CM13.6. Centaur Road Car Park Contract No. 20/01282

DATE	15 April 2020	**FIL REFERENCE**	FIL20/01282-02
CONFIDENTIAL	No		
FURTHER ENQUIRIES	Andrew Lawson City Projects	**PHONE**	6023 8111
AUTHOR	Anthony Bisignano		

Purpose of Report

To recommend a preferred contractor for the construction of Lavington Sports Ground Redevelopment Centaur Road Car Park, through a qualitative and quantitative assessment.

Background

The Lavington Sports Ground (LSG) was purchased from the Panthers Group in 2009. Following its purchase, a number of upgrades and refurbishments were considered which led to the development of concept plans for the facility. Council has continued to invest in the facility since 2009 including the purchase of the 4.6ha of land to the east for the recently completed multi-purpose playing field.

Council identified the LSG redevelopment as a priority project for the city, allocating funding accordingly and seeking matching external funds, whilst also endorsing a master plan for the site in April 2016.

The LSG redevelopment commenced in mid-2016 after Council received $4.025M from the Federal Government through the National Stronger Regions Funding. In 2018 AlburyCity was successful in receiving a further $3.153M through the NSW Government's Regional Sporting Infrastructure Fund for Stage 3 of the redevelopment.

Stage 3 of the redevelopment includes part of the grandstand upgrades currently under construction, along with a range of other smaller projects around the precinct enabling the full realisation of the LSG Master Plan. One of these projects is the Centaur Road Car Park (i.e. the car park off Centaur Road adjacent to the new multi-purpose playing field).

The car park design includes an asphalt pavement providing 21 on-street parking spaces and 102 off-street parking spaces, including four disabled off-street parking spaces. There will be a concrete footpath and staircase linking the new car park to the facilities currently being constructed adjacent to the multi-purpose playing field. In addition, a concrete driveway will link the car park to these new facilities providing access for maintenance personnel/emergency vehicles. Soft landscaping improvements will be made to the car park islands and surrounds to enhance the local landscape, with Council to plant out these areas with saplings and shrubs (which have already been procured) when the planting season is appropriate.

As indicated above, the scope of the works included in this contract is summarised below:

- relocation of 150m of watermain;
- 830m concrete kerbing;
- 1,200m^3 of bulk earthworks;
- 2,750m^2 of asphaltic pavement;
- 250m^2 of concrete pavement;
- 1031m^2 of concrete footpath;
- installation of 25 light poles with associated civil works;
- associated signage and line-marking; and
- soft landscaping including retaining walls.

Tenders were invited for Contract No. 20/01282 – Lavington Sports Ground Redevelopment Centaur Road Car Park, and advertised in the Border Mail, Sydney Morning Herald and on Tenderlink. Tenders closed at 12 noon on Tuesday 17 March 2020.

The contract duration is estimated at 15 weeks and will be completed in the 2020/21 financial year.

Council's budget allocation for the project is $979K including GST, with $220K allocated in the current year and $759K allocated in the proposed 2020/2021 Delivery Program. This budget allocation is inclusive of Project Management and all associated works in the delivery of the project. This allocation is part of Council's $3.5M commitment for the redevelopment, used in securing the $3.153M in funding through the NSW Government's Regional Sporting Infrastructure Fund for Stage 3 of the redevelopment.

A location plan is included as attachment 1 for information.

Tender Assessment

At the close of tenders, submissions were received from the following companies:

- AP Delaney & Co Pty Ltd (Albury, NSW);
- Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd (Wodonga, VIC);
- Hurst Earthmoving Pty Ltd (Albury, NSW); and
- Mitchell Constructions (NSW) Pty Ltd (Albury, NSW).

All tenders were evaluated in accordance with Council's Procurement Policy and Guidelines. The assessment panel for the tender comprised Interim Team Leader Project Delivery - Anthony Bisignano, Team Leader Leisure Facilities – Michael Stanton, Engineering Designer – Thomas Staats and Acting Procurement & Contract Management Coordinator – Pat Maling.

Conformity Check

A conformity assessment was undertaken to ensure all submissions received were in accordance with the contract documentation and specification.

Company	Pricing Details	Supporting Information	WHS Documentation	Comment
AP Delaney & Co Pty Ltd	Yes	Yes	Yes	Conforming
Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd	Yes	Yes	Yes	Conforming
Hurst Earthmoving Pty Ltd	Yes	Yes	Yes	Conforming
Mitchell Constructions (NSW) Pty Ltd	Yes	Yes	Yes	Conforming

As indicated above, all submissions were assessed as conforming tenders, and all companies are WHS registered with Council.

Qualitative Assessment

A qualitative assessment considered a range of issues including:

- Past performance – including referee checks, relevant experience and expertise in performing same or similar projects;
- Methodology and program – project methodology and proposed program;
- Capacity – current and future commitments and workload;
- Capability – including availability of resources, equipment and contract management capabilities; and
- Benefit to local region – social and community benefit to the Albury/Wodonga region.

Company	Past Performance (35%)	Methodology & Program (25%)	Capacity (20%)	Capability (10%)	Local Benefit (10%)	Total (100%)
AP Delaney & Co Pty Ltd	28	15	16	8	8	75
Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd	28	15	12	8	8	71
Mitchell Constructions (NSW) Pty Ltd	28	15	12	8	8	71
Hurst Earthmoving Pty Ltd	21	15	16	8	8	68

AP Delaney & Co Pty Ltd is a locally based company and has undertaken a number of similar contracts with private clients across the $1.5M to $3.2M range.

Their current commitments include the Monument Hill Redevelopment for AlburyCity (expected to be completed in April), the Ettamogah Rail Hub Siding Extension (expected to be completed in August 2020), Brooklyn Fields Stage 2 (expected to be completed in July 2020), Howlong Industrial Estate (expected to be completed in June 2020) and the Central Place Townhouses (expected to be completed in April 2020).

Referee information indicated the company completed projects to a very high standard and typically completed projects within the allocated time frames. The company is quick to respond to scope changes and is very professional in operations.

Council has experience dealing with AP Delaney & Co Pty Ltd with some of our recent road reconstruction projects. Most notably, the Travel Stop Way Roundabout. These engagements have been positive with a high level of service and quality product delivered.

AP Delaney & Co Pty Ltd's construction methodology seems reasonable and is correctly reflected in their program which is 10 weeks in duration.

AP Delaney & Co Pty Ltd's has indicated that should they be awarded this tender, a majority of the materials, plant and labour will be sourced from the local region. The company has also listed a number of local community groups, sporting groups and fundraising events which they sponsor.

Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd is a locally based company and has undertaken a number of similar contracts with many local government bodies and private clients across the $300K to $4.6M range.

Their current work commitments include Wagga Road Beautification Stage 2 (expected to be completed in May), Kerr Road Reconstruction Stage 6 (still yet to commence), Thurgoona Drive/Elizabeth Mitchell Drive Intersection (still yet to commence) and the Lavington Sports Ground Pearsall Street Car Park (recently commenced) for AlburyCity, the Wangaratta Rail Precinct (expected to be completed in January 2021) for the Rural City of Wangaratta, and three subdivision projects for private developers (expected to be completed no later than June this year).

Referee information indicated that the company typically completed projects to a high standard on or before the date of practical completion. The company has good coordination procedures and is professional in managing the construction site, suppliers and subcontractors.

Council has extensive experience dealing with Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd with many of our recent road reconstruction projects. Most notably with both Kerr Road Reconstruction and Wagga Road Beautification where they have completed Stages 1 to 5 (inclusive) and Stage 1 respectively. These engagements have been positive with a high level of service and quality product delivered.

Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd's construction methodology seems reasonable and is correctly reflected in their Program which is 10 weeks in duration.

Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd has indicated that should they be awarded this tender, the majority of the materials, plant and labour will be sourced from the local region. They are also a major sponsor of the Wodonga Children's Fair, and sponsor Albury/Wodonga Hockey.

Mitchell Constructions (NSW) Pty Ltd is a locally based company and has undertaken a number of similar contracts mostly with private clients across the $300K to $2.3M range. Notable contracts include the Total Tools Albury Building and Car Park, and the Commercial Club Car Park.

Their current work commitments include the SunRice Container Park (with an undisclosed completion date).

Referee information indicated that the company typically completes projects to a high standard and are easy to deal with.

Council has experience dealing with Mitchell Constructions (NSW) Pty Ltd with some of our recent civil infrastructure projects. The last of which was defect rectification works at the Lavington Sports Ground Redevelopment New Playing Oval. These engagements have been positive with a high level of service and a quality product delivered.

Mitchell Construction (NSW) Pty Ltd's proposed methodology seems reasonable and is correctly reflected in their program of 12 weeks in duration.

Mitchell Construction (NSW) Pty Ltd has indicated that should they be awarded this tender, a majority of the materials, plant and labour will be sourced from the local region. They also sponsor various sporting groups.

Hurst Earthmoving Pty Ltd is a locally based company and has undertaken a number of similar contracts with many local government bodies and private clients across the $165K to $1.5M range.

They currently have one project in hand, the Diamond Drive Subdivision in Thurgoona (expected to be completed in March 2020).

Referee information indicated that the company is well managed and completes projects to a good standard. They are collaborative and friendly to work with and add value for their clients.

Council has experience dealing with Hurst Earthmoving with some of our recent stormwater drainage projects. In particular, the Emma Way and Thompson Street Drainage projects. These engagements have been positive with a high level of service and quality product delivered.

Hurst Earthmoving Pty Ltd's construction methodology seems reasonable and is correctly reflected in their program which is 12 weeks in duration.

Hurst Earthmoving Pty Ltd has indicated that should they be awarded this tender, a majority of the materials, plant and labour will be sourced from the local region. They are a sponsor or the Synergy Training Centre Albury and the Thurgoona Football and Netball Club.

From the information provided, all companies demonstrate the required management systems, experience, construction plant, resources and availability to provide AlburyCity with a quality product.

Quantitative Assessment (100%)

The lump sum tender prices and ratings relative to the lowest price are tabulated below.

Company	**Tendered Price (including GST)**	**Rating (100)**
Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd	$668,465.82	100
Hurst Earthmoving Pty Ltd	$679,843.48	98
Mitchell Constructions (NSW) Pty Ltd	$742,738.70	90
AP Delaney & Co Pty Ltd	$768,350.00	87

The budget allocation for the project is $979K including GST, with all submissions being within the allocated budget.

As indicated earlier in this report, any savings realised in this project against budget will be reallocated to other projects in Stage 3 of the Lavington Sports Ground Redevelopment. So as to maintain Council's $3.5M commitment to the redevelopment.

As detailed above, the submission from Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd was the most favourable from a cost perspective, being $11K (2%) more favourable than Hurst Earthmoving Pty Ltd, and between $74K (11%) and $100K (15%) more favourable than the other submissions.

Risk

- **Business Risk** – Financial risks are possible, most likely associated with latent conditions associated with in-ground conditions different to that than those anticipated. There is a risk that the current Coronavirus (COVID-19) pandemic could see the construction industry deemed non-essential work, and delay the completion of the project. This risk is deemed to be low at this stage.
- **Corporate Risk** – The project is located in the Lavington Sports Ground precinct and as such, will be visible to the public. The completion of this project will provide the formal parking necessary for the new multi-purpose playing field and provide parking necessary for hosting major events. This risk area is considered low.
- **WHS and Public Risk** – WHS risks due to the construction works will be controlled in accordance with AlburyCity procedures. The contractor will be WHS registered with AlburyCity and will be required to implement relevant Safe Work Method Statements and safety inspections.
- **Environmental Risk** – The contractor will be required to submit Environmental Plans, addressing environment controls to be implemented; in particular, erosion and sediment controls, and air quality; and
- **Delivery Program Risk** – The construction program is relatively short in duration, with works anticipated to be completed prior to spring, when utilisation of the Lavington Sports Ground Precinct is anticipated to increase. Hence delivery program risk is considered low.

Community Engagement

There was extensive community consultation carried out during the development of the LSG Master Plan from late 2015 which was then endorsed by Council in April 2016.

Two separate Development Applications for the LSG Redevelopment were submitted and approved in 2016 with this process including the standard advertising and opportunity for community submissions. In addition, there have been modifications to the Development Applications providing further opportunity for community feedback.

Council staff have continued to meet with stakeholders and provided project updates throughout the process.

Summary

The scoring for the qualitative and quantitative assessment is summarised in the following table:

Company	Quantitative	Qualitative
Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd	71	100
Hurst Earthmoving Pty Ltd	68	98
Mitchell Constructions (NSW) Pty Ltd	71	90
AP Delaney & Co Pty Ltd	75	87

From the qualitative assessment, all companies have the required management systems, experience, resources and availability to successfully undertake this project.

From the quantitative assessment Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd were the most favourable being $11K (2%) more favourable than Hurst Earthmoving Pty Ltd, and between $74K (11%) and $100K (15%) more favourable than the other submissions.

Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd have recently been awarded five tenders totalling $11.3M from Council including Kerr Road Reconstruction Stage 6, Wagga Road Beautification Stage 2, Thurgoona Drive/Elizabeth Mitchell Drive Intersection and Lavington Sports Ground Redevelopment Pearsall Street Car Park, with only the Wagga Road Beautification Works substantially progressed to date. Hurst Earthmoving Pty Ltd nominated only one project in hand which is nearing completion.

Therefore, considering the quantum of works that Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd already has at hand and that the submitted price variation between them and the next favourable tenderer is only 2%, Hurst Earthmoving Pty Ltd is deemed better placed from a capacity perspective to undertake the project.

Therefore, based on the qualitative and quantitative assessments, it is deemed that the submission from Hurst Earthmoving Pty Ltd provides the best value for Council to deliver this project.

Conclusion

Council invited tenders for the ‘Lavington Sports Ground Redevelopment Centaur Road Car Park’ and received four submissions, with all submissions being deemed conforming.

In 2018 Albury City Council was successful in receiving a further $3.15M through the NSW Government’s Regional Sporting Infrastructure Fund for Stage 3 of the redevelopment project. Stage 3 of the redevelopment includes part of the grandstand upgrades currently under construction, along with a range of other smaller projects around the precinct enabling the full realisation of the Lavington Sports Ground Master Plan. One of these projects, the Centaur Road Car Park (i.e. the car park off Centaur Road adjacent to the new multi-purpose playing field), was part of Council’s commitment in securing the NSW Government funding.

Specifically, the Centaur Road Car Park will provide 21 on-street parking spaces and 102 off-street parking spaces, including four disabled off-street parking spaces. Concrete footpaths will link the new car park to the facilities currently being constructed adjacent to the multi-purpose playing field, and soft landscaping improvements will be made to the car park islands and surrounds to enhance the local landscape.

The scope of work generally involves the relocation of utility services, bulk earthworks, pavement construction (both asphaltic and concrete), civil works (in retaining wall installation, signage and line-marking), and the installation of lighting infrastructure, and soft landscaping.

A qualitative and quantitative assessment was undertaken and although Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd was the least cost submission, being $11K (2%) more favourable than Hurst Earthmoving Pty Ltd, based on Excell Gray Bruni Pty Ltd's current commitments and Hurst Earthmoving Pty Ltd only currently having one project at hand, the submission from Hurst Earthmoving Pty Ltd was deemed as the most favourable submission. Their tender price of $679,843.48 including GST is within the budget allocation of $979K including GST.

Recommendation

That Council accepts the tender from Hurst Earthmoving Pty Ltd for Contract No. 20/01282 'Lavington Sports Ground Redevelopment Centaur Road Car Park' for the lump sum amount of $679,843.48 including GST.

Attachment

Centaur Road Car Park Locality Plan. (DOC20/54998)