCTV Systems. Our past dealings are consistent with the findings of reference checks above.

Backup Security has provided substantial WHS and operations systems, is ISO accredited, and has a substantial and qualified management structure. They have provided clear and detailed Nightly Patrol Data and make use of UniGuardX software for monitoring and reporting of operations with automatic

distribution of management reports. Backup Security Pty Ltd also utilises in vehicle GPS tracking via a hardwired dash camera as a secondary form of electronic data collection for internal auditing.

They have proposed excellent response times and excellent KPIs specific to this contract's operation, and report they intend to utilise the UniGuardX software and mobile app suite, as well as patrol data sheets and GPS vehicle tracking to complete the patrol service to monitor and achieve these.

A longstanding local company, Backup Security Pty Ltd source their staff locally, engage with other local companies to assist to train their staff, and support a variety of local organisations, including giving youth work experience.

Jeff Clarke Security Pty Ltd is a locally based company and is currently undertaking numerous similar projects throughout our local area.

Their current ongoing work commitments include:

- Patrol Services, Alarm Responses, Cash in Transit & Locking of Public Toilets for Wodonga City Council, until 2025.
- Patrol Services, Alarm Responses, Cash in Transit & Guarding for Hume Bank.
- Patrol Services, Alarm Responses, Cash in Transit & Guarding for Commercial Club.
- Services for Security 1 Solutions.
- Services for Wilson Security.

Referees indicated that Jeff Clarke Security Pty Ltd perform strongly and all referees scored well in all areas in response to this. Referees report that response times are generally very good and staff levels are maintained with low staff turnover. No issues were reported regarding WHS management or Environmental preservation matters. Comments received reported high satisfaction levels with communication and cooperation with this contractor, Referees noted that reporting systems are paper based, and one commented they "would like to see them take next step to digital age".

All referees rate highly for overall satisfaction with this contractor.

Jeff Clarke Security Pty Ltd are incumbent providers to this contract and have delivered these services to AlburyCity since 2013. Historically they have provided good service to AlburyCity overall, maintaining a good co-operative relationship between key stakeholders, with adequate response times and reporting. More recently, the past 12 months of this contract has experienced a decline in resourcing, responsiveness, and reliability of operations. This has resulted in the need for increased contract management by AlburyCity and utilisation of other providers to ensure key milestones are maintained.

The company has provided documented Safe Work systems, workflow processes, and have advised they have developed and maintained processes to deliver the advertised scope of works. They have indicated they make use of documented nightly run sheets, and Uniguard checkpoint tracking systems. However, little information detailing the implementation of these systems was offered. Operational staff proposed for this contract are reported to maintain relevant qualifications and are very well experienced in the Security Industry. Jeff Clarke Security Pty Ltd reported the least

favourable response time of all assessed submissions and did not provide any Key Performance Indicators that would be applicable to the operations of this contract.

A longstanding local company, Jeff Clarke Security Pty Ltd source all their staff locally, and source all other resources locally where possible. They have indicated this contract would result in the employment of additional staff from the local area to fulfil contractual obligations. They have a history of supporting local sporting groups and indicate they support other community organisations by way of reduced or fee free security services to these organisations.

Partisan Protective Services is based in Seven Hills NSW, and do not report any current projects in our local area.

Their current ongoing commitments include:

- Mobile Patrol Services for various sites – Sydney Metro, as subcontractors through Ultimate Security.
- Mobile Patrol and Static Guard Services, NSW wide for City Guard.
- Static Guards and Mobile Patrol response for Meriton Property Services.
- Installation of CCTV and alarm systems, Patrol response and guard services for Liberty Oil.

Referees indicated that Partisan Protective Services perform strongly, and all referees scored well in all areas of performance. Referees report that they maintain fast response times and where possible will respond to issues at no cost. No issues were reported regarding staffing and resource allocation, worksite safety, or environmental matters. Referees report they are diligent in their communications and make use of a combination of electronic and paper-based systems.

Partisan Protective Services have provided a detailed, and comprehensive contract management plan. They have provided detailed WHS and operations systems, are ISO accredited, and have qualified and structured management. They have provided documented policies, procedures, and transition plans. No allocation of operational staff for this contract has been proposed at this stage. They report to make use of QR Patrol monitoring and reporting software, automatically generating reports including time and location of incident. Minimal KPIs have been proposed by this contractor applicable to the operation of this contract.

Partisan Protective Services is based in Seven Hills NSW and do not currently have a local presence. They propose to commit to local staffing and procurement. They have indicated they may provide support to the local community via sporting and community groups however limited information was offered in this regard.

From the information provided, all companies demonstrate the minimum required management systems, experience, resources, and availability to provide AlburyCity with these services. Backup Security have demonstrated they are better placed with their capability to deliver these works and have provided a superior methodology of operations, monitoring, and reporting of operations including planned redundancy measures and systems. Their submission indicates they make better use of technology, resulting in improved reporting timeframes and accuracy of reporting. The receipt of timely and accurate reporting is critical to Council operations to ensure fast response times can be

maintained internally to incidents and vandalism. They have indicated they will deliver superior response times to incidents than other submissions and provide the most applicable and comprehensive KPIs to monitor and achieve these results.

Risk

- **Business Risk** – Business risk resulting from this contract will be lessened due to the increased security presence at locations historically exposed to elevated levels of vandalism, often at significant financial outlay to rectify. The operation of this contract complements Council operations.
- **Corporate Risk** – Corporate Risk resulting from this contract will be lessened due to the improved public image from a maintained and increased security presence. The operation of this contract reduces the risk of fines or litigation or interruption to the delivery of Council services.
- **WHS and Public Risk** – This contract aligns with the Albury 2030 theme that we are a caring community when it comes to the Health & Safety of Our People. It will serve to maintain and improve Community Safety Indicators and, by way of reducing impact on facilities of vandalism, will serve to maintain accessibility of a diverse range of facilities to our community. The operation of this contract will lessen WHS risks by preventing incidents and providing improved support to our people. This contract will be operated and controlled in accordance with AlburyCity procedures. The contractor will be WHS registered by AlburyCity and will be required to implement relevant Safe Work Method Statements and safety inspections.
- **Environmental Risk** – Environmental risks for the operation of this contract are deemed to be negligible, with contract operation to be conducted in line with AlburyCity policies. Where environmental risks are identified in the operation of this contract, procedures will be followed to ensure appropriate reporting is completed in a timely manner.
- **Delivery Program Risk** – Transitional risks of this contract shall be minimised by way of pre planning and setup of access and security control and monitoring of buildings and sites. Preplanning of communications and planned announcements with key stakeholders both internal and external will be undertaken.

Community Engagement

The delivery of this contract serves numerous key points of the Albury 2030 strategy. By reducing vandalism, and maintaining safe, secure facilities and assets, we are better placed to improve visitor and residents' experiences, promote Albury for industry and business and ensure Albury's infrastructure and assets are well maintained and managed. It assists us to achieve our goals to continuously improve Albury's key community safety indicators, the health and well-being of our community, and ensures we can continue to provide a diverse and accessible range of facilities to our community.

COVID-19 and Community Safety

Due to the nature of the tendered scope of works, contact with AlburyCity employees along with members of the public, is minimal. All tenderers have proposed staffing and procurement from our local area, with Backup Security Pty Ltd and Jeff Clarke Security Pty Ltd operating the contract from

local offices. In line with AlburyCity COVID-19 safety measures, all contractors are required to meet the COVID-19 vaccination requirements of the NSW Public Health (COVID-19 General) Order 2021.

Summary

The scoring for the qualitative and quantitative assessment of the shortlisted tenders is summarised in the following table:

Company	Quantitative (100%)	Qualitative (100%)
Backup Security Pty Ltd	94	74
Jeff Clarke Security Pty Ltd	100	63
Partisan Protective Services	68	58

Jeff Clarke Security Pty Ltd provided the most price competitive tender, being \$27K cheaper than Backup Security Pty Ltd over two years, and \$213K less than Partisan Protective Services.

The qualitative assessments for the three shortlisted tenders identified that Backup Security Pty Ltd was assessed as being the most advantageous, the submission assessed as providing superior outcomes in the use of technology and offering prompt response times.

Although the offer from Backup Security Pty Ltd was 6% more expensive than Jeff Clarke Security Pty Ltd, they were assessed as providing a superior service offer. Based on the qualitative and quantitative assessments, it is assessed that the submission from Backup Security Pty Ltd provides the best value for Council to deliver this project.

Conclusion

Council invited tenders for provision of security patrol services to AlburyCity and received five submissions. Tenders were in the format of a schedule of rates with daily service frequencies for routine attendance works, with provision for hourly rates for additional planned attendances, unplanned attendances, and static guard services.

The scope of works includes increased and additional requirements of service at numerous sites in response to security issues experienced in recent years. It also includes numerous new sites having previously had no formal contracted arrangements in place for security patrol services.

The scope of works now includes increased requirements on the provision of response to Duress alarm activation and additional requirements for recording and reporting of operations of the contract.

Of the three shortlisted submissions, the quantitative and qualitative assessment indicated that Backup Security Pty Ltd was the most favourable submission having a tendered price of \$474,090.76 including GST, for the two years term of this contract.

Recommendation

That Council accepts the tender from Backup Security Pty Ltd for the Schedule of Rates Contract No 21/01030 for provision of Security Patrol Services to AlburyCity for a two-year period commencing 1 December 2021, for the contract value of \$474,090.76 including GST.